

WHEN THE REHEARSALS STOP: THE REALITY OF MUSIC MAKING AFTER HIGH  
SCHOOL ORCHESTRA

by

JEFFREY SCOTT BISHOP

BS.Ed, Northwest Missouri State University, 1993  
MM, Wichita State University, 1995

AN ABSTRACT OF A DISSERTATION

submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Department of Curriculum and Instruction  
College of Education

KANSAS STATE UNIVERSITY  
Manhattan, Kansas

2015

## **Abstract**

The purpose of this study was to discover the reasons that led high-achieving high school orchestra musicians to discontinue formal participation in collegiate orchestra class. Using narrative analysis, the researcher examined the intrinsic and extrinsic factors that influenced the student's decision to not participate in orchestra. The researcher also sought to understand if and how these former high school musicians continued to make music on their own. Three current university students and their high school orchestra teachers were purposefully selected for the study. Data were collected through email queries, surveys, and personal interviews. Upon completion of the interview, the researcher summarized each interview into a narrative and shared it with the participant via email for member checking. Each participant was asked to provide feedback for the narrative and return it to the researcher.

The researcher used Riessman's (2008) adaptation of William Labov's structural coding to analyze the data. Using Robichaux's (2003) expansion of Labov's coding, the researcher was able to establish a structural analysis of the narrative that reinforced the thematic analysis. The researcher coded each participant's narrative along with that of his or her high school orchestra teacher. Coding was supported by NVivo software. Fact-checking of responses from the initial survey along with answers from the participants' narrative and that of their high school director's narrative allowed for a more robust and reliable narrative analysis. Definitive answers were not be sought or expected, but rather the collection of data led to a greater understanding and illustration of why the research participants chose to end their participation in orchestra rehearsals on the collegiate level.

The participants offered diverse reasons for why they chose not to continue participating in college on the university level. Their reasons are described within six categories of intrinsic and extrinsic factors: (a) persistence; (b) self-concept of musical ability; (c) motivation for music; (d) parental musicianship and support; (e) director influence; and (f) socioeconomic status. Each participant could not name a single, defining factor that led him or her to discontinue participation in orchestra as each of the identified factors weighed differently for each person.

WHEN THE REHEARSALS STOP: THE REALITY OF MUSIC MAKING AFTER HIGH  
SCHOOL ORCHESTRA

by

JEFFREY SCOTT BISHOP

BS.Ed, Northwest Missouri State University, 1993  
MM, Wichita State University, 1995

A DISSERTATION

submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Department of Curriculum and Instruction  
College of Education

KANSAS STATE UNIVERSITY  
Manhattan, Kansas

2015

Approved by:

Major Professor  
Frederick Burrack

# **Copyright**

JEFFREY SCOTT BISHOP

2015

## **Abstract**

The purpose of this study was to discover the reasons that led high-achieving high school orchestra musicians to discontinue formal participation in collegiate orchestra class. Using narrative analysis, the researcher examined the intrinsic and extrinsic factors that influenced the student's decision to not participate in orchestra. The researcher also sought to understand if and how these former high school musicians continued to make music on their own. Three current university students and their high school orchestra teachers were purposefully selected for the study. Data were collected through email queries, surveys, and personal interviews. Upon completion of the interview, the researcher summarized each interview into a narrative and shared it with the participant via email for member checking. Each participant was asked to provide feedback for the narrative and return it to the researcher.

The researcher used Riessman's (2008) adaptation of William Labov's structural coding to analyze the data. Using Robichaux's (2003) expansion of Labov's coding, the researcher was able to establish a structural analysis of the narrative that reinforced the thematic analysis. The researcher coded each participant's narrative along with that of his or her high school orchestra teacher. Coding was supported by NVivo software. Fact-checking of responses from the initial survey along with answers from the participants' narrative and that of their high school director's narrative allowed for a more robust and reliable narrative analysis. Definitive answers were not be sought or expected, but rather the collection of data led to a greater understanding and illustration of why the research participants chose to end their participation in orchestra rehearsals on the collegiate level.

The participants offered diverse reasons for why they chose not to continue participating in college on the university level. Their reasons are described within six categories of intrinsic and extrinsic factors: (a) persistence; (b) self-concept of musical ability; (c) motivation for music; (d) parental musicianship and support; (e) director influence; and (f) socioeconomic status. Each participant could not name a single, defining factor that led him or her to discontinue participation in orchestra as each of the identified factors weighed differently for each person.

## Table of Contents

List of Tables .....	xii
Acknowledgements.....	xv
Dedication.....	xvi
Preface .....	xvii
Chapter 1.....	1
Introduction.....	1
Purpose of the Study .....	4
The Need for the Study .....	4
The Research Questions.....	6
Theoretical Framework.....	7
Chapter 2 - A Review of the Literature .....	9
Introduction.....	9
Intrinsic Factors .....	9
Persistence .....	9
Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	14
Motivation for Music .....	16
Extrinsic Factors .....	20
Parental Musicianship and Support in Music .....	20
Director Influence .....	24
Socioeconomic Status .....	31
Narrative Methods .....	32
Summary.....	34
Chapter 3 - Methodology.....	35
Introduction.....	35
The Pilot Study .....	36
The Participants .....	37
Data Collection .....	38
Data Analysis .....	39

Table 3.1 – Data Analysis and Representation .....	40
Coding Categories.....	41
Table 3.2 – Coding Example from the Current Study .....	42
Validation.....	42
Summary.....	44
Chapter 4 - Participant Narratives .....	45
Bernadette’s Story.....	45
Reflections on Bernadette’s Story .....	50
Mr. Powers’ Story about Bernadette.....	52
Reflections on Mr. Powers’ Story about Bernadette .....	55
Contributing Factors That Led Bernadette To Not Continue In College Orchestra .....	55
Intrinsic Factor - Persistence.....	56
Intrinsic Factor – Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	59
Intrinsic Factor – Motivation for Music.....	63
Extrinsic Factor – Parental Musicianship and Support in Music.....	65
Extrinsic Factor – Director Influence .....	68
Extrinsic Factor – Socioeconomic Status (SES).....	70
Assessing the Factors in Bernadette’s Experiences .....	71
Maria’s Story .....	72
Reflections on Maria’s Story .....	77
Mr. Sanders’ Story about Maria.....	78
Reflections on Mr. Sanders’ Story about Maria .....	82
Contributing Factors That Led Maria To Not Continue In College Orchestra.....	83
Intrinsic Factor - Persistence.....	83
Intrinsic Factor – Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	85
Intrinsic Factor – Motivation for Music.....	90
Extrinsic Factor – Parental Musicianship and Support in Music.....	93
Extrinsic Factor – Director Influence .....	96
Extrinsic Factor – Socioeconomic Status (SES).....	100
Samuel’s Story .....	102
Reflections on Samuel’s Story.....	106

Mr. Burton’s Story About Samuel .....	107
Reflections on Mr. Burton’s Story About Samuel .....	109
Contributing Factors That Led Samuel To Not Continue In College Orchestra .....	110
Intrinsic Factor - Persistence .....	110
Intrinsic Factor – Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	114
Intrinsic Factor – Motivation for Music.....	116
Extrinsic Factor – Parental Musicianship and Support in Music.....	119
Extrinsic Factor – Director Influence .....	121
Extrinsic Factor – Socioeconomic Status (SES).....	127
Chapter 5 - Conclusions and Recommendations .....	129
Summary of the Study .....	129
Conclusions.....	131
The Influence of Persistence on Participants’ Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level.....	132
The Influence of Self-Concept of Musical Ability on Participants’ Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level .....	137
The Influence of Motivation for Music on Participants’ Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level .....	143
The Influence of Parental Musicianship and Support on Participants’ Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level.....	148
The Influence of the High School Orchestra Director on Participants’ Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level.....	154
The Influence of Socioeconomic Status (SES) on Participants’ Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level .....	156
The Reality of Music Making After High School .....	159
Recommendations for Further Research.....	160
Works Cited .....	161
Appendix A – The Pilot Study Materials .....	167
Appendix B – The NEKSMEA Email Inquiry .....	170
Appendix C – Participant Introductory Email Survey .....	171
Appendix D – Interview #1 Questions (Open-Ended Questions) .....	173



Appendix E – Director Interview Questions .....	176
Appendix F – Narrative Analyses.....	179
Narrative Analysis 4.1: Bernadette’s View of Persistence .....	179
Narrative Analysis 4.2: Mr. Powers’ View of Persistence .....	180
Narrative Analysis 4.3: Bernadette’s View of Persistence .....	181
Narrative Analysis 4.4: Bernadette’s View of Persistence .....	182
Narrative Analysis 4.5: Bernadette’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	183
Narrative Analysis 4.6: Bernadette’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	184
Narrative Analysis 4.7: Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	185
Narrative Analysis 4.8: Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	186
Narrative Analysis 4.9: Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	187
Narrative Analysis 4.10: Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	188
Narrative Analysis 4.11: Mr. Powers’ Observation of Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	189
Narrative Analysis 4.12: Bernadette’s Parental Musicianship and Support in Music .....	190
Narrative Analysis 4.13: Bernadette’s Parental Musicianship and Support in Music .....	191
Narrative Analysis 4.14: Bernadette’s Director Influence.....	192
Narrative Analysis 4.15: Mr. Powers’ View on Director Influence .....	193
Narrative Analysis 4.16: Bernadette’s Director Influence.....	194
Narrative Analysis 4.17: Mr. Powers’ View on SES (Scholarship Opportunities) .....	195
Narrative Analysis 4.18: Maria’s View of Persistence .....	196
Narrative Analysis 4.19: Maria’s View of Persistence.....	196
Narrative Analysis 4.20: Maria’s View of Persistence .....	197
Narrative Analysis 4.21: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s Persistence .....	198
Narrative Analysis 4.22: Maria’s View of Persistence .....	199
Narrative Analysis 4.23: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	199
Narrative Analysis 4.24: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	200
Narrative Analysis 4.25: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	201
Narrative Analysis 4.26: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	202
Narrative Analysis 4.27: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	203
Narrative Analysis 4.28: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	204
Narrative Analysis 4.29: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	205

Narrative Analysis 4.30: Maria’s Motivation for Music .....	206
Narrative Analysis 4.31: Maria’s Motivation for Music .....	207
Narrative Analysis 4.32: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s Motivation for Music.....	208
Narrative Analysis 4.33: Maria’s Motivation for Music .....	209
Narrative Analysis 4.34: Maria’s Motivation for Music .....	210
Narrative Analysis 4.35: Maria’s Parental Musicianship and Support.....	211
Narrative Analysis 4.36: Maria’s Parental Musicianship and Support.....	212
Narrative Analysis 4.37: Mr. Sanders’ Observations of Maria’s Parental Musicianship and Support.....	213
Narrative Analysis 4.38: Maria’s Parental Musicianship and Support.....	214
Narrative Analysis 4.39: Maria’s Director Influence .....	215
Narrative Analysis 4.40: Maria’s Director Influence .....	216
Narrative Analysis 4.41: Maria’s Director Influence .....	217
Narrative Analysis 4.42: Maria’s Director Influence .....	218
Narrative Analysis 4.43: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s Director Influence.....	219
Narrative Analysis 4.44: Maria’s SES.....	220
Narrative Analysis 4.45: Maria’s SES.....	221
Narrative Analysis 4.46: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s SES .....	222
Narrative Analysis 4.47: Maria’s SES.....	223
Narrative Analysis 4.48: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	223
Narrative Analysis 4.49: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	224
Narrative Analysis 4.50: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	224
Narrative Analysis 4.51: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	225
Narrative Analysis 4.52: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	225
Narrative Analysis 4.53: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	226
Narrative Analysis 4.54: Mr. Burton’s View of Samuel’s Persistence .....	226
Narrative Analysis 4.55: Mr. Burton’s View of Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	227
Narrative Analysis 4.56: Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	228
Narrative Analysis 4.57: Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	229
Narrative Analysis 4.58: Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	230
Narrative Analysis 4.59: Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	230

Narrative Analysis 4.60: Mr. Burton’s View of Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	231
Narrative Analysis 4.61: Samuel’s Motivation for Music .....	231
Narrative Analysis 4.62: Samuel’s Motivation for Music .....	232
Narrative Analysis 4.63: Samuel’s Motivation for Music .....	232
Narrative Analysis 4.64: Samuel’s Motivation for Music .....	233
Narrative Analysis 4.65: Samuel’s Motivation for Music .....	234
Narrative Analysis 4.66: Samuel’s Parental Musicianship & Support .....	235
Narrative Analysis 4.67: Samuel’s Parental Musicianship & Support .....	236
Narrative Analysis 4.68: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Parental Musicianship & Support .....	237
Narrative Analysis 4.69: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Parental Musicianship & Support .....	238
Narrative Analysis 4.70: Samuel’s Director Influence .....	239
Narrative Analysis 4.71: Samuel’s Director Influence .....	240
Narrative Analysis 4.72: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Director Influence .....	241
Narrative Analysis 4.73: Samuel’s Director Influence .....	242
Narrative Analysis 4.74: Samuel’s Director Influence .....	243
Narrative Analysis 4.75: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Director Influence .....	244
Narrative Analysis 4.76: Samuel’s Director Influence .....	245
Narrative Analysis 4.77: Samuel’s Director Influence .....	246
Narrative Analysis 4.78: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Director Influence .....	247
Narrative Analysis 4.79: Samuel’s SES .....	248
Narrative Analysis 4.80: Samuel’s SES .....	248

## List of Tables

Table 3.1 – Data Analysis and Representation.....	40
Table 3.2 – Coding Examples from the Current Study.....	42
Narrative Analysis 4.1: Bernadette’s View of Persistence.....	179
Narrative Analysis 4.2: Mr. Powers’ View of Persistence.....	180
Narrative Analysis 4.3: Bernadette’s View of Persistence.....	181
Narrative Analysis 4.4: Bernadette’s View of Persistence.....	182
Narrative Analysis 4.5: Bernadette’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	183
Narrative Analysis 4.6: Bernadette’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	184
Narrative Analysis 4.7: Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	185
Narrative Analysis 4.8: Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	186
Narrative Analysis 4.9: Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	187
Narrative Analysis 4.10: Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	188
Narrative Analysis 4.11: Mr. Powers’ Observation of Bernadette’s Motivation for Music.....	189
Narrative Analysis 4.12: Bernadette’s Parental Musicianship and Support in Music.....	190
Narrative Analysis 4.13: Bernadette’s Parental Musicianship and Support in Music.....	191
Narrative Analysis 4.14: Bernadette’s Director Influence.....	192
Narrative Analysis 4.15: Mr. Powers’ View on Director Influence.....	193
Narrative Analysis 4.16: Bernadette’s Director Influence.....	194
Narrative Analysis 4.17: Mr. Powers’ View on SES (Scholarship Opportunities).....	195
Narrative Analysis 4.18: Maria’s View of Persistence.....	196
Narrative Analysis 4.19: Maria’s View of Persistence.....	196
Narrative Analysis 4.20: Maria’s View of Persistence.....	197
Narrative Analysis 4.21: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s Persistence.....	198
Narrative Analysis 4.22: Maria’s View of Persistence.....	199
Narrative Analysis 4.23: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	199
Narrative Analysis 4.24: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	200
Narrative Analysis 4.25: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	201
Narrative Analysis 4.26: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	202

Narrative Analysis 4.27: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	203
Narrative Analysis 4.28: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	204
Narrative Analysis 4.29: Maria’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability .....	205
Narrative Analysis 4.30: Maria’s Motivation for Music .....	206
Narrative Analysis 4.31: Maria’s Motivation for Music .....	207
Narrative Analysis 4.32: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s Motivation for Music.....	208
Narrative Analysis 4.33: Maria’s Motivation for Music .....	209
Narrative Analysis 4.34: Maria’s Motivation for Music .....	210
Narrative Analysis 4.35: Maria’s Parental Musicianship and Support.....	211
Narrative Analysis 4.36: Maria’s Parental Musicianship and Support.....	212
Narrative Analysis 4.37: Mr. Sanders’ Observations of Maria’s Parental Musicianship and Support.....	213
Narrative Analysis 4.38: Maria’s Parental Musicianship and Support.....	214
Narrative Analysis 4.39: Maria’s Director Influence .....	215
Narrative Analysis 4.40: Maria’s Director Influence .....	216
Narrative Analysis 4.41: Maria’s Director Influence .....	217
Narrative Analysis 4.42: Maria’s Director Influence .....	218
Narrative Analysis 4.43: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s Director Influence.....	219
Narrative Analysis 4.44: Maria’s SES.....	220
Narrative Analysis 4.45: Maria’s SES.....	221
Narrative Analysis 4.46: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s SES .....	222
Narrative Analysis 4.47: Maria’s SES .....	223
Narrative Analysis 4.48: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	223
Narrative Analysis 4.49: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	224
Narrative Analysis 4.50: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	224
Narrative Analysis 4.51: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	225
Narrative Analysis 4.52: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	225
Narrative Analysis 4.53: Samuel’s View of Persistence .....	226
Narrative Analysis 4.54: Mr. Burton’s View of Samuel’s Persistence .....	226
Narrative Analysis 4.55: Mr. Burton’s View of Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	227
Narrative Analysis 4.56: Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	228

Narrative Analysis 4.57: Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	229
Narrative Analysis 4.58: Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	230
Narrative Analysis 4.59: Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	230
Narrative Analysis 4.60: Mr. Burton’s View of Samuel’s Self-Concept of Musical Ability.....	231
Narrative Analysis 4.61: Samuel’s Motivation for Music.....	231
Narrative Analysis 4.62: Samuel’s Motivation for Music.....	232
Narrative Analysis 4.63: Samuel’s Motivation for Music.....	232
Narrative Analysis 4.64: Samuel’s Motivation for Music.....	233
Narrative Analysis 4.65: Samuel’s Motivation for Music.....	234
Narrative Analysis 4.66: Samuel’s Parental Musicianship & Support.....	235
Narrative Analysis 4.67: Samuel’s Parental Musicianship & Support.....	236
Narrative Analysis 4.68: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Parental Musicianship & Support.....	237
Narrative Analysis 4.69: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Parental Musicianship & Support.....	238
Narrative Analysis 4.70: Samuel’s Director Influence.....	239
Narrative Analysis 4.71: Samuel’s Director Influence.....	240
Narrative Analysis 4.72: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Director Influence.....	241
Narrative Analysis 4.73: Samuel’s Director Influence.....	242
Narrative Analysis 4.74: Samuel’s Director Influence.....	243
Narrative Analysis 4.75: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Director Influence.....	244
Narrative Analysis 4.76: Samuel’s Director Influence.....	245
Narrative Analysis 4.77: Samuel’s Director Influence.....	246
Narrative Analysis 4.78: Mr. Burton’s Observation of Samuel’s Director Influence.....	247
Narrative Analysis 4.79: Samuel’s SES.....	248
Narrative Analysis 4.80: Samuel’s SES.....	248

## Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge my advisor, Dr. Frederick Burrack without whose support and expertise this work would not have been possible. I would also like to thank the members of my committee: Dr. David Littrell, Dr. Phillip Payne, Dr. Craig Weston, and Dr. Yolanda Broyles-Gonzalez. I would be negligent if I did not also acknowledge the tireless support of my wife, SueZanne, and our children, Aaron and Emily. I love you all and am inspired by you every single day. I want to thank my parents, Bill and Linda Ayers, for instilling in me a curiosity that continues to grow. I love you both so very much. I also want to acknowledge my extended network of supports: Bernard J. Sullivan, PhD, friend and counselor; Sr. Linda Barringer, M.M.B, friend and mentor; and Fr. Bob Hagan, S.J., friend and shepherd. And Jason Hollowed, assistant director of orchestras at Shawnee Mission Northwest High School, thank you for helping me through the logistical challenges of working full time while writing this dissertation – I owe you, my friend. And finally, to all of my friends, colleagues, and students, past, current, and future: thank you for teaching me more than I ever taught you; I am a better human being for having had the pleasure of knowing each of you. “What have you done today to make your dreams come true?” ~ JSB

# **Dedication**

SOLI DEO GLORIA



## **Preface**

“Knowledge is power. Information is liberating. Education is the premise of progress in every society, every family.” ~ Kofi Annan

# Chapter 1

## Introduction

*“I would like to think that I didn’t have anything to do with him not being challenged. I’ve asked myself that same question many times. And he’s not the only one. I’ve had other students who haven’t continued in college that were really, really sharp players. You just go...why?” ~ James Burton*

As a music educator with over twenty years of public school classroom experience, I have struggled with why so many of my high-achieving students decided to not continue playing in orchestra at the collegiate level. In my large, vibrant orchestra program in a middle-class community, on average, thirty string students graduate each year. Of those students, a handful continued to play in their college orchestra, and those students were either majoring or minoring in a music field.

Providing several levels of string orchestra and one symphony orchestra, our students have the opportunity to progress to a very high level of competency while still in high school. Students in the top string orchestra study and perform grade V-VI literature (pieces that would typically be performed by collegiate and professional orchestras). They are exposed to and perform literature comparable to that which would be performed in college, which leads me back to the question why do so many students stop playing in orchestra after high school?

Most music teachers, or dance teachers for that matter, have had dealings with *stage mommies*. Teachers of the musical arts often have stories of parents who were overly involved in their child’s artistic pursuits. Parental support is a vital component of persistence, and teachers see firsthand the positive and negative effects of the amount and kind of support given by the parents of my musicians.

I have experience conducting a large metropolitan youth symphony orchestra, and had a distinctly different experience dealing with parents from upper class families than with middle- to lower-class high school students' families. The more affluent youth symphony families navigated the political stratifications of the youth symphony (and greater arts community) with much greater ease than families from lower socioeconomic statuses. This phenomenon is known as cultural capital. I wanted to know how it affected participants in the current study, both personally and socially.

Since the participants had spent upward of eight to ten years studying an orchestral instrument, the current study examined how the participants' relationship with their parents influenced the decision to not continue in collegiate orchestra. The study examined if and how parents had supported the participants in music and how the participants viewed their parents on a personal and social level. Would any of the socioeconomic differences that had been observed at the youth symphony program be present in the current study's participants?

Do students who are high-achieving and skillful players of string instruments choose to not continue in college orchestra because they are choosing to step away from playing their instrument? Are they stepping away from music at all, or is my students' enrollment in college orchestra the only means by which to measure success of learning music? What are students thinking when they make the choice to not continue in orchestra at the collegiate level?

The National Association for Music Education, in the Housewright Declaration Vision 2020, charged music educators to provide lifelong opportunities for making music throughout peoples' lives (NAfME, 1999, para. 19). Commission author Judith A. Jellison (2000) went even further in a separate article when she called for the teaching toward transition, which is planning instruction in school that would mimic activities and experiences performed in

adulthood (p. 10). Even though a large majority of adults support the idea of music education, the number of people who played instruments in school drops drastically, nearly half, by the age of eighteen, with half again as many discontinuing music making on that instrument by the age of thirty five (Jellison, 2004, p. 32). Researchers have explored the reasons why students decided to enroll in music (Kinney, 2010) and how initial grade level effected enrollment, retention, and performance throughout the elementary, middle, and high school string class experience (Hartley & Porter, 2009). Qualitative studies have examined adolescents' commitment to extracurricular activities such as athletic and artistic (musical) pursuits as well as the academic, social, psychological, and musical influences of the high school music classroom (Adderly, Kennedy & Berz, 2003; Fredricks, Alfeld-Liro, Hruda, Eccles, Patrick & Ryan, 2002). Other researchers have examined the reasons behind students' continued participation in music *after* high school (Sichivitsa, 2003).

Researchers have studied participation in music ensembles but none have looked specifically at why high school orchestra students did not continue to play in college. Kokotsaki and Hallam (2011) suggested that continued participation in collegiate music ensembles results in a positive impact on students' practical music-making and social skills. Participants valued the development of musical skills through playing in an ensemble while the social benefits centered on the "enjoyment of interacting with like-minded people in a friendly and relaxing environment" (p. 149). The musical and non-musical factors of retention and attrition can be studied within given confines (e.g. influence of parental musicianship and support in music, previous musical experience, self-concept of musical ability, value of music, academic integration, and social integration) to a certain degree of success (Sichivitsa, 2003). Few

researchers have looked at the reasons why young musicians stop participating in music making activities after high school.

### *Purpose of the Study*

The purpose of this study was to discover the reasons that led high school orchestra musicians to discontinue formal participation in collegiate orchestra class. Using narrative analysis, I examined the intrinsic and extrinsic factors that influenced the student's decision to not participate in orchestra. I also sought to understand if and how these former high school musicians continued exploring their musical independence.

### *The Need for the Study*

McKeage (2004), studied gender and participation rates of high school and college jazz musicians, but there is little else in the literature examining attrition and participation rates between high school and college instrumental music programs. Whereas several studies have been done on recruitment and retention between elementary and middle school instrumental music programs, and middle and high school instrumental programs, few have looked at the reasons as to why college-aged adults have discontinued their formal music studies via ensemble involvement. The studies that researched continued participation in collegiate ensembles are detailed here.

Kokotski and Hallam (2007 & 2011), in two studies, centered their research on non-music majors and their perceived value of continued participation in instrumental music ensembles on the collegiate level. They found that several factors influenced students' decisions to either maintain their participation or quit the ensemble. In the first study (2007), the benefits of participating in a musical ensemble included a boost in self-confidence, but more importantly it was discovered that the real benefit came from the process of cooperating with other musicians

and relying on them in the interplay of making music to create an end product that was a live performance of high quality (p. 106). In the second study of collegiate musicians (2011), the researchers found benefits for students, especially for non-music majors, in the areas friendship and relaxation in which they developed social skills, met interesting people, made friends, and had a strong sense of belonging (2011, p. 167).

However, some non-music majors felt pressures that eventually led them to discontinue their participation in an ensemble. Some non-majors found the amount of work required, or the perceived professional-level of the literature, to be daunting, leading them to feel less enjoyment, and disheartened to the point of withdrawal from the ensemble (2011, p. 168). The researchers caution that music educators should take these reasons into consideration when designing music ensembles (p. 168). Kokotsaki and Hallam concluded the study with the suggestion that music educators encourage student participation in ensembles “by providing opportunities for participation in performing groups as often as possible,” taking into account student “level of attainment and motivation” (pp. 168-169).

Similar factors and results were found in a study of singers and their reasons for participating and maintaining membership in their college choir. Sichivitsa (2003) explored the use of theoretical frameworks to describe the issue of motivation, recruitment, and retention in college music classes. Using the Choir Participation Survey II, based on Tinto’s Model of Institutional Departure, the author found that several musical and non-musical factors influence choir students’ decisions to continue to participate in choir while in college. Past musical involvement by itself did not have a direct impact on musical intentions. However, students who were raised in a musical environment and had more positive musical experiences were more likely to feel better about their own musical abilities and to appreciate those musical experiences.

Students who were satisfied with the conductor's professionalism, the level of musical material, and their own performance were also more likely to enjoy socializing with members of the choir and with the conductor. Sichivista suggested further research in order to understand the factors contributing to students continuing with formal and/or informal musical activities after high school.

To discover the reasons that led high school orchestra musicians to discontinue formal participation in collegiate orchestra class, we must understand continued music making. Making music does not have to be in a rehearsal setting. A need exists to understand why music making stops or is transformed after high school rehearsals end. If, as Kokotsaki and Hallam (2011) discovered, continued participation in collegiate music ensembles shows a positive impact on practical music-making as well as social skills, then a deeper understanding of how an individual's method of making music stops or is transformed will offer music educators insights into how best to prepare students to either continue in collegiate rehearsals or to give students the skills necessary for creating their own musical experiences.

### ***The Research Questions***

The primary research question was: Why do high-achieving high school orchestral musicians, who had at least six years of training on an instrument, choose not to continue with music study in a collegiate orchestra? *Orchestral musician* is defined as a student who played violin, viola, cello or bass in their school string orchestra. *High-achieving* is defined as student musicians who were chosen for district and/or state ensembles (all-state orchestra, for example) and/or were members of a select, audition-only ensemble (such as a youth orchestra or a select ensemble at school).

Sub-Questions that were examined include:

1. How many years did the participant study their instrument?
2. How did the participant view their high school music experience?
3. What was participant's relationship with their music teacher(s)?
4. What opportunities were available for further music study beyond the high school music class?
5. Were there emergent factors that influenced participants to not continue in collegiate ensembles?

### ***Theoretical Framework***

Because the focus of this research centered on the individual experience of discontinuing participation in orchestra on the collegiate level, the theoretical framework was based on the narrative research methods of Riessman (2008). Narrative analysis is “a family of methods for interpreting texts that have in common a storied form” (Riessman, 2008). Further, Riessman states that:

A good narrative analysis prompts the reader think beyond the surface of a text, and there is a move toward a broader commentary. Just because narrative approaches interrogate cases (rather than population-based samples) does not mean results cannot be generalized. But inference is of a different kind. Generalizing from a sample to the entire population is the statistical approach; case study involves ‘generalization to theoretical propositions,’ which are, to some degree, transferable. Making conceptual inferences about a social process (the construction of an identity group, for example, from close observation of one community) is an equally ‘valid’ kind of inquiry with a long history in anthropology and sociology. (p. 13)



Since I interviewed three subjects who met the qualifications (college-aged, high-achieving musician who were not currently playing in their college orchestra), a narrative analysis approach was utilized. According to Riessman (2008), when narrative analysis is used, “Particular histories of individuals are preserved, resulting in an accumulation of detail that is assembled into a ‘fuller’ picture of the individual or group” (p. 11). Definitive answers were not sought or expected, but rather the collection of data led to a greater understanding and illustration of why the subjects chose to end their participation in orchestra class on the collegiate level.

“Qualitative inquiry represents a legitimate mode of social and human science exploration, without apology or comparison to quantitative research” (Creswell, 2013, p. 6). Since I examined why high-achieving high school orchestra musicians chose to not participate in college orchestra class, it was important to gather the stories and experiences of the research participants in as much detail as possible through narrative research and analysis. “[T]he procedures for implementing [narrative] research consist of focusing or studying one or two individuals, gathering data through the collection of their stories, reporting individual experiences, and chronologically ordering the meaning of those experiences” (p. 70).

Through the study of why high-achieving high school orchestral music students did not continue to participate in orchestra at the collegiate level, I sought to discover both the social and personal meanings of that decision. Additionally, I sought to understand the role of music making in these participants’ lives. Through this study, music educators will gain insight to aid students in making a decision in whether or not to play in their college orchestra.

## **Chapter 2 - A Review of the Literature**

### **Introduction**

This study explored why high-achieving orchestral musicians from suburban high schools did not continue to participate in orchestra class at the collegiate level and identified how these students continued to make music on a personal level beyond high school. I also sought to discover both the social and personal meanings of that decision. The literature was divided into two main categories. Intrinsic factors include persistence (including academic and social integration), self-concept of musical ability, and motivation in music. Extrinsic factors include parental musicianship and support in music, high school music director influence, and socioeconomic status. By better understanding the factors that influenced a student's decision to quit participation in orchestra on the collegiate level, a more robust background for the research questions was established.

### ***Intrinsic Factors***

#### ***Persistence***

Though the present study focused on the decision of orchestra students to not participate in collegiate orchestra beyond high school, as well as the personal and social meanings of that decision, the examination of studies that focus on collegiate persistence and attrition from high school to college (albeit in general studies, not music) informed the survey questions and follow up questions used in the interviews. Because Tinto's (1988) Model of Institutional Departure forms the basis for most collegiate persistence studies that have followed, the present study was informed by an elaboration of that model in which Thomas (2000) found that students performed

better academically and persisted better when ties outside their peer group existed. And although the benefits of having ties outside their peer group may come from participation in organizations *other* than collegiate orchestra, participation in orchestra class can easily be recognized as a group that offers the benefits outlined by Thomas. Participation in collegiate orchestra class can be seen as the epitome of pro-social and cross-curricular behavior for students that graduate from high school orchestra programs.

Tinto designed his Model of Institutional Departure after years of studying the causes and effects of student attrition on the collegiate level (Tinto, 1988). Drawn heavily from Durkheim's ground-breaking work on suicide (1897/1951), the Tinto model "specifies a longitudinal process in which a number of background variables (e.g. race, secondary academic performance, parental encouragement, etc.) interact to form students' initial commitment to the college campus and to educational attainment goals" (Thomas, 2000, p. 593). According to Tinto, successful integration leads students to persist on campus (Tinto, 1988).

Several studies have used the Tinto model as a theoretical framework or starting point, not only for academic attrition but also for areas such as athletics and music (Mangold & Adams, 2003; Sichivitsa, 2003). Thomas (2000) elaborated on the Tinto model and found that "students with a great proportion of ties outside their peer group perform better academically and are more likely to persist" (p. 609). Thomas's findings suggest that universities and colleges should develop activities that enhance student connectedness across diverse populations with opportunities for connecting emerging student leaders (p. 609).

Reciprocated relations boost the likelihood of a student being named as a relation by others (in degree), which in turn has a positive and direct impact on students' sense of

affective social integration, commitment to the institution, and intention to persist (p. 610).

Palmer, Davis, and Maramba (2011) called for the continued use of the Tinto model of student departure in postsecondary education research, but advocated for inclusion of theoretical frameworks that fit specific student populations. In their study of the impact of family support on the success of black men at a historically black university, they acknowledged the impact of the Tinto model, but call for “the selection and application of theoretical frameworks to thoroughly analyze and fully understand the conditions under which students of color experience and become successful in college” (p. 592).

Interestingly, Mangold and Adams, in their study of graduation rates of NCAA collegiate athletes, found that sports participation may not enhance academic integration at all, but rather may hinder it (2003, p. 554). They go on to call for a new way to look at the issues.

Ironically, our results suggest that social involvement in intercollegiate sports, a process that broadly and indirectly is expected to facilitate graduation, may work in combination with other institutional characteristics to inhibit it. In order to better understand this counter-intuitive aggregate-level outcome, we advocate examining the negative relationship between graduation rates and success in intercollegiate sports in a way that calls attention to subtle organizational dynamics that might affect the potentially interrelated nature of academic and social integration (p. 555).

Because of the recurring problem of student attrition, many colleges and universities have instituted policies and/or programs designed to enhance social integration. Pre-college student orientations’ efficacies have been studied as part of persistence literature.

[The] major positive influence of exposure to orientation on freshman persistence was transmitted primarily through its influence on freshman year social integration and, to a somewhat lesser extent, through its influence on subsequent commitment to the institution” (Pascarella, Terenzini, and Wolfe, 1986, pp. 169-170).

The findings suggested that extracurricular involvement and informal contact with faculty is important and that the “the influence of orientation on students’ initial integration into the campus social system is manifest more in extent of involvement than in quality or impact of involvement” (p. 170).

Other researchers have applied a social network approach to the study of student persistence. Kelly, LaVergne, Boone, and Boone (2012) examined social factors that influenced student matriculation. They found that an individual’s “personal characteristics, prior experiences, and personal commitments play a large role in student persistence” (p. 654). Other researchers found that when students considered leaving college it was due to an unhappy social life and no connections with their institution (Freeman, Hall, & Bresciani, 2007). Kelly, LaVergne, Boone, and Boone suggested that university personnel “actively seek input from students to ensure that their social needs are being attained” (p. 660). Because students are connected across a range of social factors in the university, students are more likely to matriculate when they receive support in these social communities (p. 662).

Research has extended to the secondary school level, wherein researchers examined the effect of high school factors on persistence and graduation at university. Parker, Hogan, Eastabrook, Oke, and Wood (2006) examined the effects of emotional intelligence on student retention to predict successful transitions from high school to university. The researchers found

that students who were significantly higher in emotional and social competencies persisted at a higher level than their peers (p. 1329). Further, they observed that

First year students not only need to make new relationships, particularly if they attend an institution at a distance from their hometown, but they often need to modify existing relationships with parents and friends (e.g., romantic partner back home). First year students are also adjusting to a new academic environment that places far more importance on independent learning than typically experienced in high school (p. 1334).

Johnson (2007) examined the efficacy of high school education on persistence and graduation rates at a public research university. Johnson found that three aggregate high school characteristics should be included in university enrollment management: the percent of SAT takers (which had “a concave-shape effect on enrollment, retention and graduation”); the percent of those receiving free or reduced lunch (found to be much less likely to persist); and students who attended university within sixty miles of home (found to be much more likely to matriculate and persist to the second year) (p. 776). The study demonstrated that the academic quality of a high school related directly to persistence (p. 791).

Kahn and Nauta (2001) studied the factors that predicted persistence between the first two years of college, concluding that “social-cognitive factors do, in fact, relate to freshman-to-sophomore persistence but only when they are measured after students have attained at least one college semester’s experience” (p. 646). Acclimatization to college made a difference to the social-cognitive factors in that “expectations and performance goals assessed during students’ second semester predicted persistence into the sophomore year above and beyond ability/past performance indexes” (p. 647).

Persistence, while arguably a factor at all ages and educational stages, is an intrinsic motivator during the first few years of college. The initial surveys and follow-up questions were designed to prompt the participants to consider their own persistence in college orchestra, including the personal and social meanings of that decision. By exploring the participant's persistence in orchestra, a fuller understanding of their reasons for discontinuing in college was reached.

### ***Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

All too often music educators have conversations with students in which their evaluation of their overall musical strengths is not one based in reality. Almost always it is a student who plays at a very advanced level but feels that they are just not good enough. Coincidentally, the same student usually has a very high grade point average but refers to him or herself as *stupid* or *not smart enough*. For the present study, I examined how participants' self-concepts of musical ability influenced their decision to not continue in orchestra and if their high school orchestra teacher corroborated that view. Did their view of themselves socially and personally match up to reality?

Students believe that their success or failure in a pursuit is based on several factors including ability, effort, task difficulty, and luck (Weiner, 1986). Student musicians often fall into two categories: those who believe that success is based on inherent talent and those who believe success can be achieved through hard work. Although this is a greatly simplified categorization, students' "beliefs about why they may or may not be successful in various pursuits can influence the extent to which they are likely to invest effort in these pursuits and which in turn affects the level of achievement likely to be experienced" (Rosevear, 2010, p. 17). Students' beliefs about their own abilities develop over time, through experiences they have, and

from opinions of others. Sometimes students choose to not pursue an area for which they may be qualified but feel that they lack ability (Dweck, 2000).

Encouraging students to develop an effort attribution rather than an ability attribution can be another means of influencing motivation to learn. Likewise, beliefs about one's ability can impact upon learning, and developing an incremental view of ability (which is that ability can be changed through effort) can help students to develop a tendency towards effort attribution (Dweck, 2000). (Rosevear, 2010, p. 22)

Helping students take pleasure in the process of making music is incumbent upon music educators as suggested by Cox and Pitts (2003) in an editorial stating, "enjoyment is a vital but somewhat elusive criterion in shaping effective and engaging experiences of music education" (p. 207). By helping children develop a "positive music self-concept" (Rosevear, 2010, p. 23) early on in their education, negative self-views are less likely to develop and fewer barriers to rewarding musical experiences may arise.

Kruse found that choral musicians' self-esteem was highest as young adults (2012) and hypothesized that the "amount of time spent away from school-based music experiences coupled with other issues related to aging such as health concerns, income adjustments, and role changes might contribute to a gradual decline in self-esteem" (p. 69). Welch, Himonides, Saunders, Papageorgi, and Sarazin (2014) found that peer relationships "can be a powerful factor in nurturing (or hindering) successful participation and ongoing engagement, a finding related to the social benefit that is also evidenced in adolescent music activity, both in school and elsewhere" (p. 803).



Kruse pointed out that even though self-esteem declines over time, music participation can “supplement...self-esteem among adults” (p. 69). But he urged caution in interpreting the study’s seemingly contrary results:

An adult might have, for example, a low self-concept in music, but these perceptions or beliefs will not adversely affect self-esteem unless he or she values doing well in music. (p. 70)

Because students believe that their success or failure in a pursuit is based on several factors including ability, effort, task difficulty, and luck (Weiner, 1986), the present study examined participants’ previous feelings and experiences in music and how it influenced their decision to not continue in collegiate orchestra. And since students’ beliefs about their own abilities developed over time, through experiences they had, and from opinions of others (Dweck, 2000), it is important that the present study investigated the participants’ past experiences in music and how those experiences shaped their self-concept in music both personally and socially.

### ***Motivation for Music***

Every instrumental music teacher can articulate the joy that students exhibit on that first day of beginning band or orchestra class. The excitement of the students and their desire to finally get to play is almost electrifying. Because music teachers often witness motivation waning as students get older, as personal and social stressors begin to impinge on their lives, I wanted to know if the participants in the present study found that lack of motivation for continuing in music factored into their decision to not continue playing in college. And, if

motivation for music had indeed been lost, how did participants articulate those feelings on a personal and social level?

Schmidt (2005), in his study of motivation, performance achievement, and music experiences in secondary instrumental students, found a slight increase in scores for intrinsic or mastery orientations for older students while younger musicians tended to score higher on competitive, ego, and failure avoidance orientations. All subjects in the study, on average, agreed that they worked best with other students and placed less emphasis on competitive and ego orientations. Schmidt's results "suggest that students may respond best to the intrinsic or cooperative aspects of instrumental music rather than its extrinsic or competitive aspects" (p. 144).

Asmus (1986) studied motivation characteristics of music students by looking at the reasons they ascribed success or failure at music tasks and determined five major categories: effort, background, classroom environment, musical ability, and affect for music. Asmus and Harrison (1990) noted that as music students get older a "shift in attributed causes from effort to ability" takes place. Interestingly, motivated students most often cite effort attributions while students with low motivation cite ability (Asmus, 1986). Asmus found that 12<sup>th</sup> grade instrumental music students tended to emphasize effort and ability, but in a later study (Asmus and Harrison, 1990) found that college non-music majors placed importance on affect in music.

The expected relationship between music motivation and musical aptitude, which assumed that people with aptitude in an area would tend to be motivated to achieve in that area, was not supported by this study (p. 264).

Asmus and Harrison concluded with the following recommendation:

If the limited sample of this population is any indication of the population of undergraduate non-music majors as a whole, the major drive for music stems from affect for music. Instruction should capitalize on this characteristic by emphasizing the affective aspects of music. As the course progresses, instructors would need to systematically reinforce effort-related causes for musical achievement to encourage continued striving by the students as the course material increases in difficulty and requires greater student cognitive involvement (p. 266).

In their study of the value of intrinsic rather than traditional achievement goals for public artists, Lacaile, Koestner, and Gaudreau (2007) posed the following question:

Is it realistic to think that the learning climate in performing arts training can be altered to focus more on non-achievement oriented goals, particularly in countries such as Canada and the USA, which are highly competitive and achievement oriented? (p. 254)

Researchers corroborated the finding that the nature of artistic performance can foster avoidant tendencies due to the regular chance of failure or success in public (Kenny, 2004; Salmon, 1990) and that performance-approach and performance-avoidance goals had a negative effect on persistence and well-being measures (Lacaille, Koestner, and Gaudreau, 2007, p. 254). Artists with intrinsic goals reported the opposite.

Specifically, students with intrinsic goals reported performing better, experiencing greater life satisfaction subsequent to their performance and lower levels of intentions to quit their discipline. Goals such as 'live a memorable moment,' 'communicate the essence of the work to the public,' 'feel absorbed in the experience' appear to be those that foster the most adaptive responses to the public performance context. These findings

also seem in line with what most people expect when they attend to an artistic performance: to go through an emotional experience that makes them forget everyday hassles and to feel immersed in the art (pp. 253-254).

The researchers posed an intriguing hypothetical in regard to the adverse effects that mastery and performance goals foster, when they observed:

[If] future research confirms that an emphasis on performance-related goals fosters anxiety-related difficulties that actually interfere with optimal performance and successful artistic development, we would expect that educators would have to look seriously at the kinds of goals performing artists are oriented to pursue (p. 254).

If intrinsic goals are associated with “higher life satisfaction and lower intention to quit the discipline” (p. 253), then music educators should heed the researchers suggestion “to encourage intrinsic goals among students” (p. 254).

The current study is informed by the literature on motivation in several ways. If, as Schmidt (2005) found, older high school students are more cooperative and intrinsically motivated, then the current study should see similar results depending on the emphasis placed within the high school program. If the program emphasized competition or other extrinsically motivating aspects, an alumnus could cite this as a motivating factor to quit orchestra in college. The educational and emotional environment in which the participants’ created music in high school should have an influence on a participant’s decision as well. As Asmus and Harrison (1986) found among college non-music majors, the participants could cite an emphasis on musical affect in their decision to quit college orchestra. And, because Lacaille, Koestner, and Gaudreau (2007) corroborated the earlier finding that the nature of artistic performance can

foster avoidant tendencies due to the regular chance of failure or success in public, and that performance had a negative effect on persistence and well-being, the current study may find that avoidance of those public failures drove participants to not continue in music. In short, the current study sought to understand if students *just* want to make music, in a purely personal way, without the fear of failure in performance and the added social pressures it brings.

### ***Extrinsic Factors***

#### ***Parental Musicianship and Support in Music***

Researchers have studied the effects of parental influence on college persistence, attrition, and matriculation. Cultural capital, the non-financial assets that help people navigate social mobility (e.g., level of education, speech patterns, clothing style, and physical experience, to name a few) was first studied by Pierre Bourdieu (Brown, 1974) and has been the basis of many sociological and educational studies. Parental musicianship and support for musical study is an example of cultural capital.

Dumais and Ward (2009) studied cultural capital and first-generation college success and found that:

[Family] cultural capital, cultural classes, and the number of ways parents helped in the college application process are all significant for four-year college enrollment, and parents' help and students' receiving assistance at school with their college applications are significant for graduation (p. 245).

The study showed that cultural capital was more important for initial access to university, “with both arts-based and strategy-based cultural capital affecting enrollment” (p. 262). However, fewer cultural capital indicators had an impact on graduation and the grade point average of

those who graduate (p. 262). In fact, the research showed that in the case of graduation, “none of the arts-based cultural capital variables had a significant effect, and for undergraduate GPA, none of the cultural capital variables had an effect at all” (p. 262). Perhaps the most telling aspect of cultural capital in regard to this study is that parental strategic interaction, the parents’ garnering resources and information for their children, is linked to both access to higher education and graduation (p. 262).

Cultural capital is one part of parental support in music. Parental support or involvement is an important part of traditional and parent-centered methods such as Suzuki (Bugeja, 2009). Researchers have examined selected aspects of parental support or involvement and the relationship to various student musician outcomes. Zdizinski (1996) found five major findings when he studied parental involvement and cognitive, affective, and performance outcomes of band students in grades 4-12:

- (1) Parental involvement was related to overall performance, affective, and cognitive musical outcomes.
- (2) For cognitive musical outcomes, parental involvement was only related at the elementary level.
- (3) For musical performance outcomes, parental involvement was only related at the elementary level.
- (4) For affective outcomes, the strength of the parental involvement relationship increased with student age.
- (5) Items concerning concert attendance, providing materials, participating in parent groups, and tape-recording student performances were related to all outcome areas (Zdizinski, p. 34).

Zdizinski closed the study with the recommendation that more research should be conducted to identify areas that may interact with parental involvement and obscure important parental involvement relationships.

The relative contributions of parental and family influences, peer influences, classroom environment, classroom and music teacher influences, cultural and social factors, and individual subject characteristics should be examined to ascertain their interactions with the construct of parental involvement (p. 44).

Creech (2010) cautioned that “parents should neither become uninvolved in their children’s learning in the name of agency, nor disempower their children in the sake of communion” (p. 29). In his study examining the effect of parental support on learning a musical instrument, Creech found what may come as no surprise to music educators, mainly that:

...effective and supportive parental involvement in instrumental learning requires parents to be versatile, adept at moving between the close and distant positions on the responsiveness axis and between directive and acquiescent positions on the control axis on the model for interpersonal dimensions (p. 29).

Further, Creech found six positive outcomes that may be achieved when parents:

(1) elicit their children’s views regarding appropriate parental involvement, (2) negotiate with their children over practising [sic] issues, within parameters set by the teacher, (3) provide a structured home environment for practice, (4) take an interest in promoting good teacher-pupil rapport, (5) communicate with the teacher in relation to the child’s progress and (6) remain as a supremely interested audience (p. 29).

A child’s musical development takes a high level of parental involvement over a long period of time. Dai and Schader (2002) examined “parents’ expectancy beliefs and values regarding their child’s music training, regular academic work, and athletic activities” (p. 135)

and found that parents seek out musical training for their child for the general educational value derived from the pursuit and not for the development of musical talent. But, as the child develops into a more advanced player, parents change their beliefs and values (p. 135).

Although evidence in this study is not clear on the issue, how parents think of the nature of talent in music and other areas is an important question because, from an attribution point of view, innate ability is a stable, uncontrollable factor, while motivation and effort level are changeable and within the child's control. Thus, a less successful child may perceive him- or herself as lacking natural ability, whereas the parents may simply interpret it as a lack of motivation (p. 142).

The researchers found that “parents with high achievement values in music tend to have biased expectancy beliefs in favor of their children” (p. 142). It was noted that this correlation increased with age and more years of musical training. However, Dai and Schader point out that “achievement of eminence is not the major criterion for success in music for this group of parents as reported in a separate study that focused on the intrinsic and extrinsic aspects of motivation underlying parental support” (p. 143). It is possible, they theorized, that parents see less difference between ability/talent and motivation/effort than their children do.

For the current study, I examined the participants’ perceptions of the role that parental support played on participants’ elementary to high school music involvement along with the personal and social implications of that support. The type of private lessons and the involvement of parents in those lessons were also taken into consideration. The participant’s perception of their parents’ reaction to the decision to quit orchestra in college impacted their narrative.



### ***Director Influence***

By examining the role that the teacher played in the high school orchestra experience, I was able to understand various social dynamics that led to student engagement or disenfranchisement. Participants' relationships with their high school orchestra directors may play a role in their decision not to continue playing on the collegiate level. Background information was a vital component of understanding this complex personal and social dynamic.

Teacher involvement and motivation is central to students' experiences in the classroom (Skinner and Belmont, 1993). In their study on reciprocal effects of teacher behavior, Skinner and Belmont found that "teacher provision of both autonomy support and optimal structure predicted children's motivation across the school year," and that "students who are behaviorally disengaged receive teacher responses that should further undermine their motivation" (p. 571).

Asmus (1986) applied Attribution Theory to music education to uncover a phenomenon wherein the "beliefs students have about the causes for success and failure at a musical task will influence how the students approach the task" in the future (p. 274). The role of the teacher became extremely important in this situation.

Those teachers who promote ability related attributions are suggesting to students that it is some innate characteristic that only a few people possess that allows them to be good at music. Students who adopt such a belief pattern are less apt to practice unless they view themselves as an individual with the requisite talent (p. 274).

Asmus noted that the shift from effort related to ability related attributions occurs during the middle school years, the grades that teachers first begin to struggle with keeping students involved in music (p. 275).

Young students believe that if they try hard they will succeed at music. Most teachers want their students to apply themselves diligently in their musical pursuits.

Unfortunately, the results of this study indicate that the older students get, the less likely it is that their attitudes are conducive for applying themselves at the levels most teachers would want. Therefore, it seems crucial that teachers at all grade levels should encourage students to adopt effort related attributions so that students are motivated to put in the effort required to become proficient at music (p. 275).

Teacher influence in regard to student success and persistence in music is a component that needs to be examined further.

The type of instruction that the participants' received in high school factored in their decision not to continue in collegiate orchestra. As stated earlier, Asmus (1986) applied Attribution Theory to music education and found that students are influenced by how to approach a task by how much failure or success they've experienced in the past. The teacher becomes extremely important in this situation. A teacher's approach to how they teach, as well as their personal philosophy of music education, can have a profound and lasting effect on their students.

A student's perception of their own personal and musical successes can be influenced by the amount of input they are given in the classroom. Scruggs (2009) noted "even if the director leads a perfect rehearsal, he or she has not necessarily engaged the students in a meaningful musical experience" (p. 54). Scruggs posited that this is due to directors not being willing to ask students for input during rehearsal or being willing to take suggestions for literature selections. Sadly, she wondered if "directors are less concerned with student understanding than with

student performance” (p. 54). She suggested remedying this situation by utilizing constructivist practices in the music classroom.

Orchestra students can provide various types of musical leadership within the classroom. It is the constructivist teacher’s responsibility to assess each student’s prior knowledge and guide him or her toward an appropriate leadership role. Incorporating individual student strengths, both administrative and musical, into the classroom will enrich the classroom experience for everyone while allowing students to feel ownership in their program (p. 54).

Scruggs suggested that instilling independent learning practices among high school musicians would help develop a cadre of leaders. Encouraging self-reliance and minimizing reliance on the director helps build educational and musical strengths.

If students are given the opportunity to create their own understanding of instrumental performance, and if they feel their views are valued, they will begin to realize that they are an integral part of the rehearsal process (p. 59).

Reeve (2009) suggested several ways in which teachers can support students’ perceptions of success through the support of autonomy in the classroom. These steps include: provide explanatory rationales; rely on informational, non-controlling language; display patience to allow time for self-paced learning to occur; and acknowledge and accept students’ expressions of negative affect (p. 168). Because controlling motivating style is linked to poor study outcomes, Reeve believes it is in both the students’ and teachers’ best interest to develop an autonomy-supportive style.

Some teachers already embrace and enact an autonomy-supportive style during their instruction. But other teachers—and perhaps all teachers on an occasional basis—are pushed and pulled toward a controlling style by a multitude of factors, including social roles; burdens of responsibility and accountability; cultural values and expectations; a misconception that controlling means structured, temporarily unmotivated, or unengaged students; personal beliefs about motivation; and their own personal dispositions. For all these reasons, it is understandable why teachers occasionally or even chronically adopt a controlling style toward students. Still, it is clear that both students and teachers function better in school when teachers support students' autonomy (p. 172).

By identifying, through the review of literature, the different types of teaching methodologies and styles among music directors, the personal and social experiences that the participants' had in high school were better understood.

Fredricks (2011) added to the notion of student autonomy affecting the perception of musical and personal success through the study of cognitive engagement in school and out-of-school contexts. Fredricks found that behavioral, emotional and cognitive engagement can be supported through teachers' and support staffs' management approaches. The study showed that teachers and support staff can increase engagement in several ways: by showing students that the teachers and support staff care about them; by creating an environment in which peer learning is facilitated in a positive manner; by being clear and consistent in regard to expectations, rules, and routine procedures; and by increasing the number of higher-order and real-world tasks (p. 333).

Ideally, teachers can make changes to all four dimensions to create a more socially and academically engaging context. However, even changing one dimension of the classroom

(i.e., supportive teacher/student relationships, peer relationships, adequate structure, and task characteristics) will help to improve engagement in the classroom. Classrooms are complex and multifaceted environments and it is not always easy to change contexts (p. 333).

Participants' relationships with their high school orchestra directors may have influenced their decision to discontinue playing in orchestra on the collegiate level. That influence may be tempered by the participant's perception of the high school director's teaching style. Did a music director's personality or pedagogy influence the decision to quit orchestra after high school?

Did the participant experience what Bennett Reimer called the 'sole prerogative' of the conductor? "When performance group directors ... are directing the music making of students but make all the decisions *for* them, ... those directors are creating, but their students are surely not" (Reimer, 1993, p. 69). Wis (2002) takes Reimer's words seriously when she advocates for a new leadership role for the conductor as "servant-leader."

As critical as they are to one's success, clean conducting, good diagnostic/prescriptive techniques, and the ability to keep the ensemble attentive are only the means to a much greater end. Without a larger goal for the ensemble experience, the conductor relying solely on these tools is, at best, a skillful manager of the musical experience (p. 18).

Wis called for music educators to create ensemble experiences that provide students with the opportunity to not only develop their playing skills but also "their aesthetic sensitivity and artistic intelligence" in an "empowering way" (p. 18). Her suggestions ring of student autonomy and self-motivation when she concluded:

If approached as music education through performance, instead of performance education through music, the ensemble experience can be the venue through which students learn how to perceive what is going on in the music, how to make artistic and creative decisions, and how to sing or play expressively (p. 18).

By examining the role that the teacher played in the high school orchestra experience, I was able to understand various personal and social dynamics that lead to student engagement or disenfranchisement.

Kunter, Frenzel, Nagy, Baumert, and Pekrun (2011) looked at several dimensions of teacher enthusiasm and confirmed the hypothesis that subject enthusiasm (topic-related enthusiasm) and teaching enthusiasm (activity-related enthusiasm) “represent distinct variables in teachers’ perception that covary only moderately” (p. 298).

The two dimensions both showed moderate correlations with other established constructs of teachers’ job experience, but were clearly separable from each other. Moreover, teachers’ subject enthusiasm varied independently of the characteristics of the class taught, whereas their teaching enthusiasm was highest in classes characterized by relatively high enjoyment of mathematics and relatively low levels of disruption (p. 298)

Kuntz (2011) examined the role of band directors in encouraging lifelong participation in music as part of a larger qualitative study. This study found that “although they may not hear it from their directors, there was an awareness of opportunities that were available to them as they transition to adulthood” (p. 29). The students in the study also found that by serving as mentors for younger musicians, they helped create the vision of music as a lifelong process. However, even though presented as a research question from the outset of the study, at no time in the

interviews did the role of the director influence students to either discontinue or continue in music.

Using the Choir Participation Survey II, based on Tinto's Model of Institutional Departure, Sichivitsa (2003) found that several musical and non-musical factors influence choir students' decisions to continue to participate in choir while in college. Musical experience by itself did not have a direct impact on musical intentions but students who were raised in a musical environment and had more positive musical experiences were more likely to feel better about their own musical abilities and to appreciate their own musical experiences. Students who were satisfied with the conductor's professionalism, the level of musical material, and their own performance were more likely to enjoy socializing with members of the choir and conductor (Sichivitsa, 2003). Sichivitsa suggested further research to understand the factors contributing to continuing with formal and/or informal musical activities after high school.

Because teachers are responsible for engaging their students personally and socially in the academic setting, the environment in which they teach and the manner in which they teach is very important to student success. The effect that a high school music director had on a participant is difficult to gauge. That students had a positive or negative experience in high school orchestra is easy enough to discover, but understanding the participant's own enjoyment or discomfort with it is an important part of their story. By reviewing literature on director influence, I was able to design research questions and follow-up questions that delved deeper into the relationship between the participants' and their respective directors and how that relationship effected the participants' decision, on a personal and social level, not to continue in orchestra while at university.

### *Socioeconomic Status*

I examined whether enrolling in orchestra, an “extra” class for non-music majors, would have been difficult due to financial constraints. By examining the scholarships that were available to the participants, I could better gauge if and how this influenced their decision to quit playing in orchestra on the collegiate level. I also wanted to know, would enrolling in orchestra create a further financial burden by lengthening the participant’s tenure in university because of the added class?

Finance-related choices “have direct and indirect influences on whether students persist in college” (St. John, Paulsen, and Starkey, 1996). Additionally, “market-based, monetary measures of financial aid, tuition costs, housing costs, and other living costs have a substantial direct effect on persistence” (p. 175). In this study that examined the relationships between college choice and persistence, three results stood out. First, even when all other variables in the study were considered, choosing a college because of low tuition costs was “significantly and negatively associated with persistence” (p. 209). Second, when high-achieving students dropped out of college it was often due to integration issues and financial considerations or a combination of both. Third, available aid was not enough to make it financial feasible to remain enrolled.

We found that when students’ college choices were influenced by finance-related factors, these precollege calculations continued to interact with the way students evaluated their college experience. This suggests that finances are not just an afterthought in the persistence decision, but an integral part of this decision process (p. 211).

Just because a student did not persist through the academic year didn’t mean they were a poor student or failed to integrate socially. In fact, several students in the study met the profile



of “multiple transfer student” (p. 210) – one who is shopping for the best college experience at a price they can afford. When “students made their re-enrollment decisions, they apparently made a mental calculation about whether the quality of their college experiences was worth the cost” (p. 210).

St. John, Paulsen, and Starkey concluded by offering advice to personnel who provide direct services to students.

This study strongly indicates that the combination of prices and costs facing students has made it difficult for students to pay their living costs and continue their enrollment, a situation that may be contributing to the lengthening of time it takes the average student to get a college degree (p. 214).

I examined participants’ financial obligations and scholarship opportunities to establish how these factors affected enrollment in their college orchestra. By compiling survey and interview questions that focused on the social, musical, and socioeconomic reasons that may have influenced participants’ persistence in collegiate orchestra, the study encompassed a more complete picture of the reasons behind their decision to not continue in orchestra.

### ***Narrative Methods***

Because the research methodology focused on narrative analyses of the student participants and their high school orchestra teachers, it was important to establish the foundational questions that would inform the initial surveys and, if needed, the guiding questions for the interviews. Narrative analyses do not reflect a particular reality, but rather a reality is revealed through the story, or stories, being told. The resulting stories are then shared with the influence of the interviewer and in context of the time and place of the interview.

The musical and non-musical factors of retention and attrition can be studied within given confines (e.g. influence of parental musicianship and support in music, previous musical experience, self-concept of musical ability, value of music, academic integration, and social integration) to a certain degree of success (Sichivitsa, 2003). A qualitative methodology, based on narrative analysis, will offer rich, detailed, and robust findings. “Qualitative research is inquiry aimed at describing and clarifying human experience as it appears in people’s lives” (Polkinghorne, 2005, p. 137). Narrative researchers collect stories (and may collect other data as well) about lived experiences that can be co-constructed by the researcher and participant (Riessman, 2008). Because of the close interactions of the researcher and participant, a strong sense of collaboration can result from narrative research (Creswell, 2013). Participants may share stories about past and current experiences as well as plans for future ones. Because of this, narrative research stories are shaped into a chronology by the researcher to make temporal sense of it all (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000).

There are several possible interpretive frameworks that can be utilized within qualitative research. For this study, I utilized a social constructivism interpretive framework.

In social constructivism, individuals seek understanding of the world in which they live and work. The goal of research, then, is to rely as much as possible on the participants’ views of the situation. Rather than starting with a theory, inquirers generate or inductively develop a theory or pattern of meaning (Creswell, 2013, pp. 24-25).

Narrative analyses, in effect, do not reflect a reality, but rather a reality is revealed through the story being told. Narratives “have enormous power to shape reality” (Spector-Mersel, 2010, p. 208). Spector-Mersel refers to the interview as “inviting” life stories from

participants. The resulting stories are then shared with the influence of the interviewer and in context of the time and place of the interview.

### **Summary**

The present study was designed to examine why high-achieving orchestra students from suburban high schools do not continue to participate in music at the collegiate level, and discover the personal and social reasons behind that decision. The study also sought to identify if and how the students continue to make music. Past research has demonstrated that several factors have influenced student motivation and persistence in college and in music studies. By better understanding the factors that may have influenced a student's decision to quit participation in orchestra on the collegiate level, a more robust background for the guiding questions of the survey and interview questions was established. In the next chapter, the methodology for establishing the narrative is discussed in detail.

## Chapter 3 - Methodology

### Introduction

The purpose of this study was to discover the reasons that led high-achieving orchestral musicians from suburban high schools to discontinue formal participation in collegiate music, specifically in orchestra class. Using narrative analysis, I examined the intrinsic and extrinsic factors that influenced the student's decision to not participate in orchestra. I also sought to understand if and how these former high school musicians continued to make music.

The primary research question was: Why do high-achieving high school orchestral musicians, who had at least six years of training on an instrument, choose not to continue with music study in a collegiate orchestra? I also sought to discover both the social and personal meanings of that decision and how current literature supports these meanings. *Orchestral musician* is defined as a student who played violin, viola, cello or bass in their school string orchestra. *High-achieving* is defined as student musicians who were chosen for district and/or state ensembles (all-state orchestra, for example) and/or were members of a select, audition-only ensemble (such as a youth orchestra or a select ensemble at school).

Sub-Questions that were examined include:

1. How many years of study did the participant have on their orchestra instrument?
2. How did the participant view their high school orchestra experience?
3. What kind of personal and educational relationships did the participant have with his/her high school orchestra teacher?
4. What kinds of opportunities were available for further music study beyond the high school orchestra class?

5. What are the emergent factors that influenced study participants not to continue in collegiate ensembles?

I interviewed three participants who met the qualifications (college-aged, high-achieving high school musician who is not currently playing in an orchestra). A narrative analysis approach was utilized. According to Riessman (2008), when narrative analysis is used, “Particular histories of individuals are preserved, resulting in an accumulation of detail that is assembled into a ‘fuller’ picture of the individual or group” (p. 11). Definitive answers were not sought or expected, but rather the collection of data led to a greater understanding and illustration of why the participants chose to end their participation in orchestra rehearsals on the collegiate level.

### *The Pilot Study*

I formulated questions and piloted the study questions over a period of several weeks prior to the implementation of the pilot study. The pilot study was conducted in the spring of 2014 (See APPENDIX A). For the pilot study, four alumni from the high school orchestra program where I currently teach were used. The pilot study volunteers ranged in ages from 20 to 28 years old and met the requirements as outlined in the research methodology. The interviews were not audio recorded but I scripted the interviews immediately following for future reference. At the end of each interview, I did audio record participant’s exit questions – designed to aid in the refining of the instrument following the pilot.

Minor adjustments were made to clarify language in the questions. Upon listening to the exit questions, and with further research into narrative inquiry, I chose to revise the questions to be open-ended, supporting the methodology of this study.

### *The Participants*

Participants were selected based on recommendations from high school orchestra teachers who are members of the Northeast Kansas Music Educators Association (NEKSMEA) and from professional musicians who teach private lessons in the greater Kansas City metropolitan area. I contacted NEKSMEA orchestra teachers via email and asked them to submit names and contact information of possible study participants (See APPENDIX B). I also contacted area private lesson teachers and sent the same information from APPENDIX B. Due to the close relationships often formed within musical groups, and with the professional knowledge that each of these music educators have about the musical and social attributes of possible study participants, qualified research participants were identified, leading to selection for this study.

Six names were submitted back to me as possible candidates for participation in the study. I sent query emails to all possible candidates and to their high school orchestra teachers. Five of the possible candidates responded to the initial email stating that they would participate in the study. An Initial Survey (see APPENDIX C) was sent to the five possible candidates. Of these five, three participants submitted the Initial Survey. All three candidates met the requirements of the study and were chosen for participation.

Once research participants had been identified, I contacted each via email and/or phone call. During that communication, I explained the purpose of the study, the time constraints involved, the Institutional Review Board policies and procedures, and gave the participant an opportunity to refuse participation in the study. Phone calls were used to follow up on emails and to confirm interview times. Since self-reporting can be troublesome, the use of both the

initial email query and the Initial Survey gave me an opportunity to crosscheck responses from both instruments.

Next, I contacted each participant's high school orchestra teacher via email messages and phone calls. During the initial contact with each participant's orchestra teacher, I sought permission to conduct an interview with the orchestra teacher so as to triangulate the findings from the participant. The interviews of the participants and orchestra teachers took place over the course of two weeks, December 16, 2014 through December 30, 2014. The interviews were held at various public venues in the Kansas City metropolitan area. The follow up questions found in APPENDIX D were used for the participants while the questions in APPENDIX E were used for the orchestra teachers.

### ***Data Collection***

Data was collected via personal interviews with participants and their high school orchestra teachers between December 16, 2014 and December 30, 2014. Using a Zoom H1 Handy Recorder, along with an iPhone 5 with a recording app for backup, the interviews were digitally recorded and transferred to a password protected archival site (DropBox). Each interview was transcribed using Microsoft Word in preparation of the initial narratives and data analysis.

I began each interview by asking the participants to tell their (or their former student's) story, revealing the decision to not continue playing in college orchestra. As little guidance as possible was provided so as to not lead the interviewee and create a natural unfolding of each story. Following the participant's story, I followed with the research questions (See Appendix A) to clarify points as needed. Special care was taken to use open-ended questions so as to get as many rich, detailed stories as possible (See Appendix D).

Upon completion of the interview, I summarized each interview into a narrative and shared it with the participant via email for member checking. Each participant was asked to provide feedback for the narrative and return it to me within two weeks. All edited narratives were returned by February 15, 2015.

Due to the constructs of narrative analysis, which require that the researcher be an active participant (a *filter* of sorts), it was important that the participants have an opportunity to edit the narratives and provide feedback to guarantee that each participant's story was as accurate to their experience as possible. I did not seek one singular *truth*, but rather each participant's truth about the decision to not continue playing in college orchestra. By using the stories of their high school orchestra teachers, along with their Initial Survey and email communications, I was able to triangulate information and form a chronological story about each participant's decision to not continue playing in their university orchestra.

### ***Data Analysis***

The primary research question was: Why do high-achieving high school orchestral musicians, who had at least six years of training on an instrument, choose not to continue with music study in a collegiate orchestra? The current study was informed by the data analysis and representation techniques as suggested by Creswell (See Table 3.1) (Creswell, 2013, pp. 191-192).



**Table 3.1 – Data Analysis and Representation**

Data Organization	Create and organize files for data
Reading, Memoing	Read through text, make margin notes, form initial codes
Describing the data into codes and themes	Describe the story or objective set of experiences and place it in a chronology
Classifying the data into codes and themes	Identify stories; locate epiphanies; identify contextual materials
Interpreting the data	Interpret the larger meaning of the story
Representing, visualizing the data	Present narration focusing on process, theories, and unique and general features of the life

(Creswell, 2013, pp. 190-191)

Because it fit the particular needs of this study, and because I found no other study examining high school to college instrumental music attrition using a qualitative narrative analysis, I used Riessman’s (2008) adaptation of William Labov’s structural coding (based on his seminal 1972 work in linguistics) to analyze the data. Using Robichaux’s (2003) expansion of Labov’s coding, I was able to establish a structural analysis of the narrative that reinforced the thematic analysis. This helped establish triangulation (see Coding Categories section below for more detailed information).

I coded each participant’s narrative along with that of his or her high school orchestra teacher. Coding was supported by the use of NVivo software. Fact-checking of responses from the initial survey along with answers from the participants’ narrative and that of their high school director’s narrative allowed for a more robust and reliable narrative analysis. Definitive answers were not be sought or expected, but rather the collection of data led to a greater understanding and illustration of why the research participants chose to end their participation in orchestra on the collegiate level.

## *Coding Categories*

So that this study may be replicated in the future, I used Riessman's (2008) adaptation of William Labov's structural coding (based on his seminal 1972 work in linguistics) for data analysis. Riessman describes her coding system thusly:

The codes display my reading of the *function* of a particular *clause* in the overall structure of the narrative: does it carry the action forward (CA), comment on the meaning of an event for the narrator (EV), and provide information about setting and characters (OR), or resolve the narrative (RE)? (p. 89)

An example of a dissertation that adapts Labov's coding system to great effect is that of Catherine Robichaux (2003). Robichaux wanted to "understand and describe the practices of expert critical care nurses when they face moments of ethical conflict" (Riessman, p. 90).

Robichaux's research illustrates how a structural analysis of narrative can reinforce a thematic analysis, achieving triangulation. In this instance, content and form worked in tandem to accomplish nurses' communicative aims (p. 91).

Table 3.2 offers insight into the coding process that was adapted for the current study. I constructed thematic and structural elements from each narrative analysis. Then the participants' narratives were compared and the thematic and structural elements were reinforced and triangulated.

**Table 3.2 – Coding Example from the Current Study**

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Definitions</i>	<i>Examples From Interviews</i>
Abstract (AB)	Summarizes point of the narrative	I felt like no matter how hard you went out of your way to help him, there just wasn't a lot of shown gratitude...
Orientation (OR)	Provides time, place, situation, participants	When we were at State Contest...
Complicating action (CA)	Describes sequence of actions, turning point, crisis, problem	...he essentially destroyed a girl's cello
Evaluation	Narrator's commentary on complicating action	I just got the impression from him that he really didn't even care...
(CA)		I got involved with the music store and this other girl and the other girl's director
(EV)		...it put me in a really uncomfortable position to go to bat for him
(CA)		I actually saw the whole thing happen, and, you know, there was fault on many levels
Resolution (RE)	Resolves plot	We eventually got it worked out, but, you know, it put me in a tight spot...
Coda	Ends narrative; returns listener to the present	...he might even, deep down inside, been extremely grateful, you know? But he just never showed it.

(Narrative Analysis 4.78, Adapted from Riessman, 2008, p. 92)

### ***Validation***

Riessman (1993) outlined four ways to approach validation in narrative work that will be used in this study. First is persuasiveness. Is the interpretation “reasonable and convincing?” (p. 65) Persuasiveness is strongest when not only are the theoretical claims supported with evidence

from the narrative but also when alternative interpretations are considered. I used triangulation of several sources to strengthen the persuasiveness of the narrative. Correspondence, taking results back to those studied, is the second form of validation. I gave participants the opportunity to examine correspondence throughout the study, particularly after the initial survey and during the participant's editing of their own narrative.

The third approach to validation is that of coherence. Riessman cites Agar and Hobbs' (1982) three kinds of coherence: global, local, and themal, and states that for an interpretation to be valid, coherence should reach all three levels.

Investigators must continuously modify initial hypotheses about speakers' beliefs and goals (global coherence) in light of the structure of particular narratives (local coherence) and recurrent themes that unify the text (thematic coherence). Interpretation of meaning is constrained by the text in important ways, offering a check on ad hoc theorizing. (Riessman, 1993, p. 67)

I used multiple sources to verify self-reported beliefs of the participants. Although veracity was not called into question, it was recognized that global, local, and thematic coherence could change over time and upon contemplation. By using input from orchestra teachers, I triangulated responses from participants, especially in regard to questions of persistence.

The last validation approach is that of pragmatic use. In other words, can the study be used as the basis for someone else's work? Riessman argues that

...we can make it possible for others to determine the trustworthiness of our work by (a) describing how the interpretations were produced, (b) making visible what we did, (c) specifying how we accomplished successive transformations, and (d) making primary data available to other researchers. (p. 68)

By following the validity protocols as outlined here, I ensured that that the study is not only replicable but also meaningful to researchers in the future.

### *Summary*

Through a narrative analysis of each participant's story of why they chose to discontinue participation in orchestra class at the university level, the participant's story unfolded. By inviting participants to share their stories, I placed those stories in context to the time and place of each individual's experience. Those narratives were analyzed as a complete unit, paying close attention to the reality that is fashioned during the creation of those stories – stories that did not exist prior to this research.

Each participant's experiences and thoughts about those experiences informed their personal narrative. In Chapter 4, each participant's story is examined in detail, along with a coding analysis that establishes coherence globally, locally, and themally, to establish a valid interpretation. In Chapter 5, I give conclusions and offer recommendations for future research.

## Chapter 4 - Participant Narratives

This chapter reveals how the three participants viewed the experiences that led them to decide to not participate in orchestra on the collegiate level. The narrative of each participant, constructed by me from the transcription of each interview and member-checked by the participant, is provided in its entirety. Narrative analysis sought to clarify the reasons for not participating in college orchestra. I sought to understand the relationships between those experiences and the collective themes that occurred among the participants.

### *Bernadette's Story*

*“There was a tipping point, I think, my junior year in high school where all of a sudden music wasn't too fun anymore because it got to be too much of a chore.” ~ Bernadette Ruiz*

Bernadette Ruiz is in her fifth year at a large state university in the Great Plains region. Being soft-spoken, almost shy, when she talks, she rarely makes eye contact during the interview and fidgets often. Her brows furrowing as she contemplates each question. The interview feels almost strained to me, as Bernadette seems to be reliving some very painful memories.

The interview took place over Winter Break in her hometown at a local coffee shop. Bernadette agreed to meet at the coffee shop prior to her departure for a vacation. She smiles often but seems uneasy. After declining a cup of coffee, she told her story about her high school orchestra experience and the reasons she did not participate in orchestra on the collegiate level.

Like most students in public schools, Bernadette began playing a string instrument in the fourth grade, starting on the viola: “My mom really wanted me to play the cello, so she was kind of super angry for the first month until she realized that I was halfway decent at it, and then she let me do it.” Bernadette progressed quickly, advancing easily throughout elementary school,

and was then accepted to participate in the local youth symphony program beginning in the sixth grade:

I feel like I had a natural talent that I never tapped into because from fourth grade when I started viola, I had perfect pitch, and my instructors picked up on it and they would tell my parents, 'Oh, she's got perfect pitch.' And I increased in talent very quickly up until the point when I plateaued because I didn't feel like practicing.

The notion of a 'plateau' is repeated often in the interview in regard to Bernadette's lack of discipline in regard to practicing. Early on in her musical pursuits she relied on her perfect pitch and innate musical skills to get through classroom and rehearsal instruction.

Bernadette developed strong bonds among her peers in the youth symphony program and when she enrolled in the strong orchestra program and International Baccalaureate program at her large suburban high, she also developed strong friendships among her music peers.

Bernadette played in her high school orchestra for four years and auditioned for district and state orchestras, earning placement in each for every year eligible. She studied viola privately as well, estimating that she was spending about eight to ten hours on her instrument each week during her first two years of high school. "Honestly, most of that was the actual rehearsal. It wasn't outside practicing, because I never really practiced outside of class."

Again, the idea that she didn't practice comes to the forefront of the discussion. She emphasizes the role that her peers played in her socialization in the new high school. She wins placement through audition in advanced ensembles, but she brushes those aside. It is almost as though it were *too easy* for her. This is just before she reaches the plateau that she referred to earlier.

As her musical skills developed, time commitments became a bigger issue in Bernadette's life. She remembers a tipping point during her junior year. That was the first time music wasn't fun anymore. "It may have been, and I'm not quite sure, but it may have been because I switched teachers," she says. She switched private viola teachers to an instructor that taught at a local university. She was put into chamber music ensembles with college students and soon felt apprehension about her playing ability: "I started noticing a change [in my colleagues' attitudes], I guess, with the group I was with. They were extremely talented and they were pushed very hard." She went from being with high school students who wanted to play for fun to groups in which the participants were training to be professional musicians. "All of a sudden when I started getting picked on more, which I didn't like, I started realizing that there's a huge music community out there, and I'm probably not near the top." Her tone lowers and she fidgets more as she recounts this particular story.

Bernadette grew more and more discouraged with herself and her prospects in music. She felt pressure from her new viola teacher to perform at higher levels, as well as her peers in the college ensembles. It came as a shock to Bernadette when she realized that she didn't want to make a career out of music. She described it as a *mid-high school crisis*. She had spent the past several years, from middle school onward, under the assumption that she would major in music and continue into a career. Now, in her senior year of high school, she had an internal realization that she wasn't good enough, at least in her own mind, to become a professional musician.

Lessons and ensemble practices at the university took greater tolls on her time and her emotional well-being. She started having mental breakdowns during her lessons: "I would cry in my lessons because I just didn't want to practice anymore." It is unclear if these breakdowns



were due to an actual lack of practice or if she just couldn't produce the demanded results because she hadn't ever learned how to practice properly or because she lacked the skill or aptitude for practicing.

Bernadette was satisfied with her high school orchestra experience and got along with her teacher. She enjoyed the fact that her orchestra was highly awarded and respected regionally as well as nationally. "Mr. Powers may not have been my favorite person in the world, but I was extremely happy with my experience." But the extracurricular demands of the high school orchestra began to wear on her. She enjoyed rehearsing, and socializing with her friends in orchestra, but she grew to resent the extra-curricular activities like concerts and contests. "It was more about the community than it was the music," she says.

She resented the amount of time that the other activities were taking as well. As she progressed to the highest level of the youth symphony program, that too began to take a toll on her. "Youth symphony got to be kind of a chore by the time I got up to the Symphony Orchestra level." It demanded more time commitments. She was being pushed to do more without the social supports she had at her high school. Her parents continued to push the idea that she would major in music and they pressured her to attend rehearsals: "I was almost dragged every weekend to go."

Bernadette's parents had invested a large amount of time and energy into her music. They were very proud of her successes to the extent that her dad volunteered as a music librarian for the youth symphony program and accompanied her to rehearsals every weekend. Bernadette says that when she finally decided to change her college plans her dad was very upset because of the amount of time and money invested in her music career.

She also felt that she had disappointed her parents because she had neglected her other studies in order to concentrate on music: “I wasn’t that good at math. I wasn’t very good at science or English.” She maintained high enough grades to remain eligible for the International Baccalaureate program, but she graduated toward the bottom of her IB cohort.

Her last semester of high school, Bernadette was only remotely engaged in making music. She auditioned for and was accepted into the all-state orchestra, but she quit the youth symphony. She was often tardy to her first hour orchestra class. However, by the end of high school, she considered orchestra class as the only class in which she had fun: “We had a lot of talented musicians in our orchestra, but a lot of them didn’t take themselves very seriously, which Mr. Powers wasn’t really fond of. But I thought it was hilarious, because I was a bit of a nincompoop toward the end of high school.” It is interesting that Bernadette’s notion of *fun* involved frustrating Mr. Powers.

When Bernadette applied for and was enrolled at her college, she entertained the thought of enrolling in the university orchestra. But after seeing the practice facilities, the distance she’d have to walk to the music building, and being told by other students that non-music majors were given no scholarship money, she didn’t audition. She thought that she would be given money to play in college for no other reason than she was good at playing the viola: “I had this preconceived notion if I audition for them they’ll give me money even if I don’t do anything with it.”

She took her viola with her for her first semester of college. It stayed under her bed the entire time. She begged her parents to allow her to sell it to help cover tuition, but her parents refused. “My dad has some idea that I’ll have a mid-life crisis when I’m forty or fifty and start playing again.” But when asked if she’ll ever play the viola again, she took a big breath and

replied, “Never.” After a pause, she continued: “I see myself coming back to other forms of music.” She has a guitar that she’s wanted to learn and she plays piano. Upon closer examination, though, her guitar isn’t with her at college either. “I don’t really even listen to classical music because I’ve had enough of it for so many years.”

Bernadette attended counseling sessions early in college. The counselor wanted to hear more about the viola and the tearful episodes. She resisted talking about it any further: “I was like, ‘Hey, this is a one-time thing.’ I think a lot of it was anger. I was very frustrated, and when I picked it up and it was almost like I couldn’t play it any more, since it had been several years and my hands were locked up and I couldn’t do anything.” Bernadette is almost defensive about it as she finished her story and changed the subject.

When asked whether she has anything to add to what she’s said about her music experiences, she takes a moment to reflect. “This emotional drain on top of the school (university) not providing any incentives. I just didn’t have any time to be in the orchestra.” When asked again if she would never play the viola again, she said “Possibly, because I do remember picking it up two summers ago and I didn’t cry that time.” She smiles and fidgets with her hands when encouraged to consider it. “I guess it’s a huge transition,” she says, “from high school to college, you know, and that makes it very easy to drop something, if that’s...that’s what college life decides for you. That’s what happens.” But college life hadn’t made that decision for Bernadette. She had chosen it during her senior year in high school.

### ***Reflections on Bernadette’s Story***

Several themes recurred throughout Bernadette’s story. The first was almost as if she is an actor outside of herself, carried through circumstances not of her own making or choosing. From the beginning, having perfect pitch, it seems as though a music career is chosen *for* her, not

by her. Bernadette's parents and teachers, supporting what they perceived as her innate abilities, created an expectation for her that fell apart over the course of a few years. The amount of practice time dedicated to her viola could not equal the amount of innate ability she felt she possessed. It was not clear if her frustration was due to lack of ability or her preference to not practice. Her burnout was marked by frustration at herself and a hindrance of desire.

Bernadette's dichotomous relationship with her parents was the second recurring theme. That her parents were very proud and supported her musical endeavors there can be no doubt. However, there was an expectation, whether overtly stated or implied, that Bernadette would major in music. Bernadette stated that when she decided not to major in music, her parents became upset because they had provided so much time and support, she was neglecting her talent, and she had let the other academic areas suffer. Interestingly, her parents viewed music as being isolated from the core curricular areas, as if the other academics would not be required as a solid foundation for a major in music as well.

It is Bernadette's relationship with her father that seemed especially poignant. He reacted angrily when she chose not to pursue music and wanted to sell her viola. It's as though he wished that his daughter would reconsider her decision and held out hope that she will play her viola again one day.

It is interesting that Bernadette reacted defensively to the counselor's request to explore the episode where she tried to play the viola and cried. There was a sense in the interview that she still felt very proud of her musical accomplishments in high school. That is the paradox with Bernadette and her music.

That Bernadette was extremely talented as a musician is a fact. Becoming so frustrated she quit all participation in music, including listening to classical music, is also a fact.

Somewhere between those extremes, though, is the camaraderie that Bernadette felt for her orchestra peers in her high school program. At the end of high school, having quit private lessons and dropping out of youth symphony and all extra-curricular orchestra activities, she felt connected to her friends in her high school orchestra. Although her friends thought very highly of her musical achievements, it was the relationships and friendships she maintained in orchestra, she counted as her greatest success. Bernadette had quit most of her music activities by the end of high school, citing an emotional withdrawal. She could have taken other electives, but chose to stay in the school orchestra: “High School orchestra became kind of like an oasis, kind of, where I just went there to have fun and not really care about music itself any more. It was more about the community more than it was the music, so that was kind of a relief.”

### ***Mr. Powers’ Story about Bernadette***

Derrick Powers was Bernadette Ruiz’s high school orchestra teacher. Bernadette transferred into the high school her freshman year to take advantage of the International Baccalaureate program, so there was no familiarity prior to that. Normally he would’ve been concerned about her level of ability, but he remembers her as coming into the program already playing at a very high level. He described his relationship with her as more of a coach/conductor rather than a strings teacher. “She already came to me as a great, fine, advanced player.”

Mr. Powers remembers Bernadette as a very serious student, both in orchestra program and in the rigorous academic setting of the high school’s International Baccalaureate program. Bernadette was very good in math and science and he felt sure that she was going to major in engineering or some kind of science-based field. He is also sure that she could’ve played in any college orchestra she chose. He recalls that Bernadette studied with a local viola teacher of

whom he thinks very highly. He also remembers that she was going to attend the local, urban university.

Mr. Powers felt that it was a pity that Bernadette did not continue playing in orchestra. The fact that the local university didn't offer a non-music major orchestra might have been one of the possible reasons Bernadette chose to not continue in music. In fact, the interview takes a sudden turn as he talks about his disdain at the lack of orchestral offerings for highly skilled players who don't want to major in music. He believes that if more universities offered non-major orchestra opportunities, students like Bernadette would still be playing and probably after college as well. Mr. Powers feels that because of the strict enforcement of the music major curriculum at the university, Bernadette was forced to choose between having to major in music to continue to play or quit playing to pursue her science degree. Lamenting the fact that most colleges and universities put their orchestra rehearsals at a time when most non-music students can't attend, he cited a college orchestra program where a good friend of his is the conductor, that rehearses in the evenings twice a week. "Whoever's best gets in, and as long as they agree to the commitment, they're good," he says. He believes that most state schools *drop the ball* in this regard. Mr. Powers encourages his students who are interested in majoring in something other than music to attend liberal arts colleges, as those institutions are apt to have a much more lenient requirement for placement in the orchestra.

But Mr. Powers doesn't remember encouraging Bernadette to look into these liberal arts colleges. He suspects that there was some pressure from Bernadette's parents that she get a degree in the sciences so she could get a good job. Not remembering ever meeting Bernadette's parents, he wonders if this was because Bernadette transferred into the school from another area,

or if her parents were immigrants. Bernadette may have been told she had to get a job in a medical or engineering field in order to meet her parents' definition of success.

Mr. Powers remembers Bernadette as being very serious about her music and studies. "She was quiet and shy." He recalls her as energetic, committed, but very solemn. "She was not one to push back if I teased her or joked around with her." Although he knew she had many friends in orchestra, he doesn't remember her as a student who let her social dealings, such as talking out of place, interfere with rehearsal. This is fascinating due to the fact that Bernadette referred to herself as a "nincompoop" for how she behaved in class. "I think we had a strong mutual respect for one another. She was certainly respected by her peers and they admired her playing ability." He wonders if she was "overly serious" about her music and that she just didn't enjoy making music as much as other students. Again, the differences in Mr. Powers' and Bernadette's recollections come to the forefront. She remembers encouraging her friends to act out in class to frustrate Mr. Powers. Mr. Powers remembers her as quiet and shy.

Mr. Powers says that he often hears from alumni who talk about the highly charged emotional moments during their experience in high school orchestra and isn't sure if Bernadette ever felt that way. "She was a great player, but I wonder if she truly loved making music," he says, offering this anecdote to illustrate Bernadette's seriousness. He describes it as the "goose bumps" moment, when a piece of music that the orchestra is rehearsing speaks to the students on a deeply emotional level. "I don't remember her talking about feeling that 'gush' particularly," he says.

Mr. Powers estimates that, all told, Bernadette was playing her viola upwards of twenty hours a week her first three years of high school. "She took part in some summer chamber music events and was part of the local youth symphony program." He also remembers that after

making the all-state orchestra her senior year, she quit private lessons, and decided that she wasn't going to play anymore. Although this is before she went to college, he blames the universities' bias against non-music majors earning scholarships to play in the orchestra. "That notion of you can be a musician for life is one thing, then again, these schools don't provide opportunities for these kids," he says.

### ***Reflections on Mr. Powers' Story about Bernadette***

Mr. Powers' thoughts on Bernadette run between two themes. The first is that she was an overly serious student who didn't connect emotionally with the music like many of her peers. The second is that, because of her seriousness and commitment to a rigorous academic program, the university that she chose to attend failed to provide Bernadette with a musical outlet in which she could participate. "Losing a kid like Bernadette, I always feel like it's a loss at most of the colleges," he says.

Mr. Powers lamented the fact that he never really knew what happened with Bernadette after high school. "She wasn't someone to share. I'd be very curious to know how she remembers her high school orchestra experience." He hoped that she has moved on to become a more sophisticated consumer of classical music, someone who supports music and the arts in her community. He smiled and said, "You know, she could tell her kids [one day], 'I loved orchestra; you need to play too!'" He noted that he spent his life making music and being involved in music. It's what he hoped for Bernadette, too.

### ***Contributing Factors That Led Bernadette To Not Continue In College Orchestra***

It is interesting that Bernadette's and Mr. Powers' recollections of her experiences in high school are so different. Mr. Powers obviously perceived Bernadette's situation differently than



she did. Or it may be due to the fact that he never fully understood her particular point of view. It does not detract, however, and it is apparent that the overarching storyline of Bernadette's experiences in high school are corroborated in part by Mr. Powers' narrative.

### ***Intrinsic Factor - Persistence***

Bernadette knew from the beginning of college, probably more likely in the middle of her senior year in high school, that she was not going to play in her college orchestra. Thomas (2000) found that students performed better academically and persisted better when social ties outside their peer group existed. Thomas's findings suggest that universities and colleges should develop activities that enhance student connectedness across diverse populations with opportunities for connecting emerging student leaders (p. 609). But the lack of financial incentives, and the opinions of her peers that had been in the university orchestra, influenced Bernadette's decision to quit playing.

Bernadette struggled with the fact that in order to continue playing in college she would have to overcome what she came to view as insurmountable obstacles. She would be forced to find time in her schedule for orchestra rehearsals. The music building was a long walk from her dorm. Her peers who had been in the university orchestra spoke of the time commitments and the fact that it was worth only one credit hour, for which she would have to pay tuition. And, finally and most brutally honest, she didn't want to practice. All of these things, she said, contributed to her decision to not play in the college orchestra (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.1).

The fact that Bernadette *did* look into the possibility of earning scholarships for playing in the college orchestra is an important factor to consider. She was open to the possibility, at least on a cursory level that she might play in the college orchestra if there were financial

rewards for it. It is fascinating that her friends who were not playing in the college orchestra, but who had played either in high school or college previously chose to discourage her from participating in the orchestra. The university did not help the situation with the lack of scholarships for non-music majors, something that Mr. Powers was convinced could have been a factor in her decision to not play in college. Although, it should be noted that Mr. Powers thought that she was attending a different university from the one she actually attends (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.2).

In 1986 researchers found that extracurricular involvement and informal contact with faculty is important and that the “the influence of orientation on students’ initial integration into the campus social system is manifest more in extent of involvement than in quality or impact of involvement” (Pascarella, Terenzini, and Wolfe, p. 170). Bernadette’s experiences with pre-college orientations for orchestra consisted of discussions with upper classmen who had experience auditioning for the orchestra at her university and through minimal contact with the music department. The discussions with her peers from the university orchestra proved to be very formative and shaped her later perceptions of the collegiate orchestra experience:

Bernadette visited the university and looked at the dorms. The dorms had a quiet hours policy and she knew she couldn’t practice in her room. She noticed that the music building was a long walk across a very big campus. During her visit she talked with friends who were in the university orchestra, or had been previously, and they spoke of the long hours of rehearsals for only one credit hour. Bernadette was already tired of the time commitments viola playing had placed on her. When she found out that non-music majors were not given any financial assistance, she just couldn’t see herself committing

to playing in the orchestra. Her burnout was complete (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.3).

Johnson (2007) examined the efficacy of high school education on persistence and graduation rates at a public research university and demonstrated that the academic quality of a high school relates directly to persistence (p. 791). Bernadette’s high school experience was marked by her intentions to attend a school that had high academic standards and programs (in this case the International Baccalaureate program) as well as an outstanding orchestra program. It is intriguing that Bernadette’s assessment of her own academic achievements does not agree with the observation of Mr. Powers. Whereas she mentions that she had fallen behind in areas like math and science, Mr. Powers remembers her as being one of the top academic students in the school. “She would have been in the top one percent [of her class],” Mr. Powers recalled during the interview. “I don’t know if she was. Maybe not in the top ten, but certainly twenty-five [in her graduating class]. She was very good in math and science and very high verbal skills,” he said of Bernadette. But Bernadette considered herself a failure in non-music subjects.

Bernadette’s chosen major, at the time she graduated from high school, was engineering. She had devoted so much time to her music studies in her first three years of high school that she felt she was woefully ill prepared for stringent college academics. She worried that she would not have enough time to devote to her studies if she did participate in the university orchestra (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.4).

Bernadette could not see the point in continuing with music in any form if she wasn’t going to major or minor in it. The perceived time demands of the orchestra were too much for her to consider. As with the demands of her high school orchestra and youth symphony, she was stressed by notion that she would be stretched too thin. Music educators, especially high school

directors, need to consider whether we are asking too much of students if this is how they react to the stressors of college orchestra participation.

### ***Intrinsic Factor – Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

The present study examined how participants' self-concepts of musical ability influenced their decision to not continue in orchestra and if their high school orchestra teacher corroborated that view. Did their view of themselves socially and personally match up to that of others? In Bernadette's experience, she initially had a very high self-concept of musical ability, reinforced by the statements of her early teachers and the support of her parents.

Bernadette relied on outside factors to gauge self-concept of musical ability early in her musical studies. She often relied on the seating arrangement of the orchestra to indicate her relative position in regard to other musicians. Often bettering the violists in youth symphony by being placed in the forward section, but not quite as good as the one her sat in front of her. Her self-concept of musical ability was based on her placement within the section and by the literature she played in lessons. If she played a certain solo, she was better than someone who hadn't played it yet. If someone was working on a solo she had yet to play, she yearned to learn it so she could compete with him or her. She lamented the fact that she never practiced, rather relying on her perfect pitch to advance her playing skills. She spoke of a plateau, in which she exhausted her innate talent but never learned to practice in such a way that would advance her playing. And as her innate ability ran out, her self-concept of musical ability began to turn negative. Her voiced filled with regret. "I couldn't tell you where I could have been today," she said in regard to the fact that she didn't like to practice (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.5). Even though she hadn't played the viola in years, the regret is palpable, her self-confidence still fighting to come out yet again.

It is a poignant statement when Bernadette stated wistfully, “I couldn’t tell you where I could have been today.” Even though throughout her initial survey and interview she keeps referring to being “burned out,” it is curious that she thinks about where she *could have been* had she kept playing. Her self-concept of musical ability still tugged at her, reminding her how good she *could* have been. There was a fighting spirit still left inside her. But her dealings with her new private lesson teacher and the peers with which she worked at the local university during her junior year had a profound influence on her self-concept of musical ability by shaking the initial assessments of her early teachers and parents.

Having progressed with relative ease through her early studies, Bernadette was forced to examine her own musical ability when she joined the new viola studio. She had never been in a situation in which she was the weakest player. This was a new experience, one she did not enjoy:

Bernadette grew tired of driving across town, in snowstorms in winter, and during evenings when she could be doing homework or something more important. She began to feel physically sick when she knew she had rehearsals in the evening. Her colleagues grew increasingly less supportive and their comments felt increasingly negative and personal. When her teacher asked her what was going on, she broke down and cried during lessons. She felt as though she couldn’t make it as a professional musician and it frightened her. She had prepared so long for a career in music, and now that those plans were unraveling she didn’t know what to do (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.6). Coupled with the fact that Bernadette never really learned *how* to practice but learned most materials during rehearsal, she was for the first time forced to consider what it would take to be successful at the next level.

As Dweck (2000) uncovered, students' beliefs about their own abilities develop over time, through experiences, and from opinions of others. Sometimes students choose to not pursue an area for which they may be qualified because they feel that they lack ability. Bernadette's beliefs about her ability changed significantly over time; her self-concept of musical ability was positively affected by the statements of her teachers and parents at the beginning of her music studies but as time passed and the challenges of outside ensembles and new viola studio mounted, her self-concept became pessimistic.

Although this is a greatly simplified categorization, students' "beliefs about why they may or may not be successful in various pursuits can influence the extent to which they are likely to invest effort in these pursuits and which in turn affects the level of achievement likely to be experienced" (Rosevear, 2010, p. 17). Bernadette's self-concept of musical ability changed as her perception of her own aptitude changed: she no longer viewed herself as being able to survive on her innate ability – now she had to take risks by practicing, a skill she had yet to hone. But instead of inspiring her to practice harder or differently, she instead chose to not practice at all. The belief that she could not get better through practice influenced her attitude toward music, her desire to take lessons, and continuing in youth symphony. It even led her to put the viola away permanently, seemingly precluding the possibility that she might one day play for sheer enjoyment.

Music educators need to take Bernadette's particular situation to heart, as it most certainly repeated in classrooms across the country. Those responsible for teacher training, especially, need to understand Dweck's discovery and make certain that future music educators foster appropriate supports in relation to the student's stage of development. A healthy dose of

musical supports are needed early in a student's musical training, but the concept of appropriate and deliberate practice skills need to be fostered over time and in incremental steps.

By helping children develop a "positive music self-concept" (Rosevear, 2010, p. 23) early on in their education, negative self-views are less likely to develop and fewer barriers to rewarding musical experiences may arise. Bernadette's experiences are a dichotomy: the early, successful, and overly positive assessments of her elementary and middle school years in which she didn't practice; and the later, highly critical, and less-supportive experiences within the private studio setting during high school. It should be noted that the overly positive and successful experiences, which Rosevear found to be so critical in helping shape rewarding musical experiences later in life, do not sustain Bernadette's self-concept of musical ability. The early successes, earned without the hard work of sustained practice, seem to have little effect on sustaining self-concept of musical ability once pushed into highly competitive experiences. Bernadette had support of her friends. Welch, Himonides, Saunders, Papageorgi, and Sarazin (2014) found that peer relationships "can be a powerful factor in nurturing (or hindering) successful participation and ongoing engagement, a finding related to the social benefit that is also evidenced in adolescent music activity, both in school and elsewhere" (p. 803). Bernadette, it could be argued, found how powerful those peer relationships can truly be on influencing her self-concept of musical ability or even negatively impacting self-confidence.

It is not difficult to see how Bernadette's experiences changed over time as well. It is interesting, though, how much Bernadette relied on her high school orchestra class to get her through the agonizing realization that she was not good enough to pursue music as a career resulting from her private studio. As Kruse (2012) found, high school orchestra can be a safe place in which students discover themselves, whether it be toward or away from continued

participation in music. This observation is developed further in the next section, *Intrinsic Factor - Motivation for Music*.

### ***Intrinsic Factor – Motivation for Music***

In his study of motivation, performance achievement, and music experiences in secondary instrumental students, Schmidt (2005) found a slight increase in scores for intrinsic or mastery orientations for older students while younger musicians tended to score higher on competitive, ego, and failure avoidance orientations. All subjects in the study, on average, agreed that they worked best with other students and placed less emphasis on competitive and ego orientations. Schmidt's results "suggest that students may respond best to the intrinsic or cooperative aspects of instrumental music rather than its extrinsic or competitive aspects" (p. 144). Bernadette's experiences, especially the stark contrasts between what she was feeling about her high school orchestra and her private lesson ensemble, corroborate these findings (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.7).

Bernadette's earliest memories of motivation for music involve the support of her teachers and musical peers. And, whereas she initially did music for "fun" as a younger child, she grew tired of the work required. The positive attitude was further hindered by the lack of positive reinforcement received during private lessons and the competitive attitude of the youth orchestra. She increasingly relied on high school orchestra, and the students in it who chose to participate for a fun, enriching experience with their friends (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.8).

And, although her attitude toward practice challenged what she perceived as the relationship with Mr. Powers, she relied heavily on the relationships among her peers in the high school orchestra. It is in her high school orchestra class that she felt the most comfortable



throughout her high school playing career. It is the friendships formed through music participation that makes school bearable. As she said, “everything really wasn’t fun for me any more besides high school orchestra” (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.9).

In their study of the value of intrinsic rather than traditional achievement goals for public artists, Lacaile, Koestner, and Gaudreau (2007) corroborated the finding that the nature of artistic performance can foster avoidant tendencies due to the regular chance of failure or success in public (Kenny, 2004; Salmon, 1990) and that performance-approach and performance-avoidance goals had a negative effect on persistence and well-being measures (Lacaille, Koestner, and Gaudreau, 2007, p. 254). By the middle of her senior year in high school, Bernadette was beginning to recognize that her intrinsic needs for music making were not being met. She actively avoided situations in which she would be criticized while making music (private lessons and out-of-school ensemble rehearsals). She also actively sought out the only place in which she felt safe to create music: her high school orchestra class.

Perhaps the most disturbing finding in regard to her motivation for music was Bernadette’s statement that she “never” wished to play her viola again. In her narrative, Bernadette described picking up her viola a few years after high school and bursting into tears upon trying to play it. After having already decided to not continue to play in the university orchestra, she considered herself emotionally detached from the notion of playing the viola again. Bernadette could not articulate why she started to cry; it’s almost as if she’s reliving a traumatic experience. When she recounted this experience to her counselor and the counselor wants to explore it more, Bernadette immediately dismissed the possibility. She insisted it was a singular incidence without a deeper meaning. But acknowledging the anger that she felt toward

the end of high school and how she could no longer listen to classical music, she categorized the feelings as being burned out (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.10).

Bernadette’s high school orchestra became her source of solace late in her narrative. It should be shared that her high school orchestra does not *seat* orchestra members in a competitive manner; rather the seating is rotated on a weekly basis. Bernadette never explicitly mentioned Mr. Powers’ practice of rotating seating or his belief that all members of the orchestra should be contributing members of the educational environment. But if this practice, as Schmidt (2005) found, intrinsically satisfied her motivation for music making, it would explain the connection with her high school program.

Contrastingly, Mr. Powers worried that Bernadette lacked an emotional connection to music making while in the high school orchestra. It was one of the more passionate moments during the interview, as he explained his concern. “Bernadette never really felt the ‘gush’ of the music.” When they would perform a piece like the finale to Sibelius Symphony No. 2, most students would react very passionately to the music. He could never tell if Bernadette was feeling the same rush of emotions (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.11).

Bernadette confirmed that she enjoyed her experience in high school orchestra, but her evaluation of that time comes from a social interactive view. Mr. Powers evaluation of her experience stemmed from observations of visual indicators of emotional value. Both evaluations can be said to be *real*, but only to each participant’s own consideration.

### ***Extrinsic Factor – Parental Musicianship and Support in Music***

Although Bernadette never spoke of her parents as being *stage parents*, they were very involved in her music making from the beginning. Her mother seemed to have been more focused on Bernadette’s possible musical career aspirations while her father was invested

emotionally in his daughter's music studies. Several episodes from the interview illustrate this view.

From the beginning of Bernadette's viola studies, her mother is more concerned with what *she* wanted for Bernadette rather than what Bernadette wanted for herself. At first her mother was angry that Bernadette chose viola over cello. At least until "She realized I was halfway decent at it, and then she let me do it." Soon after her mother began receiving positive reports from Bernadette's early music teachers she constructed these into career prospects for her daughter. Late in high school when Bernadette experienced the *burn out*, her mother became upset until one of Bernadette's teachers planted the idea that Bernadette could go into engineering. Her mother had a much different reaction. Her mother turned her attention to the engineering idea and became very supportive of that career choice (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.12).

Bernadette's father took her quitting the viola especially hard. He had supported his daughter through every stage of musical development, e.g. paying for her private lessons, enrolling her in extra-curricular musical activities, and spending weekends with his daughter at youth symphony. So it is not surprising that when Bernadette wanted to sell her viola to pay for college tuition, he reacted angrily. In the midst of her parents' concern, Bernadette appeared to consider it a distraction. She almost laughed when she said her father expected her to have a midlife crisis and want to play the viola again later in life (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.13). It was apparent that even if Bernadette didn't hold out hope of making music in the future, he father did.

Mr. Powers' narratives did not include any anecdotal references to the part played by Bernadette's parents other than the absence of their involvement in the high school program. He

did not have any recollection of meeting the parents. As far as he knew, it could have been because the family was not from the region surrounding the high school's attendance area (Bernadette was a transfer student) or because Bernadette's family was of a different nationality.

Musical development in children is often enhanced a high level of parental involvement over a long period of time. When Dai and Schader (2002) examined "parents' expectancy beliefs and values regarding their child's music training, regular academic work, and athletic activities" (p. 135) they found that parents seek out musical training for their child for the general educational value derived from the pursuit and not for the development of musical talent. But, as the child develops into a more advanced player, parents alter their beliefs and values (p. 135). Bernadette's parents seem to exemplify this statement.

Bernadette's parents, especially her father, supported her musical studies and afforded her several opportunities for musical growth. Her father was heavily involved in her participation with music, spending weekends with his daughter at youth symphony rehearsals. As Bernadette grew into an advanced player, her parents, especially her mother, saw it as a career opportunity and pushed her to pursue her music studies. Dai and Schader found that "parents with high achievement values in music tend to have biased expectancy beliefs in favor of their children" (p. 142). It was noted that this correlation increased with age and more years of musical training. However, Dai and Schader point out that "achievement of eminence is not the major criterion for success in music for this group of parents as reported in a separate study that focused on the intrinsic and extrinsic aspects of motivation underlying parental support" (p. 143). It is possible, they theorize, that parents see less difference between ability/talent and motivation/effort than their children do.

Perhaps Bernadette's parents focused on the talent of their daughter to the extent that when her motivation began to wane, upon entering her "burned out" phase, they began to struggle with their own beliefs about their daughter's career aspirations. It is fascinating that Bernadette's mother was quick to support her daughter's decision to quit once an engineering major became her focus. And yet her father held out hope that his daughter might one day play her viola again. There is a touch of bitter sweetness when she talked about her father's belief that Bernadette will have a mid-life crisis that leads back to playing her viola.

### ***Extrinsic Factor – Director Influence***

Bernadette certainly had respect for Mr. Powers as did he for her. Mr. Powers felt that Bernadette lacked the emotional connection to the music that they studied and Bernadette felt that Mr. Powers was someone who had to be endured in order for her to enjoy the social aspects that the high school orchestra offered her. He was the gatekeeper to the world in which she felt safe; being in charge of the high school orchestra she had to follow his rules in order to be a part of it. In the end, it was the environment created by Mr. Powers in the classroom that Bernadette appreciated most. There, in the orchestra room, she was able to enjoy the company of her friends. Bernadette saw orchestra as a fun, safe place to make music with her friends (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.14).

However, Mr. Powers remembered her differently. He recalled her as a gifted musician who came to high school well prepared musically. But he also remembers her as being overly serious and not having much of a lighter side. His role within her musical life was peripheral as he described it. She gained her musical training outside of his orchestra. In his program, she was well respected, by both the other students and Mr. Powers. Because he had a limited influence on her elementary and middle school training, he felt that there was more emotional

distance between Bernadette and him than there were between students whom he had taught early in their training (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.15).

As can be seen in Table 4.14, Bernadette enjoyed her high school experience because of the talent level of the musicians in her orchestra program. But she also enjoyed the fact that it seemed to frustrate Mr. Powers. She referred to herself as a “nincompoop,” recalling how she enjoyed seeing Mr. Powers struggling to maintain composure in rehearsals. How Bernadette saw herself and her role in the orchestra program and how Mr. Powers viewed her must be viewed through two different lenses. Throughout the interview, Bernadette speaks highly of her high school experience, focusing on the social aspects on it. She rarely mentions Mr. Powers. And when she does mention him, it is in relation to the stressors that she is feeling outside of the outside program. When he confronted her about her chronic tardiness to first hour orchestra class, she made excuses rather than telling him what was really happening (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.16).

Because teachers are responsible for engaging their students personally and socially in the academic setting, the environment in which they teach and the manner in which they teach is very important to student success. Teacher involvement and motivation is central to students’ experiences in the classroom (Skinner and Belmont, 1993). In their study on reciprocal effects of teacher behavior, Skinner and Belmont found that “teacher provision of both autonomy support and optimal structure predicted children’s motivation across the school year,” and that “students who are behaviorally disengaged receive teacher responses that should further undermine their motivation” (p. 571).

Mr. Powers was engaged with his students, as evidenced by his narrative about the emotional “gush” he and many of his students felt while making music. Bernadette was not

engaged with Mr. Powers, and so it was difficult to gauge the overall effect he had on her decision to not continue playing in college. That she had a positive experience in high school orchestra was easy enough to discover, especially in regard to the social supports that she received from her orchestra peers toward the end of her time in high school. But understanding Bernadette's own enjoyment or discomfort with it because of Mr. Powers was very difficult to determine with any amount of certainty.

### ***Extrinsic Factor – Socioeconomic Status (SES)***

Bernadette mentions the financial burden of taking piano *and* viola lessons at the very beginning of her interview. Soon after she began viola she had to quit piano lessons because paying for both was too expensive for her parents. And, although she doesn't plainly say so, there is a notion that if she had been offered scholarship money to play in college, she would have availed herself of that opportunity. As it were, she opted to not continue after hearing from friends that she would not qualify for scholarships because she wasn't majoring in music.

She wanted to sell her viola to help pay for college tuition and her parents grew very defensive. Bernadette wanted to sell the viola because she never saw herself playing it again. She also may have really needed the money to pay for tuition. Either way, her parents refused to consider that option.

Mr. Powers did not know the family well enough to gauge if there were financial burdens at home. However, he rails against the university system for not providing scholarships to talented students like Bernadette. In fact, several minutes of the interview were taken up with Mr. Powers decriing the fact that so many universities do not have non-music major ensemble opportunities and non-music major scholarships for his students (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.17).

### *Assessing the Factors in Bernadette's Experiences*

All the intrinsic and extrinsic factors studied played a part in Bernadette's decision to quit playing in orchestra on the university level. Some factors were obviously more influential while some were only mentioned in the survey and interviews. Bernadette's decision to quit was a culmination of several factors that led to what she repeatedly called "burn out." It was an exhaustion of her emotional well-being, exacerbated by the switch in her private teachers. Although she liked her new teacher, it was the small ensembles in which the studio practiced that increased her discontent.

She admitted that she did not practice outside of school or lessons, relying instead on her natural talent. This was a recurring theme throughout her development. It is as though her natural ability, her perfect pitch, led her to believe that music study would be easy. She was never taught to practice, or if she was, she never learned how to practice effectively. Eventually her natural talent wasn't enough for the high expectations of the new studio. Her peers grew unsatisfied with her level of performance and began to criticize her level of commitment.

Having been told how talented she was since the fourth grade, this sudden realization that she *wasn't* as good as she herself believed, led to an emotional crisis – a "mid-high school crisis" in her own words. Unfortunately, this crisis resulted in an abandonment of her music studies. Ultimately, in the end, it was the social structure of the high school orchestra that became a reprieve. Sadly, her conviction that she will never play the viola again seems to be stronger than her desire to participate in a musical ensemble, even to the chagrin of her father. It would be fascinating to discover, five or ten years from now, if she indeed never played her viola again.



### ***Maria's Story***

*"I felt like if I turned it into a career, I might lose that enjoyment. I felt like if I went a different route, I could always have my music. Because I'd always continue playing and I can't lose that. No one can take it away from me."*

*~ Maria Stokes*

Maria Stokes is a junior at a private Jesuit university in a large city in the Great Lakes region. She is vivacious and talks very quickly, almost excitedly about her experience in high school orchestra. She played bass in a large suburban high school in the Kansas City area. As the interview begins, I cannot help but notice that the journalist in her is shining through as she very carefully chooses the right words to describe the experiences that led her to discontinue participation in orchestra on the collegiate level.

Maria's fondest memories of orchestra almost always center on her relationship with her teacher, Devin Sanders. Mr. Sanders was her orchestra teacher for her entire middle and high school career, except for her freshman year. And although Mr. Sanders taught her for five years, that one year with a different teacher was nearly as impactful, but not for the same reasons.

Maria began studying the cello in the fourth grade. She quickly excelled on the instrument and her elementary strings teacher suggested that she switch to the bass. By the time she was in middle school, she was good enough technically on the bass to help other students who were switching from another instrument to the bass. She also taught younger students under the supervision of Mr. Sanders. Seventh and eighth grade orchestra was being the impetus for her passion for orchestra. "That's when I developed the idea, 'I want to do this after college. I want to do this the rest of my life.'"

But her freshman year in high school orchestra was a markedly different experience for Maria. The high school director at that time was highly disorganized, disconnected from the

students, and according to Maria, very ineffective: “She just didn’t care.” Maria would often return to the middle school to talk to Mr. Sanders and ask him if he would consider applying for the high school job. “Why can’t you come back and teach us?” she begged him. At the end of Maria’s freshman year, the high school director quit, allowing Mr. Sanders the opportunity to apply for and add the high school position to his middle school responsibilities.

“Mr. Sanders came back and that was probably the best thing that could have happened,” she said. And although Maria was very happy that Mr. Sanders was now teaching the high school program, she knew he faced challenges with the high school students. The previous director had treated orchestra like a study hall: “Nothing was getting done, people were lying around on the ground when she was there. So when he came in and provided structure, the other kids fought back.” She felt bad that Mr. Sanders was forced to deal with students that were antagonistic toward his teaching style. “He had to turn it around and set a strong tone. Otherwise, the kids would walk all over him,” she said. “And I never faulted him for being so stern.” She understood that any transition was going to be difficult, but she grew frustrated with her peers and their lack of dedication to the orchestra program. She knew that the students who had been with the previous teacher would have to graduate before the program would really change. “It was hard, I think, to get everyone to be as passionate [about orchestra] again, but it definitely changed the longer Mr. Sanders was there,” she said.

“My freshman year, I was still really wanting to do music after college,” Maria explained. “I had joined the youth symphony, and by my freshman year I was in the top orchestra. I loved the performances. And I was taking private and group lessons, probably about three hours each week.” And by her sophomore year, she was in the top orchestra at high school and continued teaching private lessons to three younger students. She estimated that she spent

around three hours a day practicing her first two years of high school. “I just loved it,” she said with a smile.

As Maria advanced through high school, different opportunities outside of her music studies became available. “I was one of *those* kids. I can’t say no to anything and I start doing *everything* and I kind of spread myself thin. I did orchestra, I did choir, I was vice president of the student council for all four years. I ran cross country for a year and Mr. Sanders was my coach,” she smiled, explaining “That was an interesting dynamic, having my coach also be my orchestra director.” She began working her freshman year, and by the time she graduated from high school, she was working thirty-five hours a week in addition to her other activities. Her orchestra participation was still important, but she was pulled into other areas that took more of her time.

From the time she started a string instrument in fourth grade, Maria’s parents were extremely supportive of her musical pursuits. “My parents love music although neither of them are musical themselves. My dad was a three-sport athlete [in high school] and he got a full ride scholarship to play tennis [in college]. And then my brother and I come along. So my dad just turned into a stage dad, and loved it all the way. My parents are all about what makes us happy.” So when she decided to discontinue her music in college, she thinks her parents were a little heartbroken. “Now that my brother and I are out of the house, my parents don’t hear all the music and they miss it.” Her dad misses the bass playing, especially the solo pieces that she learned in private lessons. She and her parents are working on a plan that would allow her to take her piano back to college next summer so she can have a little more music in her life. “And every now and then I’m like, ‘I really want a bass, like, can I have a bass?’ But they’re like,

‘Maria, we can’t buy a bass.’” She laughs at the memory but there’s a touch of bitter sweetness to it.

Maria can point to a single incident that changed her mind about majoring in music and playing at the university level. It happened when she went with her brother on a college visit to Chicago early in her high school career. While there they went to see the Chicago Symphony Orchestra. And when she looked at the bass section, she just couldn’t see herself up there. “It was a row of eight men, six feet tall, and probably eighty years old, playing with German bows,” she remembered. “I play French bow. It just hit me. I’m not up there. I couldn’t see myself up there. One, because I’m 4’11” and I play a half-size bass, so it’s harder for me to compete with people who are larger and can play a full-sized instrument and make a completely different sound than me. I know I shouldn’t have let it discourage me because at the end of the day, if I wanted to do it, I wanted to do it.” But Maria had another concern as well. “I feel like it is so hard to making a living doing music. And I didn’t want to teach. I wanted to play.” Soon after this event, she was struck with the idea of becoming a broadcast journalist and that began a new college and career trajectory for her.

During her senior year in high school, Maria made several college visits. She made a visit to a private liberal arts college on the East Coast and fell in love with the communications program but didn’t care for the urban setting of the school. She also visited a private university in the Great Plains region. “Mr. Sanders was like ‘You should go there!’ So I was pretty much set to go there because they have a very informal orchestra where students can just come in and play no matter what major they are.” Unfortunately, the university’s communication program focused on print media and she wanted to major in broadcast journalism. And although Mr.

Sanders encouraged her to attend that particular university, she ultimately chose her current university.

When she visited the private Jesuit university in the Great Lakes region, she had hoped that she would be able to play as a non-major in the orchestra. But the logistics of traveling, without a car, between the two campuses that housed the journalism and music departments was too daunting. Walking four city blocks with a bass, if she could get a bass, was just too much. But the journalism program was exactly what she wanted. So, even though it was a difficult decision, she dropped the idea of a minor in music, although she tried to find musical outlets as often as she could. She remembered going to a friend's apartment last semester and playing his piano. "I sat down and I started playing, and I felt so much better. Just doing all the different things that I memorized. I don't even know how I still have them memorized, but my fingers do," she said. "College is so stressful. And I just get caught up in it and don't even have time to think. I felt so good just playing the music, even though I had so much homework I needed to do and so many videos to edit. I just want to play music for myself, play music when I can."

When pressed to articulate the interactions she had with the schools of music at the three universities that she chose from, Maria remarks that had the East Coast and Great Lakes schools offered a non-major orchestra opportunity, she would've probably kept playing. She is adamant that had the school of journalism of the Great Plains university offered a broadcast journalism degree, she would still be playing in orchestra. At the other two schools, she said, "They were just like, 'You have to minor, this and this and this.'" It is obvious that this was very frustrating for her. "It was hard for me," she says, "because I played the bass. I couldn't just carry it around with me." By her senior year in high school, though, Maria had already decided that she

would be a journalist after graduating from college. Orchestra was something that *might* happen later, but she wasn't focused on that at the time.

Maria recognizes that the skills she learned in orchestra have helped her in her journalism studies. She didn't want to focus on just her music skills. "I wanted to go into journalism. And it's not like I chose a profession that's going to make me more money than music. But I felt like, it just used all my talents and I wasn't restricted to one thing. I'm learning to write, to speak, to work in a group and be a leader, so I could translate that to other things." She is a realist. "But I felt if I only majored in music, then I would only do music."

The fact that Maria doesn't own a bass hasn't kept her from being actively involved in making music when the opportunity arises. As noted earlier, she continues to play piano when she gets the chance, and she looks forward to getting her piano moved to her apartment this summer. She is teaching herself guitar. And she listens to classical music on the local radio station while at university. She especially loves hearing music that she played while in youth symphony. "It's all recognizable and I love it," she says. "I just don't want music to be my job," she said in closing. "I love just playing for myself and for my own enjoyment because I get so much out of it. I felt like if I turned it into a career, I might lose that enjoyment. I felt like if I went a different route, I could always have my music. Because I'd always continue playing and I can't lose that. No one can take it away from me."

### ***Reflections on Maria's Story***

Maria is an interesting subject in that her passion and inspiration for music stems from her early interactions with her orchestra teacher. The time that was spent with Mr. Sanders is something of which she still speaks fondly. She credits him with pushing her toward the

university on the Great Plains where she could've kept playing in orchestra. But it wasn't enough.

Maria is one of those rare students who can truly *do it all*. The fact that she had an incredibly supportive family helped her explore several different creative endeavors was a plus. She had the wherewithal to practice hard and reap the rewards early in her music career. Her success in the private bass studio and her earning a spot in a very competitive youth symphony, even though she was heavily involved in so many more activities while in high school, is a testament to not only her talent but also her drive. However, it was not apparent if Maria merely enjoyed the immediate fulfillment of her music participation in high school or if it truly increased her desire to further her music studies.

It is remarkable that Maria is not sure whether she would play bass later in life. When asked if she's thought about playing in a community orchestra as adult, she cites cost and time as factors in the future decision. She knows that the average journalist moves every two or three years for at least six years. Bases are expensive and difficult traveling companions. "I don't know how crazy my life's about to be," she explains.

### ***Mr. Sanders' Story about Maria***

Devin Sanders was Maria Stokes' high school orchestra teacher. Mr. Sanders has very fond memories of Maria, as he started working with her from a very young age. She started in an extracurricular elementary school string orchestra that he directed weekly. By the time she enrolled in his middle school program, she was already an accomplished bass player. He worked with her every year from sixth through twelfth grade, except her freshman year.

Mr. Sanders remembered Maria as the "most energetic, bright-eyed young person" he ever taught. "She was very excited all the time, very committed. Came to everything. She

always had a smile and I can't remember a time ever that she didn't have a smile. She's one of the more positive people I've ever met in my life." He also remembered her being extremely talented and involved in several activities in school and extracurricular. She was involved in orchestra, bass lessons, choir, dance, and musical theatre in middle school. In high school, she added student government, cross country, track, and orchestra leadership team to her list of activities. "She's very excited about just about everything," he remembered. "You ask her to do anything – she always wants to do it. Whether she has time to, whether it works out, she was very gung-ho about everything," he said with a smile.

During her eighth grade year, Maria helped Mr. Sanders teach the extracurricular elementary orchestra and taught a young bassist private lessons under her teacher's supervision. "She taught lessons at the middle school after school. I'd work in my office while she taught, and sometimes I'd come out and work with them a little bit, but the rest of the time she was teaching." He said that she was very successful at transferring the lessons that she learned to her student. "She could explain herself well," he says. "Things that I told her, she would repeat in very specific, meaningful ways." He grew to appreciate her knowledge and skill of the technical requirements of the bass. She had a much deeper understanding of music than the average eighth grader.

Mr. Sanders remembers, though, that the enthusiasm began to wane her freshman year. He wasn't teaching at the high school yet and Maria would come back to teach lessons at the middle school and vent about her experiences at the high school. He tried to encourage her, and she eventually picked up another student, but he noticed that the time she devoted to orchestra began to diminish. "I think she *found* time to teach and be involved in orchestra, but not as much time and not as much energy that she *needed* to really focus on the bass," he explains.



Mr. Sanders remembered that Maria's family was heavily involved in music. "Maria's family was very supportive, more than many. When she was younger and the bass was difficult for her to carry, her dad was always available to bring her bass. Even in high school, Maria was still petite, her dad still helped her with the instrument and other equipment." Even more so, though, Mr. Sanders remembered her parents being extremely supportive of not only Maria, but also her brother who went on to major in musical theatre and is performing professionally. They were heavily involved in the orchestra boosters. "I mean, I couldn't ask for better orchestra parents is how I would put it," he said. But Maria's parents supported *all* of her activities, and this led Mr. Sanders to believe that she was being pulled in too many directions.

"I'm not sure, but I got the feeling she was losing her passion for music. I say that because even though she continued to grow and develop, it wasn't always with the same level of enthusiasm and drive. I think she got plugged into a lot of other activities freshman year." Mr. Sanders wondered if she was only doing orchestra to meet his expectations. "She was always so excited, so bubbly, I wondered if her attitude was some kind of façade. It was hard for me to decipher how much she enjoyed it," he says. "I don't know how much of that feeling of her losing her passion for music was me, but I do feel like I didn't push it," he remembered.

"She did play in our top symphonic orchestra the three years she was with me. She was always one of our top players. She would do all of the activities we had planned, too. She was often in leadership roles and was just very trustworthy," Mr. Sanders said. "She was in choir and musical theatre, too. So there's this kind of overall musical person in that small package." Maria auditioned for district and state orchestras and made both, although Mr. Sanders couldn't recall exactly which year or years. She was a member of the local youth symphony. Through it

all, she was as energetic as ever, practicing and rehearsing, he estimates, between fifteen and twenty hours a week.

Mr. Sanders remembers her as being the second-best bass player in the orchestra until her senior year, when she took over the principal position. During her time in orchestra, Mr. Sanders remembers that the only negative words he ever heard spoken about Maria were those out of jealousy. “‘She’s so good, she’s so pretty, she’s so this and that,’ were the only things I ever heard about her that were negative,” he said. Her peers liked her and she was a respected musician, he thought. “I never got an impression besides anyone being annoyed with how talented and beautiful she was.”

When the time came for Maria to choose a college, Mr. Sanders suggested that she look at a private university on the Great Plains. Mr. Sanders had sent students to the university and knew about the program. He remembered listening to their concerts on YouTube and thinking that Maria would be a great addition to their program. “I knew the orchestra wasn’t fantastic and that they were in need of strong players. I knew that they would accept her.” He contacted the bass professor on Maria’s behalf and suggested that Maria do the same. After contacting the bass professor, he didn’t receive a response, and neither did Maria, even though he thought she had reached out several times.

“So, I’m not sure where Maria’s lack of interest for playing in college came from, but I was expecting that she would still be playing.” Mr. Sanders wonders if it was due to the lack of outreach given by the university and the bass instructor was adjunct and just didn’t care enough to recruit players. Mr. Sanders knew that there was only one orchestra, so he felt sure that Maria would have been a valuable member. “She would’ve been one of their stronger players. I

encouraged her to pursue it. I let her know that if she wanted any help, I'm happy to, but it wasn't really her thing." He wondered if Maria just ran out of passion for playing the bass.

Because Maria was so focused on majoring in another area, he thinks that she just didn't have the time or energy to keep up with her bass. But when asked if he sees her making music in the future, he responds immediately. "I would be *shocked* if she didn't," he says. But he sees her focusing more on her vocal performance in the future. "I see her doing more of the vocal and theatrical stuff through her life – community theatre productions and stuff like that," he says.

### ***Reflections on Mr. Sanders' Story about Maria***

Mr. Sanders hasn't been in contact with Maria in several months. He looks forward to seeing her at a bi-annual alumni gathering next winter. "I learned to let go early because it was clear that even though she loved playing the bass, it wasn't going to be her focus. I didn't want to pressure her and make her feel down for not continuing in music. I didn't want to put any influence on making her think I was disappointed in her."

His memories of Maria showed the relationship that was established over the course of her public school music career. He obviously had very fond memories of her. Those memories were of an exceptionally enthusiastic young person who had the gift of being very talented in many different areas in addition to music. Mr. Sanders insists that she must be making music in some form in college. "You know, I don't know if she's making music in a group, producing meaningful music for others to listen to? Or if it's just on her own," he said. "I would be shocked if she wasn't singing right now."

### ***Contributing Factors That Led Maria To Not Continue In College Orchestra***

The factors that led Maria to not continue in orchestra weigh much differently than Bernadette's experiences. The influence of Mr. Sanders was profound. He had a very clear connection to Maria because she taught private lessons under his guidance, she encouraged him to take the high school teaching job, and she was frustrated when her peers in the high school orchestra did not show respect for him when he took over the high school directorship. Because of her respect for Mr. Sanders' teaching and the environment he developed, Maria's relationship with music and orchestra was established. But it is Maria's own self-realization, her inability to "see" herself competing on a professional level, which is truly remarkable.

#### ***Intrinsic Factor - Persistence***

Maria's interest in making music was heavily influenced by the support that she received from her parents and her orchestra teacher, Mr. Sanders. She was also drawn to many different activities while in high school; so many that Mr. Sanders worried that she was spread too thin. She desired participation and music was one of several different avenues for participation. There were several instances in both Maria's and Mr. Sanders' interviews in which Maria makes a sudden shift to pursue a goal. And there were just as many times in which Maria was easily discouraged.

Her first trip to the Chicago Symphony Orchestra was the initial impetus to not play in college orchestra. She looked on stage and saw six very old, tall, men playing full size basses. Because of her diminutive stature, Maria could only play a 5/8 size bass. She knew that in order to compete on a professional level, she would have to compete against men like those on stage. She could not see herself on stage with those bassists (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.18).

Maria's persistence was heavily impacted by her social interactions. As Kelly, LaVergne, Boone, and Boone (2012, p. 654) found, Maria's particular "personal characteristics, prior experiences, and personal commitments" played a large part in her persistence in orchestra. She was influenced by Mr. Sanders' encouragement to continue playing at the college level, but she was unhappy with the journalism department at the school he wanted her to attend. She couldn't see herself taking the time and effort required to make playing the bass a possibility at her current university.

But Maria had been very open to the idea of playing in collegiate orchestra as long as she could fulfill her desire to be a journalist. She enlisted the help of Mr. Sanders to look into the possibility of playing at the Great Plains university. Maria and Mr. Sanders both contacted the bass instructor in the hopes of gathering information about the bass studio but never heard back from him (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.20). In fact, up until the interview, Mr. Sanders thought that Maria was still playing (and attending the Great Plains university). It came as a surprise to hear that she wasn't playing in the orchestra (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.21). And, even though she didn't end up attending that particular university, she entertained that option very seriously. She loved the university's campus, the area in which it was located, and even the level of the orchestra program. But when she visited the journalism department, she was dismayed at the lack of broadcast curricula. She wanted to be on camera and this particular school was known for print media.

Instead, Maria chose to attend the Jesuit university on the Great Lakes. She was enthralled with the broadcast journalism department with its large studios and high-tech equipment. She was still considering playing in the university orchestra until she heard that she had to minor in music just to be allowed to play in the orchestra. Because the university is in a

very large urban area, the schools of music and journalism are roughly eight miles apart. She just couldn't see herself adding the additional load, both physically and academically, that playing in the orchestra would require (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.22).

Johnson (2007) examined the efficacy of high school education on persistence and graduation rates at a public research university and demonstrated that the academic quality of a high school relates directly to persistence (p. 791). Maria attended a large suburban high school that was recognized as a National School of Excellence (Blue Ribbon Award from the US Department of Education). Her high school experience was exceptionally positive. She was a student leader in orchestra and other activities; she was heavily involved in student government; she worked full time; and she still managed to maintain a 4.5 GPA. In her own recollection, she only remembers earning three Bs in high school. All indications were that she was going to be successful in whatever field she eventually chose.

It is interesting that Mr. Sanders was taken by surprise when he learned that Maria no longer played in orchestra. To be fair, he had lost contact with her in the past three years so he had no way of knowing for sure if she had continued to play in college orchestra or not. But his reaction was visceral, almost as though he couldn't believe it at first. But he was certain that she would come back to music later in life.

### ***Intrinsic Factor – Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

The present study examined how participants' self-concepts of musical ability influenced their decision to not continue in orchestra and if their high school orchestra teacher corroborated that view. Did the participant's view of him or herself socially and personally match up to that of others? In Maria's experience, she demonstrated a very high self-concept of musical ability, supported by the observations of her high school orchestra director. Maria's observation of

herself, and how she saw herself in the *future* shaped her self-concept of musical ability. Even though she didn't necessarily see herself performing, she did see herself making music later in life.

Maria's earliest memory of playing the bass in orchestra class illustrated her intrinsic self-concept of musical ability. In the fourth grade she found cello too easy and was convinced, reluctantly at first, to switch to bass. Her reticence was overcome by the fact that she would be the only bass player in the school, in her words "the cool kid" playing an instrument nobody else could play. She looked forward to being relied on and at being viewed as something special in the program. This foreshadows her drive to become involved in so many things, a self-fulfilling selection of participation. It is telling, however, that she ended the vignette by talking about how important it was that she be able to play bass for Mr. Sanders in middle school. Again, his influence on Maria's motivation and self-concept is at work (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.23).

Maria's self-concept of musical ability was often tied to what she saw as the physical limitations of competing against other players. The family's financial limitations kept her from buying a high quality instrument for her. But more than just finances, she worried that her diminutive stature, she is only 4' 11" tall, would keep her from being competitive in a professional symphony orchestra. It is fascinating that she talks about wanting to *play* and not *teach*, as though the thought of having to teach is abhorrent. But because she was so small, she felt that she couldn't compete against male competitors who played full-sized instruments. This view of herself as too small seems to have influenced her family's decision to not purchase a bass for her (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.24).

Maria's fixation on her stature directly informed her decision to not pursue a career in music performance. She went on a trip with her brother to Chicago. He was looking at colleges in the area and they decided to attend a Chicago Symphony Orchestra concert:

Maria was sitting with her brother and watching the orchestra warm-up prior to the concert. At first she was fascinated with watching the bass players as they readied themselves for the concert. But then it struck her – none of the men onstage looked like her! They were all six feet tall or taller. They were very old in her eyes. And they played German bows. Maria felt as though she had an epiphany. "I'm not up there," she remembers thinking to herself. She could not see herself on that stage, competing against those men for a job. It was a crushing realization that formed her self-concept of musical ability from that point forward (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.25).

Maria admitted that she should not have let that situation deter her from pursuing her goal of playing professionally, because as she said, "at the end of the day, if I wanted to do it, I would do it" (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.25). The Chicago Symphony Orchestra experience exposed her to the fact that she didn't really want to make music her profession. And at this point in the conversation she offered a kind of apology for why she didn't pursue music, and instead chose journalism; seemingly justifying the decision because all the skills she had learned in music were not the same skills she would need in journalism:

That's the thing, it's not like I chose a profession where I was going to make more money. After college I knew I wanted to go into journalism. But I felt like journalism used all of my talents in one area, and I could translate all those skills into other things. I felt like if I only majored in music, then I would only do music (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.26).



It is fascinating that Maria did not see the skills that she learned in music as helping with journalism, but rather as a separate skill set. She did not see music as a medium through which she could adapt to other areas of her life. Music is set off to the side, a wholly separate entity. As she saw it, if she chose music as a career she could *only* be a musician.

Maria's evolution as a musician, from the fourth grade through her experience at the Chicago Symphony Orchestra concert, corroborated Dweck's (2000) finding that students' beliefs about their own abilities develop over time, through experiences they have, and from opinions of others. Maria is a strong-willed person. She is very self-confident in most of her pursuits, academically and professionally, but her view that being a musician would somehow limit her to *only* being a musician is somewhat perplexing. Her views are very black and white in this regard. In her mind, if she couldn't be a professional bassist with a symphony orchestra, there was no point in pursuing music any further. The perplexing part is that she is still actively involved in making music whenever she is able:

This past semester, Maria went to a friend's apartment to study. But, when her friend left to run errands, instead of studying, she started playing his piano. All of the tension and worry drained out of her as she played pieces that she didn't even know she had memorized. She didn't understand how she was able to play some of the songs after so many years away from the instrument, and she marveled at the fact that her fingers still remembered (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.27).

This particular event framed a particular paradox in Maria's self-concept of musical ability. Even though she had chosen to not pursue music as a career, she amazes herself by her ability to recall piano music from memory. On one hand she doesn't believe that she has what it

takes in order to be a professional musician, but at the same time impresses herself with her ability to play piano. “When I’m caught up and don’t have time to think, I just want to make music,” she says about the incident at her friend’s apartment (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.27). At no point during the interview does she seem to realize the incongruity of these two thoughts.

Mr. Sanders certainly helped Maria develop her self-concept of musical ability, as her earliest, and fondest, memories are of working with him in elementary and middle school orchestra classes and rehearsals. By helping children develop a “positive music self-concept” (Rosevear, 2010, p. 23) early on in their education, negative self-views are less likely to develop and fewer barriers to rewarding musical experiences may arise. Welch, Himonides, Saunders, Papageorgi, and Sarazin (2014) found that peer relationships “can be a powerful factor in nurturing (or hindering) successful participation and ongoing engagement, a finding related to the social benefit that is also evidenced in adolescent music activity, both in school and elsewhere” (p. 803). Maria was heavily influenced by the year in which she did not have Mr. Sanders as her orchestra teacher.

Maria was frustrated by the other students’ lack of respect for the rehearsal process. She identified herself as being a person to whom music came naturally and who loved music. She grew tired of the teacher’s lack of organization and commitment to the program and how it had affected the program. Maria drew a distinction between those who cared and those who did not (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.28).

Throughout the interview, and even touched upon briefly in the initial survey, Maria spoke very highly of her abilities on the bass. It was not an arrogant boast, but a genuine appreciation for the work she had done on the instrument. She loved the fact that she had taken

an instrument known for simple bass lines and turned it into a vehicle for expression. And through her hard work, she turned it into what she called “serious music” (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4. 29). It was her drive to create that defined Maria’s self-concept of musical ability and permeated her motivation for music.

### ***Intrinsic Factor – Motivation for Music***

Maria’s enthusiasm was palpable during the interview. She sat on the edge of her chair and spoke excitedly about her music making and her experiences in high school orchestra. She smiled widely as told stories about Mr. Sanders’ inspiration. Her experiences, and her achievements, as she listed them chronologically, fell in line with Schmidt’s (2005) finding a slight increase in scores for intrinsic or mastery orientations for older students while younger musicians tended to score higher on competitive, ego, and failure avoidance orientations. All subjects in the Schmidt study, on average, agreed that they worked best with other students and placed less emphasis on competitive and ego orientations. Schmidt’s results “suggest that students may respond best to the intrinsic or cooperative aspects of instrumental music rather than its extrinsic or competitive aspects” (p. 144). Maria was inspired and rewarded by the fact that she was the only bass player in elementary school, but as she matured, she wanted to have a more complete experience in the orchestra classroom and rehearsal settings while in middle and high school.

By the time Mr. Sanders came back to teach her high school orchestra, Maria was growing tired of her classmates’ dispassionate approach to orchestra. She longed to be inspired. And when Mr. Sanders came back, that spark came back to her playing. She was playing in the top youth symphony orchestra. She was taking private and group lessons. It was a huge part of her life and by the end of her freshman year Maria was still

wanting to make it her career after high school (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.30)

Maria was not averse to practicing, and Mr. Sanders and she both stated that she was practicing between one and three hours a day early in her high school orchestra career. She enjoyed the process and was motivated by the newness of it. It is very interesting that, in the following vignette, she described how music prepared her for a career in journalism.

I got to perform on the bass, in musical theatre, and solos and such. And I loved it because you get a rush. You get that adrenaline. And I felt that's what journalism would do for me. Everyday you get to do all those amazing new things. Especially broadcast journalism, because you get the performance aspect that I love so much (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.31).

This statement compliments Narrative Analysis 4.26 in which she speaks of how she could use all of her different talents in journalism. Here in Narrative Analysis 4.31, she talks about how music gave her the emotional rush she desired, and how those emotions translated directly to broadcast journalism. Maria is searching for the emotional high that she found in her music through her journalistic pursuits.

At least two times during the interview, Mr. Sanders intimated that Maria was only looking into playing in college to please him. And he wondered if that was just her personality: Maria was always excited to try new opportunities. Mr. Sanders would approach her to try something new and she would be totally committed. But he also saw that she did this for every subject or activity. She approached every new activity with great energy, but he was careful to not push her too hard. Mr. Sanders wanted Maria to play in college so she would help the orchestra program, but also so she would have friends and colleagues

with whom she could build a rapport. When the bass instructor for the university didn't respond to the inquiry emails, Mr. Sanders worried that Maria let the idea go, not from a lack of talent, but from a lack of motivation. He couldn't tell if she entertained the idea because she really wanted to play in college or because she was trying to please him (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.32).

It is fascinating that Maria's effusive personality perplexed Mr. Sanders. He wanted her to play, but he also didn't want to push her too hard in case she was doing it for the wrong reasons. Arguably, he worried that if he encouraged her too much it would actually have the opposite effect that he wanted.

During the interview, Maria admits that it would've been much easier to play in orchestra had she gone to the university Mr. Sanders had suggested. The other two private colleges she was considering required a music minor to play in the orchestra. Again, Maria comes back to the notion that she just wants to play in orchestra for the enjoyment of it. "It was just like, 'Do I wanna do this and go through the whole process if I know that I love music, but I just want to do it for fun?'" Maria, throughout the initial survey and interview, comes back to this theme repeatedly. Coupled with her struggles to purchase a bass, Maria's actions draw a parallel to the finding that the nature of artistic performance can foster avoidant tendencies due to the regular chance of failure or success in public (Lacaile, Koestner, and Gaudreau, 2007). One cannot be sure if Maria avoided playing in college because she didn't have the time or inclination, or because she held performance-avoidance goals (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.33).

I found Maria's consistent labeling of not wanting music to be a *job* to be the more likely reason, at least in regard to motivation for music, that she did not play in college:

When she was still in high school, Maria visited with a friend's mom who played in the local professional symphony orchestra. Maria enjoyed hearing about how the orchestra rehearsed and performed, but she thought to herself, *I don't want this to be my job*. Maria thought about how she would have to practice seven hours a day. She worried that she would lose her love of music; her love of playing solo literature just for the very enjoyment of it. She convinces herself that she will always continue to play, no matter if she's in an orchestra or not, and that no one can take her music away from her (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.34).

### ***Extrinsic Factor – Parental Musicianship and Support in Music***

There is no doubt that Maria's parents were very supportive of her, regardless of whatever she chose to pursue. This is corroborated throughout the interviews with both Maria and Mr. Sanders. It is interesting to note that Maria defined her parental support in two very distinct ways, albeit both very positively: monetarily and emotionally.

Maria understood that her choice of career, either music or journalism, would not result in great financial reward. She insisted that her parents did not care about money, rather they wanted their children to be happy. Her parents, like Mr. Sanders, were supportive and understanding and did not question her changes in pursuits, as illustrated in the following exchange during the interview:

As she's talking about a possible music major in college, Maria observes: "Who makes money doing that?" She smiles and explains that no matter what she wanted to do, her parents would support her and wouldn't care how much money she made doing it.

"When my brother wanted to go into musical theatre, they pumped money into that. And when I wanted to do music, they pumped money into that because they thought, 'hey, this

is important.” But in the very next moment, she also recognizes the moment, while a sophomore in high school, when she had an epiphany while watching the news and decided she wanted to go into journalism. Throughout it all, Maria’s parents supported her without question (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.35)

Parental musicianship and support for musical study is an example of cultural capital. Maria’s parents exemplify the idea of cultural capital, the non-financial assets that help people navigate social mobility (e.g., level of education, speech patterns, clothing style, and physical experience, to name a few) that was first studied by Pierre Bourdieu (Brown, 1974). Researchers have studied the effects of parental influence on college persistence, attrition, and matriculation. And although never explicitly stated during the interview, Maria’s parents certainly gave her and her brother the cultural capital needed to successfully navigate out of high school and into college and beyond. Her brother earned a degree in musical theatre at a private university on the East Coast prior to entering a career as an arts manager. Maria was able to pick and choose which of three private universities she would attend.

Maria’s parents were not active musicians during her upbringing. Her mother had rudimentary training in elementary school and her father had no musical training whatsoever. But it is her father who had a special relationship with Maria and her music:

“It’s so funny,” Maria says. “My dad was a three-sport athlete and had a full ride scholarship to play tennis in college. He’s the most athletic person you’d ever meet. And then my brother and I come along, and he does musical theatre and I’m doing choir and orchestra. And so my dad just turned into a stage dad and loved it all the way” (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.36).

Mr. Sanders remembered Maria's father's involvement in Maria's music studies as well. In fact, Mr. Sanders is very complimentary of both parents stating that he "couldn't ask for better orchestra parents. Maria's mom served on the orchestra booster board and dad brought Maria to rehearsals daily. Mr. Sanders remembers this weekly event from Maria's time in elementary strings:

When Maria was in elementary strings, she was part of an honors orchestra that met once a week after school at the middle school. She was tiny. So tiny that Mr. Sanders worried that even a fractional size bass was too big for her to play. But every week, she walked in with a smile on her face. Her dad was right behind her, carrying her bass. Dad would help her unpack her bass, get it set up, give Maria a big hug, and tell her "See you later." (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.37).

Mr. Sanders remembers Maria's parents attending every concert and event held by the high school orchestra. They embodied what Zdinzinski (1996) found in when he studied parental involvement and cognitive, affective, and performance outcomes of band students in grades 4-12 (see Chapter 2, p. 20). Maria benefitted from her parents' involvement from elementary school through high school, especially in the area "concerning concert attendance, providing materials, participating in parent groups, and tape-recording student performances" (p. 34).

Upon closer examination, Maria's parent's involvement in her musical training also corroborated the findings of Dai and Schader (2002) who researched "parents' expectancy beliefs and values regarding their child's music training, regular academic work, and athletic activities" (p. 135). Dai and Schader found that parents seek out musical training for their child for the general educational value derived from the pursuit and not for the development of



musical talent. Maria's parents, although not musical themselves, gave their children the benefit of a high quality music education, supporting their son through an undergraduate degree in musical theatre at a prestigious private college and providing for Maria's private lessons, youth symphony tuition, and other musical activities and instruction.

Dai and Schader point out that "achievement of eminence is not the major criterion for success in music" and that "the intrinsic and extrinsic aspects of motivation underlying parental support" is more important in a particular subset of parents (p. 143). Maria's parents would definitely fall into this category. It is interesting, though, that even though Maria says her parents support her decision to longer play in orchestra, she offers this story:

They loved the different journalism stories I was doing and they realized I was happy, so they were happy, too. But now that it's been three years that I've been gone, they don't hear all the music in the house and they miss it. I think they miss the fact that I don't play bass anymore, because my dad loved it. He just loved it and all the solo pieces that I would play. But when I come home, I always play the piano and sing, so I think that helps a little bit (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.38).

### ***Extrinsic Factor – Director Influence***

It is not difficult to gauge the influence Mr. Sanders had on Maria. From the earliest point of her musical training, he was an internal and external motivator for her. There is no doubt that she admired and respected him and that those feelings were reciprocated. But the interjection of the high school director during Maria's freshman year may have served as much of a catalyst as did Mr. Sanders in Maria's decision to not pursue music after graduation. Although Mr. Sanders inspired Maria, the classroom environment left behind by his predecessor at the high school made it difficult for him to teach. And Maria, having grown discouraged by

the lack of commitment from other students, moved on to different activities to fulfill her strong desire to succeed.

It was Mr. Sanders' ability to inspire and bring students together that Maria repeatedly recognized. In regard to her time in middle school orchestra, she says of him: "We loved each other so much and he made us very tight-knit group" (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.39). Maria cited her time in middle school orchestra as being the strongest impetus for her to play after college. But that changed when she went to high school and another teacher was the director of orchestras:

Her orchestra teacher treated orchestra class like a study hall. There were days when they wouldn't rehearse and watched movies instead. When it came time for playing tests, the teacher would listen to each individual student while the others lay on the floor or did homework. "She didn't care and it affected not only me but the entire orchestra," Maria said. "I was really frustrated." Maria visited her middle school weekly to help with the elementary honor orchestra and to teach private lessons to younger students. While there she commiserated with Mr. Sanders and begged him to teach at the high school.

When Mr. Sanders finally had the opportunity to apply for and get appointed to the high school orchestra position, Maria felt it might have been too late. Even though she knew it was the best thing that could happen for her and the other orchestra students, she knew that Mr. Sanders struggled with the other students' attitudes and work ethics (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.40)

“I wonder how it’s going now,” Maria mused during the interview. She worried that the less motivated students might have affected Mr. Sanders for the long term.

Mr. Sanders is an amazing teacher, and he was our first and only teacher, but those students who had that other teacher, they just dragged down the rest of us. But he loves what he does, whether it was coaching or music, he was very passionate about it. But by the time I was in the top group my sophomore year, they just frustrated me because they kept dragging us down with their attitude. I hope he doesn’t have that disconnect now and it’s more like when we were in middle school (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.41).

When Mr. Sanders became the high school orchestra teacher, Maria described a situation similar to the findings of Skinner and Belmont (1993). In the study, Skinner and Belmont found that teacher involvement and motivation was central to students’ experiences in the classroom. In their study on reciprocal effects of teacher behavior, Skinner and Belmont found that “teacher provision of both autonomy support and optimal structure predicted children’s motivation across the school year,” and that “students who are behaviorally disengaged receive teacher responses that should further undermine their motivation” (p. 571). The previous high school teacher undoubtedly undermined Maria’s motivation. But one must wonder if Mr. Sanders’ dealings with the less motivated and disruptive students didn’t adversely affect Maria’s *and* the other students’ motivation for music as well.

Maria was greatly influenced by Mr. Sanders during her elementary and middle school years. Asmus (1986), applying Attribution Theory to music education, notes that the shift from effort related to ability related attributions occurs during the middle school years, the grades that teachers first begin to struggle with keeping students involved in music (p. 275). As she grew

older, Maria's feelings about playing in college changed. Mr. Sanders encouraged her to apply for and to play in college orchestra. But, as can be seen in the following vignette, his encouragement wasn't enough to overcome her feelings on that particular university:

I had narrowed it down to three schools. And when I mentioned [the Great Plains university], Mr. Sanders was like, "You should do that!" He got me all ramped up to go there and I was pretty much set on going there because they had a very informal orchestra. Students could just come and play no matter their major, but if they have time, they can come in and play. I was going to go there and major in journalism and play in their orchestra. It seemed like the best thing. But when I visited, their journalism program wasn't what I wanted (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.42).

Mr. Sanders encouraged Maria to continue playing in college. Maria was actively involved in teaching private lessons to younger students. She served as a mentor to elementary and middle school orchestra students during her time in middle school and high school orchestra. This is interesting because Kuntz (2011) examined the role of band directors in encouraging lifelong participation in music as part of a larger qualitative study. Kuntz found that "although they may not hear it from their directors, there was an awareness of opportunities that were available to them as they transition to adulthood" (p. 29). The students in Kuntz's study also found that by serving as mentors for younger musicians, they helped create the vision of music as a lifelong process. Maria heard directly from Mr. Sanders how he felt about her continuing on with orchestra. And, even though she no longer plays bass and is not in an orchestra, Maria has continued to make music through her piano playing and singing.

Mr. Sanders wanted Maria to continue playing in orchestra after high school. But he also worried that if he pushed too hard, she would think that he was disappointed in her. This is the

paradoxical relationship between Maria and Mr. Sanders: he wondered if she were pursuing playing in college only to make him happy so he didn't push her too hard; and she didn't want to disappoint him by not playing in orchestra but didn't want to compromise on her chosen major (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.43). The mutual admiration each had for the other may have been better served by more open and honest communication about Maria's future with music.

### ***Extrinsic Factor – Socioeconomic Status (SES)***

Financial hardships were never discussed during the interview or cited in the original survey. Maria's family placed value on a quality education and her family supported her brother's pursuit of a musical theatre degree at a private college on the East Coast. She took private lessons as well as group lessons, was enrolled in the local youth symphony program, and was given every advantage that her parents' could manage, "pouring money into it," to use Maria's own words (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.35).

But throughout Maria's story, the fact that she never owned her own bass is repeatedly cited as a reason that she did not continue playing in her college orchestra. Her particular body size, she is extremely petite, played into her reluctance to buy an instrument. She would have to either have a bass specially made in a fractional size, or play one that was too big for her. She also worried that she would have to transport it across a large metropolitan area (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.44).

But she was open to playing at the university level if the school had instruments available for rent. Interestingly, a factor that came into play during this portion of the interview was her belief that she might be financially restricted in the future if she had to compete against other, bigger bassists. She did not want her career to be limited to teaching, but wanted to play in a

symphony orchestra. She equated her small size with being financially unviable as a professional bassist (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.45).

Mr. Sanders wanted to help Maria obtain financial assistance at the Great Plains university. He offered to contact the bass instructor to see what they could offer Maria:

I had contacted the university and she had, too. I sent an email to the bass instructor and she had sent like four or five. I told him, “I’ve got this great bass player who’d really help your program.” Maybe that hurt her opportunities. I tried not to be negative, but I had seen their orchestra in YouTube videos and it wasn’t very good. But I hope it didn’t come across as negative. Maybe they just didn’t care, for whatever reason. Maybe that’s the situation (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.46).

Looking back, Mr. Sanders worried that he somehow offended the bass instructor with his questions and comments about the orchestra. But when he asked Maria if he needed to do anything to follow up with the university, she told him no. He never heard Maria discuss it after that (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.21).

Maria lamented the fact that she still asks her parents for a bass. And even though she said it jokingly, there is a touch of melancholy to it:

I want one so badly, but that’s the biggest thing, never having owned my own. Someday, I’d like to buy one, but it’s a big investment. Maybe if I could find one for around five thousand dollars. I would totally do it if I could find the money. It would be so worth it (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.47).

But this statement contrasted directly with those made in Narrative Analysis 4.35 in which Maria spoke about her parents “pouring money” into her and her brother’s musical pursuits. Was there truly a financial reason behind her inability to buy a bass? Or had it become

too easy to blame it on a lack of funds rather than delve into deeper meanings behind the lack of an instrument? It was unclear to me at the end of the interview, and possibly to Maria as well.

### ***Samuel's Story***

*"I knew I still wanted to play bass, but I did enjoy the solo pieces more than the orchestra pieces that I've played because it's more to get to play the melody and I feel I get to express who I am musically in solo playing whereas it's more restricted playing in an orchestra setting."*

*~ Samuel Glover*

Samuel Glover is a freshman at a large state university in the upper Great Plains region. He was very difficult to hear in the coffee shop where the interview took place. He had trouble focusing his eyes beyond his fidgeting hands; he spoke quietly but with conviction. As he spoke it seemed as though there was something very important he wanted to share but wasn't sure if he should say it or not. I was reminded of a statement from Samuel's initial survey: "My high school teacher and I didn't see eye to eye. Because of this, I focused more on myself as a player rather than the whole orchestra." Samuel's reticence now made more sense as he began his story.

"My family's all orchestra, so that's why I chose bass, because nobody else did it and I didn't want to play viola, which was the other option. So I started on bass and enjoyed it very much. I did orchestra, but that wasn't what I enjoyed the most. I started lessons in the seventh grade and I always enjoyed playing solo more than I ever did orchestra. So a lot of it was like a precedent set by our parents for us, but if we would have said we didn't want to play, they would've been okay with that. They didn't push it on us, it was all our decision." Samuel's mood brightened as he talked about his parents.

"But they were on board with me taking lessons. It was harder to convince my parents to buy an instrument because they're so expensive, so I had to assure them that I'd be playing for

while and not just being done after high school. They were always supportive and they always did whatever it took so that I could play.

“They made sure I made it to youth symphony rehearsals and stuff like that. I always enjoyed youth symphony because they would play things that were harder and more frustrating for me. It was more rewarding because we got to play cool things. Not like my high school orchestra.” Samuel’s brow furrowed as he spoke. “There were some songs that I enjoyed, but the majority...it wasn’t very challenging for me at least.” His body stiffened as he tried to explain what he meant.

“High school orchestra just wasn’t that important to me. Well, it was important for the fact that it opened the door for things I wanted to do. If I wanted to be in all-district and if I wanted to do solo contest, I needed to be in orchestra. I mean, I’m not sure I *had* to be in orchestra, but it’s a whole lot easier when you are. If I wasn’t in orchestra I wouldn’t be taking my playing as seriously.” He shifted in his seat, trying to gauge if what he said made sense. “I enjoyed all-district way more than high school orchestra because of the talent level of the other people. We got to play more exciting, well-known pieces.

“But it was my passion for solo playing that was important to me.” He looked around cautiously. “I mean, there were times I enjoyed high school orchestra, but there were also times when I was like, ‘Why do I have to be here?’ The stuff we were required to do because it was for a grade was just annoying.” Samuel’s brow furrowed again, and his voice grew angrier. “I played soccer but I always had to miss a game for a concert. And then there was the disciplinary stuff.” His voice lowered again. He looked across the coffee house toward his mother. She had brought him for the interview. Certain that she hadn’t heard him, he continued.



“It was probably my fault. It was stuff like I’d always keep playing for large chunks of time after he cut off the orchestra. It was frustrating because the bass parts were always so much easier so Mr. Burton would be working the other sections. We’d just stand there with nothing to do.” He grew exasperated, making large motions with his hands. “We can’t sit down, we can’t leave, we still had to be there and be attentive.” He put his hands together on the table. “And then there were the section leader tests.”

“We would record it on our computers and submit it online and he’d listen to it. But no one understood the tiebreakers. If I got the same score as the next guy, I’d be here and he’d be there in front of me. I can’t say anything for sure, but since he’s also the middle school teacher that goes to the high school, he already knew those kids. It seemed like they got more advantages than we did.” Samuel looked toward his mother again and lowered his voice. When asked if he asked Mr. Burton about the chair placements, Samuel shrugged. “It didn’t much matter. I just wanted to know why, and I just...I never went to....” He quickly changed the subject.

“I don’t think Mr. Burton understood the bass. He couldn’t tell me what to do better. I feel like he didn’t know what was coming from our section. There was a kind of disconnect there.” He sat up and took a big breath. “There were times that I certainly annoyed him and he would annoy me, so there was friction between us. But you could see that he was trying the best he could. It was just difficult to endure sometimes. But over time it got better.

“There were often times that Mr. Burton would trust me to go and help some of the younger students, or to go do some errands, because of a scheduling conflict senior year I had to be in the freshman orchestra class. You could definitely tell that he appreciated what I did for him.” Samuel’s face brightened and he sat a little taller. “He would always take time to

announce solo ratings or who got into district and he'd come to me afterwards and encourage and complimented me in front of the other students.

“That was important because the other people in orchestra didn't understand bass literature. The solo I was playing they might have played on cello in middle school and they wouldn't have an idea of how difficult it was to play on the bass. I never doubted my ability to play. I knew I wasn't the best out of the area or anything, but I knew I was pretty good. I knew as far as practicing stuff, I could get better.

“And that's why I was torn on whether I would continue in college because I know I enjoyed playing and I didn't want to stop that, but I wasn't sure if I wanted to do orchestra. I'm majoring in chemical engineering. I thought about double-majoring in music, but I talked to the advisors and they said it would be really difficult. I didn't see how a music minor would benefit me, either. There were just too many unknowns at the beginning of the year, like where I was going to keep my instrument or transport it. So what I ended up doing was having my parents bring my bass up to me after a while and I started taking private lessons with somebody my teacher in Kansas City know.” Samuel smiled. “Basically all of that combined, it just wasn't that important to keep playing in orchestra as long as I got to keep playing. I was perfectly happy.

“I could have taken lessons through the university, but it would be way more expensive than just taking lessons on my own. I'm not sure whether being in orchestra was a financial concern, or whether just the instrument and maintaining it was more of the cause. Either way, I'm still considering enrolling in the non-major orchestra in the future.”

When pressed to search for the reasons behind his decision to not continue in orchestra in college, Samuel cannot pinpoint a singular reason. “A lot of it was based on if I could do music

and chemical engineering and if it would work out, then I probably would have continued.” He admitted that the extra music classes would increase his stay in school. “It wasn’t worth it to me for that reason. But as far as solo playing, I feel like I’ll always enjoy that so I assume I’ll keep doing that. At least that’s what I plan.”

### *Reflections on Samuel’s Story*

There are two recurring themes throughout Samuel’s story. One is his passion for playing solo bass literature, to the exclusion of pursuing other possible musical outlets. The other is his relationship with his high school orchestra teacher.

Samuel’s frustration with his high school orchestra teacher’s lack of understanding of not only the technique of how to play the bass, but the knowledge of what it’s like to play the bass in the back of the orchestra permeated his memories of his time in high school orchestra. He was torn between the memories of helping with orchestra and feeling appreciated by Mr. Burton and the memories of being bored in rehearsal and forced to miss soccer games because of concerts. Samuel saw his time in orchestra as having allowed him the opportunity to play the solo literature he loves in contest settings. He also has fond memories of the friendships forged in the orchestra program and sees that as one of the greatest benefits of having participated in it.

Interesting, though, is the fact that Samuel took his acoustic bass with him over five hundred miles to college, not to play in the orchestra, but to continue to take lessons and perfect his study of solo literature. Discouraged from a career in music by his parents, he nevertheless sees the benefits of continued study on the bass. And, though, not out of the question, the possibility of him enrolling in college orchestra or playing in a community orchestra after graduation, seems far less likely than him picking up the bass to play it for sheer enjoyment for the rest of his life.

### *Mr. Burton's Story About Samuel*

James Burton was Samuel Glover's high school orchestra teacher. "My favorite memory of Samuel is from his junior year. He was pretty self-sufficient. He had a private teacher. I left him alone, and when it came time for festival, I require all my students to play for me. I never could get him to play for me. He missed the recital we had and I was pretty patient with him. I said, 'I need you to play your piece. Do you have it ready?' And he says, 'I got a lot of work to do, but it'll be ready.' So I trusted him. The first time I heard him play it, I think it was the Dotzauer solo, it was in front of the judge and he played it from memory." His smile grew wider across his face at the memory. "And it was, oh, my gosh, it was incredible! And it just confirmed everything I thought about him." He hesitated for a moment. "It's too bad about his freshman and sophomore years. He was involved with some influences that weren't too healthy for him.

"There was this one student, like Samuel he wasn't from my feeder, who didn't want to follow the rules. Unfortunately, he was really popular with the group so he was able to do a lot of damage there for a year or two. Things like not being ready to rehearse and getting upset when I asked him to get ready to play. He wanted to talk to the girls in the violin section and I was like, 'Let's go!' I'd call home and his parents didn't want to do anything.

"So this guy's a junior when Samuel is a freshman. It's the beginning of the year and we're doing a game called 'One Truth, One Lie' where we have to figure out what your truth is and what's your lie. And Samuel's lie was that he really, really wanted to be in orchestra. Of course, he had followed that other guy who had said something equally egregious." Mr. Burton sighed at the thought. "But what could you do? I just let it slide. It was the only time he blatantly said anything like that."

And although he never did anything after that to challenge Mr. Burton's authority directly, Samuel's personality made it difficult for Mr. Burton to accurately gauge how Samuel was feeling about orchestra. "He was just so very introverted, very shy around people that he doesn't know. He was just really hard to get to know. I offered him leadership opportunities, you know, offered to let him direct the orchestra and he didn't want to do any of that. He wasn't comfortable being in front of the group. Not everybody is. He just was real content to kind of be pretty passive. I really don't know a lot about him outside of my classroom and even in my classroom he was hard to get to know," Mr. Burton shook his head.

"Not like his older siblings," Mr. Burton said with a smile. "Well, not like his older sister. She was very defiant. Older brother was a great cellist and his little sister plays viola in my orchestra now. Parents are amazing. Mom and dad both were very supportive of Samuel. Providing him lessons, transporting him, bought him a really nice bass. And they were very supportive of my program as well."

"I feel bad for Samuel. He was in a more developing group, not a lot of strong players like I have now. I'm not sure that the challenges I gave him in the classroom were enough for him. I mean, I would like to think that the reason he isn't playing in college didn't have anything to do with not being challenged by me. But," Mr. Burton's voice trailed off. "He was really into sports. Soccer," he interjected. "Sports would come first over orchestra."

It was during Samuel's junior year, after the negative influence had graduated, that the relationship with Mr. Burton improved. When Samuel couldn't enroll in the top orchestra because of a scheduling conflict, Mr. Burton enrolled him in the lower ensemble. "I had him doing some sectional work with some younger kids. Again, I offered him some opportunities to direct but he didn't want anything to do with that." Mr. Burton sat back in his chair. "There's

always that thought in the back of your head.” When asked to explain what he meant, Mr.

Burton thought about it for a moment. “One of the things with Samuel, I felt like no matter how hard you went out of your way to help him, he just didn’t show a lot of gratitude.

“I’ll give you an example. When we were at state contest, he, I won’t get into details, but he essentially destroyed a girl’s cello. I saw the whole thing happen. There was fault on many levels. But, boy, I sure picked up a big baseball bat for Samuel and made incredible attempts to help him with that. I got involved with the music store and the other girl’s director, and it put me in a really uncomfortable position to go to bat for him. But I needed to, and, well, I just got the impression from Samuel that he just didn’t even care.” When asked if he thought that was because of Samuel’s particular personality, he thought about it. “Yeah. Yeah, it might be that deep down inside, he was grateful.

“I think an awful lot of Samuel. He’s an incredible musician, and toward the end of his time in orchestra, I think we had a pretty darn good relationship.” Mr. Burton’s brow furrowed. “If I could change anything, it would be what happened with that young man who was such a bad influence during his freshman and sophomore years.” He thought about it a moment longer. “There’s probably a part in the back of my head that thinks that he didn’t get the experience that he thought he should with my group.” He paused for a moment before continuing. “But then there’s a part of me that...that he’s just a hard kid.”

### ***Reflections on Mr. Burton’s Story About Samuel***

Mr. Burton’s story about Samuel is one of contrasts. It is very obvious that he has a huge amount of respect for Samuel as a person and as a musician. But he still struggles to understand Samuel’s lack of empathy and attachment to the orchestra program on an emotional level. By all indications, Samuel should’ve had a very positive experience in high school orchestra. But Mr.

Burton cannot articulate the precise reason why feelings of disconnect grew between himself and Samuel. “I would like to think that I didn’t have anything to do with him not being challenged,” he said. “I’ve asked myself that same question many times. And he’s not the only one. I’ve had other students who haven’t continued in college that were really, really sharp players. You just go...why?”

### ***Contributing Factors That Led Samuel To Not Continue In College Orchestra***

The fact that Samuel continued to study privately and play solo bass literature, but not perform as part of the university orchestra makes his case different from the first two participants. But, like Maria, there is a special relationship that exists between Samuel and his high school orchestra teacher. It was the evolution of that relationship, and the social dynamics of their interactions that defined his high school experience.

Special consideration was taken when analyzing Samuel and Mr. Burton’s narratives. It became clear through the course of the analyses that Samuel’s narrative was not necessarily *complete*, as there were defining parts of his story that was missing according to Mr. Burton: the influence of the upperclassmen during his freshman and sophomore years that concerned Mr. Burton and the story of the destroyed cello. There was obvious tension between the two that carried over from the classroom, but there were also extenuating circumstances that went beyond typical student-teacher dynamics. That particular situation will be examined in closer detail at the end of this section.

### ***Intrinsic Factor - Persistence***

Samuel presented an especially fascinating twist to the story in that, although he didn’t play in his collegiate orchestra, he did continue to actively make music as a soloist. He took

weekly private lessons and practiced daily. Although it appeared that Samuel was choosing to put his music away by not participating in orchestra in college, the reality was that he continued to pursue music at an advanced level through lessons and soloistic performance.

Samuel was torn on whether to continue in orchestra but was certain that he wanted to continue to play. The collegiate environment did not encourage continued participation due to workload of disciplinary expectations in Engineering and the music program did not provide a clear path for non-major musicians to participate in orchestra. In many ways the choice was made for Samuel, as well as I suppose many other worthy musicians (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.48).

Samuel arrived on campus focused on his major in chemical engineering. After settling into campus life, he began to inquire about the orchestra program. He worried that he wouldn't have a place to store his instrument and how the upper Great Plains weather would affect the bass if he had to walk across campus. By the time he checked in with the music department, it was too late to audition for the non-music major orchestra. He wasn't disappointed, however, because he made plans to continue playing on his own (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.49).

Samuel's parents, who had insisted that he keep playing his bass as a condition for buying it, transported his bass over five hundred miles so that he would have it at university. He began taking lessons with a friend of his private lesson teacher back home and continued through the rest of the year (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.50). Even though Thomas (2000) found that students performed better academically and persisted better when ties outside their peer group existed, it turned out that the ties that Samuel created at university were not in the orchestra program, but through existing ties from his private teacher back home. His parents



strongly influenced his persistence in keeping with private lessons: “A lot of precedence had been set for us. My parents were supportive, but my dad really didn’t want me to be a music major.” Even though Samuel’s father worried that a major in music may not offer as many job opportunities, both parents continued to support Samuel’s desire to continue in private lessons (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.51). Samuel worried too much about the “unknowns,” as exemplified by this portion of the interview:

A lot of it was unknown for this first part of school. I could’ve taken music classes through the school but it would’ve been more expensive than just taking lessons on my own. I didn’t know how much time I was going to have and I didn’t have much time to go and practice. I needed to know how much time I was going to have to study. So a lot of it was just unknowns going in (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.52).

Here for the first time, Samuel mentions the cost of adding tuition credit for participating in music at the university. Throughout the interview, and the initial survey, he only mentioned financial restrictions a few times. Mr. Burton did not think that financial burdens would keep Samuel from playing in college.

Samuel had established his own social network through private lessons. This corroborates what Kelly, LaVergne, Boone, and Boone (2012) found in that an individual’s “personal characteristics, prior experiences, and personal commitments play a large role in student persistence” (p. 654). In fact, Samuel enjoyed his private bass lessons so much he didn’t care about joining an orchestra as long as he was happy:

I certainly plan on continuing to play. Whether it’s in an actual orchestra with performances, I don’t know, but playing is certainly something I enjoy. When it’s not

enjoyable, then I'll stop playing. But I don't see that happening. At least not now (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.53).

Parker, Hogan, Eastabrook, Oke, and Wood (2006) found that students who were significantly higher in emotional and social competencies persisted at a higher level than their peers (p. 1329). Samuel demonstrated strong social competencies when he traveled a great distance to his university and established new relationships, modified existing relationships with his parents and previous private lesson teacher, and adjusted to the rigorous academic standards that a degree in chemical engineering required. All of these are key components in persistence between freshman and sophomore years in college (p. 1334).

When Mr. Burton was approached to participate in this study, he was surprised that Samuel hadn't continued in orchestra. He worried that he might have influenced not only Samuel's decision, but other students' as well:

I'd like to think that I didn't have anything to do with him not continuing. You know, with him not being challenged in orchestra. I've asked myself that question several times, and not just with Samuel. I've had other students who haven't continued on in college that were really sharp players. And you just go...why? (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.54)

Like so many music educators, Mr. Burton wanted his students, especially someone like Samuel whom he labeled as the finest bass player he ever taught, to keep playing in orchestra.

### *Intrinsic Factor – Self-Concept of Musical Ability*

The present study examined how participants' self-concepts of musical ability influenced their decision to not continue in orchestra and if their high school orchestra teacher corroborated that view. Samuel had a very positive self-concept of musical ability. His colleagues and teacher also had a positive view on Samuel's musical abilities. An episode from his junior year, taken from Mr. Burton's narrative, illustrates how his teacher viewed Samuel's musical skills:

Samuel was supposed to take part in a recital prior to solo contest. Samuel missed it and Mr. Burton approached him to make sure he was prepared. Samuel assured him that even though it still needed work, it would be ready in time for contest. Mr. Burton had no reason to be too concerned. Samuel had a private lesson teacher and Mr. Burton had no reason to believe the solo wouldn't be ready. But when contest came, Mr. Burton was not expecting what happened. Samuel played the solo from memory and stunned his teacher. "Oh, my gosh! It was incredible," he says remembering the performance. It solidified Mr. Burton's opinion that Samuel was very self-sufficient and keeps his word (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.55).

Samuel's self-concept of musical ability was already highly developed in high school. So much so that he viewed high school orchestra as something he had to do in order to participate in the events that he found important. He found the music to be too easy and rehearsals were "monotonous" (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 5.56). He turned his focus toward his own playing, concentrating on auditions for district orchestra and solo contests.

I always enjoyed playing solo more than I ever did orchestra because I got to express myself musically, whereas in the orchestra you're just kind of in the back, almost forgotten (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.57).

His private lesson teacher continued to stretch Samuel musically and he enjoyed the results of his efforts.

So beginning freshman year I did a solo in the spring, and I knew I wanted to keep doing that. And my results kept getting better over the four years as I played more difficult things. I enjoyed district orchestra way more than high school orchestra because of the talent level of the people. We could play more exciting, well-known piece (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.57).

Students believe that their success or failure in a pursuit is based on several factors including ability, effort, task difficulty, and luck (Weiner, 1986). Student musicians often fall into two categories: those who believe that success is based on inherent talent and those who believe success can be achieved through hard work. Samuel definitely believed that he was talented enough but he also showed the hard work and initiative needed in order to prepare high-quality literature. He was concerned that other students, especially those who did not play bass, didn't understand how much harder it was to play solo bass literature:

I knew as far as practicing stuff I could get better at that. I never doubted by ability to play. I don't think the other students understood unless they were a bass player. The solo I was playing was way harder than what they had to play. You know, just the technique of the bass. It was just different (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.58)

Helping students take pleasure in the process of making music is incumbent upon music educators as suggested by Cox and Pitts (2003) in an editorial stating, “enjoyment is a vital but somewhat elusive criterion in shaping effective and engaging experiences of music education” (p. 207). By helping children develop a “positive music self-concept” (Rosevear, 2010, p. 23) early on in their education, negative self-views are less likely to develop and fewer barriers to

rewarding musical experiences may arise. Samuel did not suffer from a negative music self-concept. On the contrary, Samuel was a difficult student to please in the classroom *because of* his high self-confidence, as evidenced by the following observation:

There were some songs in orchestra that I enjoyed, but for the majority, it wasn't very challenging for me at least. The music was pretty simple, so that's why I joined youth symphony. They would play things that were harder which was frustrating for me. But it was also rewarding. We got to play cool things (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.59)

Mr. Burton recognized that Samuel wasn't being challenged musically, so he decided to give Samuel extra leadership responsibilities:

I think the group that he was in was more of a developing group. And he was a strong player. And I don't think that the challenges I gave him in the classroom, I don't think they were enough for him. I offered him other leadership responsibilities like directing. But he didn't want to do that. Samuel would never accept any of those. He was real content to be pretty passive (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.60)

Being an extremely shy young person, Samuel's particular personality may explain his lack of interest in accepting leadership positions in the high school orchestra program, as he may not have felt comfortable on the podium in front of his peers. It is interesting that Samuel never mentioned the opportunity to conduct in his portion of the interview.

### ***Intrinsic Factor – Motivation for Music***

Samuel was highly motivated to join orchestra because of family tradition. His brother and two sisters played or are currently playing in the high school program from which he graduated. It is interesting that even in the beginning of his studies, Samuel cites learning bass

because no one else in the family played it. Once he started taking lessons in the seventh grade, he enjoyed the solo literature so much that playing in the orchestra became secondary: “I got to express myself musically, whereas in the orchestra, you’re just kind of in the back, almost forgotten” (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.61).

Samuel’s motivation for music mirrors the motivation tendencies found by Schmidt (2005). Schmidt found a slight increase in scores for intrinsic or mastery orientations for older students while younger musicians tended to score higher on competitive, ego, and failure avoidance orientations. Samuel was motivated to practice and audition for district orchestra placement because he enjoyed the experience much more than his high school orchestra (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.62). During the interview he repeatedly railed against rehearsals that he felt were a waste of time:

For large chunks of time we’d just be standing there. Since our parts were so much easier, he’d be working with the other sections. We can’t leave, we just have to stand there and be attentive (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.63).

Samuel was also irritated at the apparent lack of consistency, or in some cases a tendency toward favoritism, that he perceived in the audition process of the high school orchestra:

There were times that I was section leader, but then there were times I wasn’t, and I don’t exactly don’t know why. He had an interesting procedure for how he seated us. We would record it and then submit it and he’d listen to it. But if I got the same score as the next guy, I’d be here and he’d be there, in front of me. I can’t say for sure, but I wondered if it was because he taught one of the middle schools and he already knew the kids (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.64)

When asked if he ever spoke to Mr. Burton about his suspicions, Samuel shrugged it off, saying: “It didn’t much matter to me.” When pushed to explain what he meant, he answered: “I just wanted to know the reason why we were seated where we were. And I just never knew.”

For a student who didn’t care much about orchestra class, Samuel was very prickly when asked to give further details about what he experienced during chair placements. He seemed at odds against the rules of the classroom, wondering why they applied to him and to his section. Much of his frustration, naturally, was directed toward Mr. Burton. In one instance, he said that Mr. Burton “wouldn’t understand” about a conflict with a soccer game:

Orchestra often messed with stuff that you’d want to do outside of school. Since you only had one concert per semester it was a given that I was going to miss the soccer game. The coach would always understand because orchestra’s for a grade. I think my junior year some of the soccer boys got to miss a concert, but that was because it was senior night or something special. But it would have to be something special like that for me to miss. My orchestra teacher wouldn’t understand (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.65).

Samuel’s high school orchestra focused on competition, in this case chairing for seating placement. It is interesting to note the discomfort with which Samuel discussed the seating process and his placements. It is almost as though he is embarrassed by it. And, just as Asmus and Harrison (1986) found, if Samuel placed an emphasis, as he said he did in regard to his solo playing, on musical affect, then it should come as no surprise that he chose to quit playing in orchestra on the collegiate level.

Samuel was extremely quiet and it took time for him to articulate his feelings on motivation for music. There was no doubt that he enjoyed private lessons and the audition

processes for district orchestra and solo contest. Those opportunities definitely intrinsically motivated him. But just as Lacaille, Koestner, and Gaudreau (2007) found that the nature of artistic performance could foster avoidant tendencies due to the regular chance of failure or success in public, could the frustration at not understanding the orchestra placements, and the resultant perceived embarrassment at receiving a lower chair than he felt he deserved have had just as much of an influence on his experience in orchestra and attitude toward and within that experience?

### ***Extrinsic Factor – Parental Musicianship and Support in Music***

Samuel's parents encouraged all of their children to participate in school orchestra. Samuel's oldest sister played violin and his older brother played cello. His younger sister, who is still in Mr. Burton's orchestra program, plays viola. Samuel chose bass because no other sibling played it. But he's convinced that had he chosen not to participate in music, his parents would've supported that decision as well. What is interesting, however, is that Samuel's father did not want his son to major in music for fear that Samuel wouldn't have many job prospects after graduation (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.66).

His parents helped Samuel to navigate the options for playing in college orchestra. When Samuel discovers that he wasn't proactive enough to get enrolled in orchestra before the deadline, his parents assist him by driving his bass to him at university (see Appendix F – 4.67). Dumais and Ward (2009) would see this as an example of cultural capital, the non-financial assets that help people navigate social mobility. It is this kind of parental strategic interaction, the parents' garnering resources and information for their child, that is linked to both access to higher education and graduation (p. 262).



Samuel's parents made sure that he studied privately and was involved in an active bass studio where he took individual and group lessons. Another example of Samuel's parents' cultural capital was their insistence that he continue playing the bass after they purchased a good instrument for him:

My parents were definitely on board with the lessons. It was definitely harder to convince them to buy an instrument because they're so expensive. I had to assure them I'd be playing for a while and not just be done after high school (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.67).

Zdzinski (1996) found that “for affective outcomes, the strength of parental involvement increased with age” (p. 34). Samuel's parents certainly helped their son, and their other children, to be successful musicians. They were active in the high school orchestra booster program, impressing Mr. Burton with their involvement:

His parents are wonderful! Absolutely wonderful! Mom and dad were both really, really supportive of him. Providing him with lessons, transporting him, bought him a really nice bass. And they're supportive of me and my program as well. They were really engaged and helped, you know. I could call and they'd be there right away to help (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.68)

Creech (2010) found that positive outcomes in music could be achieved in several areas. In Samuel's experience, his parents helped him by providing a structured environment for practice, taking care to build teacher-parent rapport, and communicating with the teacher about Samuel's progress (p. 29). This is exemplified by Mr. Burton's insistence that Samuel's parents wouldn't have influenced Samuel to quit:

Dad is a funny guy, really supportive. Mom is a little quieter, not a lot of sense of humor, but very respectful. I think one of her biggest heartbreaks was when I had to call home about one of her children, you know, about a conflict we had. I would tell her what the conflict was, how I handled it, and how her children did. And she was always satisfied with the way I handled things. But you could tell there was some heartbreak there that she was even getting the phone call (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.69).

Samuel's parents supported their children's musical development over several years. They exemplify Dai and Schader's (2002) finding that parents seek out musical training for their child for the general educational value derived from the pursuit and not for the development of musical talent (p. 135). Samuel's parents did not demonstrate what Dai and Schader found regarding "parents with high achievement values in music tend to have biased expectancy beliefs in favor of their children" (p. 142). In fact, according to Mr. Burton, they were very respectful to his concerns and were never confrontational about the discipline issues that Samuel was demonstrating in rehearsal.

### ***Extrinsic Factor – Director Influence***

Samuel had a very tenuous relationship with Mr. Burton throughout his time in high school orchestra. What is most fascinating about Samuel and Mr. Burton's relationship is the fact that Samuel saw it as adversarial as he did while Mr. Burton saw the relationship as one of reciprocal respect. From the outside looking in, it is difficult to ascertain exactly what happened between the two, because their individual "truth" is based on their own experience and feelings about them. What can be certain, though, is that their relationship is central to Samuel's experience in high school orchestra as exemplified by both of their narratives.

It is interesting that Mr. Burton tried to give Samuel more responsibility in the orchestra classroom because he cared that Samuel was not being challenged and felt that his acting out was from boredom or lack of challenge. He asked Samuel to run sectionals with younger students and even offered to have him conduct (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.60). Teacher involvement and motivation is central to students’ experiences in the classroom (Skinner and Belmont, 1993). In their study on reciprocal effects of teacher behavior, Skinner and Belmont found that “teacher provision of both autonomy support and optimal structure predicted children’s motivation across the school year,” and that “students who are behaviorally disengaged receive teacher responses that should further undermine their motivation” (p. 571). According to this study, Samuel should have had a much more positive experience with Mr. Burton than he indicated.

But Samuel repeatedly referred to the “ups and downs” of his high school orchestra experience:

For me, high school was a time of ups and downs. I would often excel at the music that was being set in front of me because, to be honest, it was really easy for me, so sometimes it would feel monotonous. Often times as well, my high school director didn’t see eye to eye. Because of this, I focused on myself as a player than the whole orchestra. I enjoyed district orchestras, but the playing ability between them and my high school orchestra made high school orchestra more of just something I had to do to enjoy these other experiences (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.70)

Samuel used the term “up and down” in both the initial survey and in the interview, both times in reference to his relationship with Mr. Burton. Samuel mentions in passing that their relationship hadn’t started well because he had offered his opinion and Mr. Burton didn’t

appreciate it (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.71). He stated that their relationship improved over time, but it was halfhearted. Mr. Burton believed that the relationship had started poorly because of another bass player, two years ahead of Samuel, who influenced Samuel in a very negative way. We'll call the other bass player *Jack* in this reconstruction of an event from Samuel's first year in orchestra:

Mr. Burton liked to start the school year with different games so that students would learn a little something about each other. At the beginning of the hour, Jack, a junior bass player, was in the violin section talking with a couple of girls. Mr. Burton asked Jack to head back to his section and Jack refused at first. He told a couple of jokes under his breath and finally made his way across the room. Mr. Burton started the game "One Truth, One Lie." In it, people had to tell one thing that was true about them and one thing that was a lie. When it came time for Jack to offer his truth and lie, both were extremely off-color. Mr. Burton chose not to confront Jack but proceeded on to Samuel. Samuel offered that he really loved soccer and that he really wanted to be in orchestra. Mr. Burton knew that Samuel's lie was that he really wanted to be in orchestra. Stung by the words, Mr. Burton chose to let it pass without comment (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.72).

Samuel's love of music was in independent music making and he couldn't see, or didn't want to see, the importance of every instrument in an ensemble and the collaborative nature of each part in an orchestra. Because of this, Samuel didn't understand why he had to attend required orchestra events when he really wanted to be somewhere else. He especially didn't like having to miss soccer games for orchestra events:

There were times that I enjoyed it and there were times where I was like, “Why do I have to be here?” The stuff we were required to do, we had to miss other stuff because it was a grade. I played soccer but I always had to miss a game. And I wanted to be at the game, but I had to be at the concert because it’s a grade (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.73).

Samuel mentions disciplinary issues in this particular analysis as well, but this time he sees himself as culpable:

And then there was the disciplinary stuff. It was probably my fault that I got into trouble. I always played after he said to stop for like large chunks of time because oftentimes our part is the easier part. We’d just be standing there. There’s nothing to do (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.73)

Samuel was obviously frustrated but it is difficult to discern if it is because he didn’t want to be in orchestra or if he wanted to be more challenged in orchestra. When given opportunities that would challenge him, Samuel passed on them (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.75). Samuel grew more discontented during his time in high school orchestra and his criticisms of Mr. Burton grew more pointed. “I feel that he really didn’t really understand the bass,” Samuel says of Mr. Burton. “He couldn’t tell me what to do better. I feel like he didn’t necessarily understand what was coming from our section.” But he also acknowledged that Mr. Burton was doing his best: “You could see that he was trying the best he could. It was just difficult to endure” (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.74). A student’s perception of their own personal and musical successes can be influenced by the amount of input they are given in the classroom. Scruggs (2009) notes “even if the director leads a perfect rehearsal, he or she has not necessarily engaged the students in a meaningful musical experience” (p. 54). Samuel’s

experience seems to confirm this: “Oftentimes, our part was the easier part, so for large chunks of time we’d be standing there with nothing to do.”

Mr. Burton was aware of the tension between himself and Samuel. He wanted to challenge Samuel but the things he tried Samuel resisted: “There’s part of me that just thinks he’s a hard kid.” He even reached out to Samuel’s father. Mr. Burton wanted to know if Samuel’s father thought Mr. Burton hadn’t challenged Samuel enough in orchestra. “He assures me that it had nothing to do with the orchestra at school or anything,” he said (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.75). It is possible that Samuel’s father was being kind. Or it could be that Samuel wasn’t communicating his frustrations to his parents.

Samuel had many frustrations with Mr. Burton, but one stands out from the others due to his passionate elucidation of it:

There were times when I was section leader, but then there were times I wasn’t, and I don’t exactly know why. He had an interesting procedure for how he seated us. We could record it and then submit it and he’d listen to it. But if I got the same score as the next guy, I’d be here and he’d be there, in front of me.

And then there is a twist that hadn’t been mentioned prior to this moment:

I can’t say for sure, but I wondered if it was because he taught one of the middle schools and he already knew those kids. I didn’t much matter to me. I just wanted to know the reason why were seated where we were. And I just never knew (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.76).

Samuel’s quick addition of “It didn’t much matter to me,” spoke volumes. There is no doubt that he is frustrated by what he saw as nepotism, but he returned immediately to his self-defensive stance of “it doesn’t matter.” It mattered to Samuel; more than he cared to admit.

Samuel's opinion of Mr. Burton softens when asked whether he thought Mr. Burton cared about him. He thought about it for a moment and then offered the following:

I think he cared. I think he cared about me as a person. There were times that he'd trust me to go and work with the younger students, or go do some errands. You could definitely tell that he appreciated what I did for him. And when solo ratings came out and when results from district came out, he'd always come to me afterwards to encourage and compliment me. So, yeah, I think he cared (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.77).

Mr. Burton employed methods by which students could have input and autonomy in the classroom. In the previous vignette, Samuel acknowledges that Mr. Burton asked him to work with other students and this framed Mr. Burton in a much more positive light. Fredricks (2011, p. 333) found that behavioral, emotional and cognitive engagement can be supported through teachers' and support staffs' management approaches. The study showed that teachers and support staff can increase engagement in several ways, at least three of which Mr. Burton employed with Samuel: he showed Samuel that he cared about him (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.77); he created an environment in which peer learning is facilitated in a positive manner (see Appendix F – Narrative Analyses 4.75, 4.77); and he was clear and consistent in regard to expectations, rules, and routine procedures and contacted parents regularly as needed (see Appendix F – Narrative Analyses 4.72, 4.73, 4.75).

Toward the end of the interview, Mr. Burton was asked if he had anything else to add to Samuel's story. He was quiet for a moment and looked troubled. Mr. Burton said it was hard to explain, but that he thought that Samuel was incapable of gratitude. He sat for a moment longer and then he told the following story:

When we were at state contest, he essentially destroyed a girl's cello. I actually saw it happen, and there was fault on many levels. But I sure went to bat for Samuel. I got involved with the music store and the girl's director and it put me in a very uncomfortable position. I went to bat for him, and I just got the impression from him that he just didn't care. He might even, deep down inside, been extremely grateful. He was not very emotional at all (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.78)

In the end, what it came down to for Mr. Burton was Samuel's inability to express gratitude for what had been done for him. For Samuel, it was that Mr. Burton did not understand the bass very well and didn't challenge his students hard enough. Samuel was self-motivated enough that he was able to continue playing the bass while in college, albeit in private lessons only. And, although not explicitly stated, Samuel was most surely influenced to not continue in college orchestra because of his negative experience in his high school orchestra.

#### ***Extrinsic Factor – Socioeconomic Status (SES)***

Samuel did not state any financial impediments as being the reason behind his decision to not participate in orchestra on the collegiate level. His financial concerns had more to do with how to receive the quality lessons he wanted without having to pay the high cost of tuition. He knew that paying for lessons privately would be much cheaper than enrolling in the university's school of music and paying for lessons with the music faculty. However, he did cite the care and upkeep of his instrument in the dry upper Great Plains winters as being a possible financial burden (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.79).

At the end of the interview, Samuel offered a succinct summary of his decision to quit participating in orchestra at the collegiate level:



I don't think I can pinpoint a reason from my high school experience. My private teacher really pushed me to audition and to do music, but I wanted to do chemical engineering. So a lot of it was based on if I could do music and then if it would work out, then I probably would have. But it would have increased my length of school, so it wasn't worth it to me for that reason (see Appendix F – Narrative Analysis 4.80).

Samuel was not worried about the financial aspect, but more about the scheduling and logistics of participation in orchestra, and therefore the length of his academic enrollment at the university.

## Chapter 5 - Conclusions and Recommendations

### *Summary of the Study*

The present study was designed to examine why high-achieving orchestra students from suburban high schools do not continue to participate in music at the collegiate level, and discover the personal and social reasons influencing that decision. The study also sought to identify if and how the students continued to make music. Past research has demonstrated that several factors have influenced student motivation and persistence in college and in music studies. Since I examined why high-achieving suburban high school orchestra musicians chose to not participate in college orchestra class, it was important to gather the stories and experiences of the research participants in as much detail as possible through narrative research and analysis. Narrative analyses reflect a reality that is revealed through the story, or stories, being told which are then shared with the influence of the interviewer and in context of the time and place of the interview.

The musical and non-musical factors of retention and attrition were studied within given intrinsic and extrinsic confines (persistence, self-concept of musical ability, motivation for music, parental musicianship and support, director influence, and socioeconomic status). I collected stories (along with initial data via surveys and email correspondence) about participants' perceptions of lived experiences that were then co-constructed by the participant and me. Participants shared stories about past and current experiences as well as plans for future ones. Because of this, narrative research stories were shaped into a chronology by me to make temporal sense using a social constructivism framework. I was not bound by a prior-selected theory, but inductively developed patterns and meanings.

Data was collected via personal interviews with participants and their high school orchestra teachers between December 16, 2014 and December 30, 2014. Using a Zoom H1

Handy Recorder, along with an iPhone 5 with a recording app for backup, the interviews were digitally recorded and transferred to a password protected archival site (Drop Box). Each interview was transcribed using Microsoft Word in preparation of the initial narratives and data analysis.

I began each interview by asking the participants to tell their (or their former student's) story, revealing the decision to not continue playing in college orchestra. As little guidance as possible was provided so as to not lead the interviewee, creating a natural unfolding of each story. Following the participant's story, I followed with questions and restating of important issues (See Appendix A) to clarify points as needed. Special care was taken to use open-ended questions so as to get rich, detailed stories (See Appendix D).

Upon completion of the interview, I summarized each interview into a narrative and shared it with the participant via email for member checking. Each participant was asked to provide feedback for the narrative and return it to me within two weeks. All edited narratives were returned by February 15, 2015. Due to the constructs of narrative analysis, which require that I be an active participant (a filter of sorts), it was important that the participants have an opportunity to edit the narratives and provide feedback to guarantee that each participant's story was as accurate to their experience as possible.

I did not seek one singular *truth*, but rather each participant's perceptions about the decision to not continue playing in college orchestra. By using the stories of their high school orchestra teachers, along with their Initial Survey and email communications, I was able to triangulate information and form a chronological story about each participant's decision to not continue playing in their university orchestra.

Because it fit the particular needs of this study, and because I found no other study examining high school to college instrumental music attrition using a qualitative narrative analysis, I used Riessman's (2008) adaptation of William Labov's structural coding (based on his seminal 1972 work in linguistics) to analyze the data. Using Robichaux's (2003) expansion of Labov's coding, I was able to establish a structural analysis of the narrative that reinforced the thematic analysis and helped establish triangulation.

I coded each participant's narrative along with that of his or her high school orchestra teacher. Coding was supported by the use of NVivo software. Fact-checking of responses from the initial survey along with answers from the participants' narrative and that of their high school director's narrative allowed for a more robust and reliable narrative analysis. Definitive answers were not be sought or expected, but rather the collection of data led to a greater understanding and illustration of why the research participants chose to end their participation in orchestra rehearsals on the collegiate level.

### *Conclusions*

The findings of this study should facilitate the understanding of why three high-achieving suburban high school orchestral musicians chose to not participate in orchestra while in college. Although this study only examined three participants' experiences and cannot be generalized to a greater population, the findings can also aid the faculty of collegiate schools and departments of music in understanding why students do not choose to enroll in orchestra and what can be done to increase non-music major participation in orchestral ensembles. My intent was to facilitate further dialog as to how to increase the participation of non-music major students in collegiate orchestral ensembles.

The primary research question was: Why do high-achieving high school orchestral musicians, who had at least six years of training on an instrument, choose not to continue with music study in a collegiate orchestra? *Orchestral musician* was defined as a student who played violin, viola, cello or bass in their school string orchestra. *High-achieving* was defined as student musicians who were chosen for district and/or state ensembles (all-state orchestra, for example) and/or were members of a select, audition-only ensemble (such as a youth orchestra or a select ensemble at school).

Sub-Questions that were understood include:

1. How many years did the participant study their instrument?
2. How did the participant view their high school music experience?
3. What was participant's relationship with their music teacher(s)?
4. What opportunities were available for further music study beyond the high school music class?
5. Were there emergent factors that influenced participants to not continue in collegiate ensembles?

The conclusions are described within the six categories of intrinsic and extrinsic factors that influenced a student's decision to quit participation in orchestra on the collegiate level: (a) persistence; (b) self-concept of musical ability; (c) motivation for music; (d) parental musicianship and support; (e) director influence; and (f) socioeconomic status.

### ***The Influence of Persistence on Participants' Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level***

All three participants experienced some form of challenge associated with participation in collegiate orchestra. Although not the only reason these students did not participate in orchestra

beyond high school, it was one of the issues discovered in this research. If, as Kelly, LaVergne, Boone, and Boone (2012) suggested, university music personnel “actively seek input from students to ensure that their social needs are being attained” (p. 660), music students could be connected across a range of social factors in the university, benefitting the students’ desire to continue to make music, but also increasing student matriculation because of the support received in this particular social community (p. 662).

The participants’ experiences exhibited similarities to those in a study which found that extracurricular involvement and informal contact with faculty is important and that “the influence of orientation on students’ initial integration into the campus social system is manifest more in extent of involvement than in quality or impact of involvement” (Pascarella, Terenzini, and Wolfe, 1986, p. 170). Maria had very positive feelings for all of the universities she visited, going so far as to seriously explore the university on the Great Plains recommended by Mr. Sanders. But Maria’s disappointment in the journalism school at that university, coupled with the complete lack of communication on the part of the bass instructor, made it much easier for her to cross that college off her list of possibilities. Had that university maintained the broadcast journalism program she was seeking, she insisted that she would still be playing. Samuel had been torn on whether to continue in orchestra but was certain that he wanted to continue to play. He did look into double-majoring in chemical engineering and music, but the engineering advisors told him it would be extremely difficult to make the schedule work. He did look into what it would take to minor in music, but in the end he couldn’t necessarily see how that would be to his advantage. The interactions with university personnel defined some experiences for these participants; however, social interactions also influenced all three participants’ experiences and their ultimate decision to not participate in the college orchestra program.

Bernadette knew from the beginning of college, probably more likely in the middle of her senior year in high school, that she was not going to play in her college orchestra. The lack of financial incentives coupled with the opinions of peers that had been in the university orchestra influenced Bernadette's decision to quit playing. Bernadette struggled with her understanding that in order to continue playing in college she would have to overcome what she came to view as insurmountable obstacles. She would be forced to find time in her schedule for orchestra rehearsals. The music building was a long walk from her dorm. Her peers who had been in the university orchestra spoke of the time commitments and the fact that it only earned one credit hour, for which she would have to pay tuition. And, finally and most brutally honest, she didn't feel like finding a way to practice. All of these things, she said, contributed to her *burnout*.

Bernadette's chosen major, at the time she graduated from high school, was engineering. She had devoted so much time to her music studies in her first three years of high school that she felt she was woefully ill prepared for stringent college academics. She worried that she would not have enough time to devote to her studies if she participated in the university orchestra.

Maria's college choice had a profound influence on her decision to quit playing in orchestra. She confessed that had she attended the private university on the Great Plains, she probably would still be playing the bass, as that university had school instruments she could have played. But the decision to attend the Jesuit university on the Great Lakes ended that possibility, at least in her own estimation.

Maria had been very open to the idea of playing in collegiate orchestra. She enlisted the help of Mr. Sanders to look into the possibility of playing at the Great Plains university. And, even though she didn't end up attending that particular university, she entertained that option very seriously. She loved the university's campus, the area in which it was located, and even the

level of the orchestra program. But when she visited the journalism department, she was dismayed at the lack of broadcast curricula. She wanted to be on camera and this particular school was known for print media. And it didn't help that the bass instructor would not return her repeated efforts at contact.

All of the participants' persistence was heavily impacted by their social interactions, supporting Kelly, LaVergne, Boone, and Boone's (2012) finding that particular "personal characteristics, prior experiences, and personal commitments" played a large part in their lack of persistence in orchestra. Maria's persistence was heavily impacted by her social interactions. Her particular life experiences played a large part in her persistence in orchestra. She was influenced by Mr. Sanders' encouragement to continue playing at the college level, but was unhappy with the journalism department at the school he had encouraged her to attend. She couldn't see herself taking the time and effort required to make playing the bass a possibility at her current university.

In Bernadette's case, her high school social interactions, especially those within the private viola studio in which she participated, were extremely negative and formed her view that she was not good enough to continue playing in college. Maria had very positive social interactions in almost everything in which she participated. Maria had so many different social interactions between choir, student government, musical theatre, etc., it was difficult for Mr. Sanders to tell if she *really* enjoyed orchestra and was genuinely interested in continuing in orchestra at the university level, or if she was just trying to make him happy by seeming to be interested in continuing. Samuel's interactions with his peers, and most especially his orchestra director, formed his view of social interactions in high school orchestra class. Upon entering



university he lacked a strong social connection, so the connections he made in private lessons by using the contacts of his private lesson teacher back home remained strongest.

The interactions that each of the participants experienced with their respective college music departments may have had a negative influence on their decision to discontinue in orchestra. Maria and Mr. Sanders received no response from the Great Plains university. Maria was also pushed away by student perception of acceptance requiring a music major or minor at two of her possible universities. Bernadette's focus on scholarships led her to believe that participation in orchestra wasn't worth the time and effort.

Samuel presented an especially fascinating twist to the research in that, although he didn't play in his collegiate orchestra, he continued to actively make music as a soloist. He took weekly private lessons and practiced daily. Samuel had established his own social network through private lessons. Like Maria, his particular life experiences had influenced his decision to not continue in orchestra. Those experiences were marked by an unsatisfactory high school orchestra experience but a strong commitment to personal musicianship through private study. Samuel enjoyed his private bass lessons so much he didn't care about joining an orchestra as long as he was happy making music on his own.

It turned out that the ties that Samuel created at university were not in the orchestra program, but through existing ties from his private teacher back home. His parents strongly influenced his persistence in keeping with private lessons. But like Bernadette, Samuel worried too much about the *unknowns*, such as how to find time to practice, where he could safely store his bass, and how he could transport it without a vehicle across campus in the cold months of the year.

In reference to persistence, high-achieving orchestra students may choose not to participate in collegiate orchestra due to the challenges presented by interactions with university personnel. The lack of financial incentives or the availability of instruments for students may also pose a challenge to persistence. Finally, the amount and kind of social interaction each high-achieving orchestra student experienced in high school and early in their collegiate career may directly influence their persistence in collegiate orchestra.

***The Influence of Self-Concept of Musical Ability on Participants' Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level***

High school orchestra teachers should encourage as many positive peer relationships within their curricular constraints as possible. The manner in which students interact with one another, their teacher, and outside musical activities influence how they view themselves and their own abilities. A careful examination of students' private teachers' philosophies and pedagogical approaches would benefit parents who do not have a background in music to ensure that private teachers offer not only the finest musical instruction but also the most supportive environment in which to learn. Both the orchestra director and the private teacher's particular personality and pedagogical philosophy needs to be examined in the greater context of student success, defined by how the students view themselves as musicians and how they see themselves making music for the rest of their lives.

The present study examined how participants' self-concepts of musical ability influenced their decision to not continue in orchestra and if their high school orchestra teacher corroborated that view. In Bernadette's experience, she initially had a very high self-concept of musical ability, propped up by the observations of her early teachers and the support of her parents. She spoke of a plateau, in which she exhausted her innate talent, and then admitted that she never

learned to practice in such a way that would advance her playing. It was a poignant statement when Bernadette stated wistfully, “I couldn’t tell you where I could have been today.” Even though throughout her initial survey and interview she kept referring to being *burned out*, she thinks about where she *could have been* had she kept playing. But her dealings with the private lesson teacher and her peers with which she worked at the local university during her junior year had a profound influence on her self-concept of musical ability. She chose to not pursue a music career for which she may have been qualified but felt that she lacked ability, a finding corroborated by Dweck (2000).

Having progressed with relative ease through her early studies, Bernadette was forced to reexamine her own musical ability when she joined the new viola studio. She had never been in a situation in which she was the weakest player. Coupled with the fact that Bernadette never learned *how* to practice because she could achieve to high levels through rehearsals only, she discovered a new level of expectation in the viola studio. The tragedy of the situation was that instead of inspiring her to practice harder or differently, she chose to not practice at all and grew pessimistic about her musical abilities. The belief that she could not get better through practice influenced her decision to not pursue a degree in music at university. It led her to put the viola away permanently, seemingly precluding a possibility that she might one day play for sheer enjoyment.

It is not difficult to see how Bernadette’s self-concept of musical ability diminished over time. It is interesting, though, how much Bernadette came to rely on her high school orchestra class to get her through the setbacks that she perceived in the private studio. As Kruse (2012) found, Bernadette saw the high school orchestra as a safe place in which she could be herself.

Throughout the interview, and even touched upon briefly in the initial survey, Maria spoke very highly of her abilities on the bass. It was not an arrogant boast, but a genuine appreciation for the work she had done on the instrument. She loved the fact that she took an instrument known for simple bass lines and turned it into a vehicle for expression. And through hard work, she made what she called “serious music.” In Maria’s experience, she demonstrated a very high self-concept of musical ability, supported by the observations of her high school orchestra director.

Maria’s observation of her past musical experiences, and how she saw herself performing in the *future* shaped her self-concept of musical ability. Even though she didn’t necessarily see herself performing, she did see herself making music later in life. Her self-concept of musical ability was often tied to what she saw as the physical limitations of competing against other players. She worried that her diminutive stature, at only 4’ 11” tall, would keep her from being competitive in a professional symphony orchestra against male competitors who played full-sized instruments. Additionally, the family’s financial limitations kept them from buying a high quality, fractional size instrument for her.

Maria’s evolution as a musician, from the fourth grade through her experience observing the Chicago Symphony Orchestra concert, corroborated Dweck’s (2000) finding that students’ beliefs about their own abilities develop over time, through experiences they have, and from opinions of others. Maria is a strong-willed person. And although she couldn’t see herself competing in the world of professional orchestras due to her size, she did have the drive and tenacity to compete for a job in front of a camera. Her views were very black and white in regard to pursuing music as a career. In her mind, if she couldn’t be a professional bassist with a symphony orchestra, there was no point in pursuing music any further. But she is still actively

involved in making music whenever she is able, as exemplified by her playing piano at a friend's house earlier in the semester.

This particular event framed a particular paradox in Maria's self-concept of musical ability. Even though she had chosen to not pursue music as a career, she amazed herself by her ability to recall piano music from memory. On one hand she didn't believe that she had what it takes in order to be a professional musician, but at the same time impressed herself with her ability to play piano. "When I'm caught up and don't have time to think, I just want to make music," she said about the incident at her friend's apartment.

Samuel's self-concept of musical ability was already highly developed in high school. So much so that he viewed high school orchestra as something he had to do in order to participate in the events that he found important. He found the music to be too easy and rehearsals were laborious. He turned his focus toward his own playing, concentrating on auditions for district orchestra and solo contests.

Samuel definitely believed that he was talented enough but he also showed the hard work and initiative needed in order to prepare high-quality literature. Samuel was a difficult student to please in the classroom. Mr. Burton recognized that Samuel wasn't being challenged musically and offered Samuel extra leadership responsibilities. Samuel's particular personality may explain his lack of interest in accepting leadership positions in the high school orchestra program. He was an extremely shy young person, so he may not have felt comfortable on the podium in front of his peers. It is interesting that Samuel never mentioned the opportunity to conduct in his portion of the interview, perhaps inferring that such opportunities held little meaning for him.

Students believe that their success or failure in a pursuit is based on several factors including ability, effort, task difficulty, and luck (Weiner, 1986). Student musicians often fall into two categories: those who believe that success is based on inherent talent and those who believe success can be achieved through hard work. Over time, Bernadette came to believe that she had exhausted her innate ability and that she could not put forth the effort to compete with her peers in the private studio. Samuel knew that he had the ability, and if he was challenged by music that stretched his abilities, he knew that he could practice to make up for it.

Rosevear (2010) found that students' beliefs about why they are successful influenced the amount of work they are willing to invest and the amount of achievement experienced. Mr. Sanders certainly helped Maria develop her self-concept of musical ability, as her earliest, and fondest, memories are of working with him in elementary and middle school orchestra classes and rehearsals. By helping children develop a "positive music self-concept" (p. 23) early on in their education, negative self-views are less likely to develop and fewer barriers to rewarding musical experiences may arise. Bernadette sounded resentful when she spoke about how her earliest teachers recognized her perfect pitch; it was as if she blamed them for being overly positive in their estimates. Samuel grudgingly admitted that it did matter to him that Mr. Burton acknowledged his successes at district orchestra and solo contests; Mr. Burton's opinion influenced Samuel's self-concept of musical ability at least minimally. Students' beliefs about their own abilities develop over time, through experiences they have, and from opinions of others.

Bernadette's experiences were developed over time: the early, successful, and overly positive assessments of her elementary and middle school years in which she didn't practice; and the later, highly critical, and less-successful experiences within the private studio setting of high

school. It should be noted that the overly positive and successful experiences, which Rosevear found to be so critical in helping shape rewarding musical experiences later in life, did not sustain Bernadette's self-concept of musical ability. The early successes, earned without the hard work of sustained practice, seemed to have little effect on sustaining her self-concept of musical ability once pushed into the highly competitive studio of her new private lesson teacher.

Kruse (2012) found that choral musicians' self-esteem was highest as young adults and hypothesized that the "amount of time spent away from school-based music experiences coupled with other issues related to aging such as health concerns, income adjustments, and role changes might contribute to a gradual decline in self-esteem" (p. 69). This is definitely true in Bernadette's case. The episode, years after having chosen to quit playing viola, in which she picked up the instruments and broke into tears illustrates Kruse's findings. Bernadette panicked at the notion that her fingers didn't remember how to play and she once again put the viola under her bed, this time for good.

Welch, Himonides, Saunders, Papageorgi, and Sarazin (2014) found that peer relationships "can be a powerful factor in nurturing (or hindering) successful participation and ongoing engagement, a finding related to the social benefit that is also evidenced in adolescent music activity, both in school and elsewhere" (p. 803). Bernadette, it could be argued, found how powerful the peer relationships in the new viola studio were on influencing her self-concept of musical ability and lowering her overall self-confidence. Maria was heavily influenced in the same manner the year in which she did not have Mr. Sanders as her orchestra teacher. It is telling that Maria's lack of respect for that particular teacher and her peers' lack of work ethic occurred in the same year as her trip to the Chicago Symphony Orchestra.

In reference to self-concept of musical ability, high-achieving orchestra students may choose not to participate in collegiate orchestra due to the challenges presented by peer relationships and the manner in which they interact with other student musicians, their music teacher, and outside musical activities. The musicians' observations of past musical experiences and how they see themselves making music in the future may also influence their decision to discontinue participation in collegiate orchestra. Finally, these high-achieving orchestra students may be influenced to quit orchestra because of their own perception of success or failure due to factors such as ability, effort, task difficulty, and luck.

***The Influence of Motivation for Music on Participants' Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level***

Bernadette's experiences, especially the stark contrasts between what she was feeling about her high school orchestra and her private lesson ensemble, corroborated the findings of Schmidt (2005) in that she grew from being motivated by competitive, ego, and failure motivation orientations at the beginning of her music training to a more intrinsically motivated, mastery orientation by the end of high school. Bernadette's earliest memories of her motivation for music involve the support of her teachers and musical peers. And, whereas she used to do music for "fun" as a younger child, she soon grew tired of the amount of work required then hindered by the amount of positive reinforcement received from private lesson teacher and the ensemble in which she played for him. She relied more and more on her high school orchestra, and the students in it who, although very talented, chose to participate in music for a fun, enriching experience with their peers.

And, although her relationship with Mr. Powers grew to be more and more tenuous, Bernadette relied more heavily on the relationships among her peers in the high school orchestra.



It was in her high school orchestra class that she felt the most comfortable by the end of her playing career. It is the friendships that she formed through music that made music bearable. As she said, “everything really wasn’t fun for me any more besides high school orchestra.”

Maria’s experiences, and her achievements, as she listed them chronologically, fell in line with Schmidt’s (2005) finding as well. Maria was inspired and rewarded by the fact that she was the only bass player in elementary school, but as she matured, she wanted to have a more complete experience in the orchestra classroom and rehearsal settings while in middle and high school. Maria was not averse to practicing, and Mr. Sanders and she both stated that she was practicing between one and three hours a day early in her high school orchestra career. She enjoyed the process and was motivated by the challenge of it.

Maria spoke of how she was motivated to use all of her different talents in journalism. She also talked about how music gave her the emotional rush she desired, and how those emotions translated directly to broadcast journalism. Maria was searching for the emotional high that she found in her music through her journalistic pursuits.

Samuel’s motivation for music also mirrored the motivation tendencies found by Schmidt (2005). Samuel was motivated to practice and audition for district orchestra placement because he enjoyed the experience much more than his high school orchestra, and during the interview he repeatedly railed against rehearsals that he felt were a waste of time. Samuel was also irritated at the apparent lack of consistency, or in some cases a tendency toward favoritism, that he perceived in the audition process of the high school orchestra and this pushed him toward a more intrinsic motivation for personal growth in his solo pursuits.

In their study of the value of intrinsic rather than traditional achievement goals for public artists, Lacaile, Koestner, and Gaudreau (2007) corroborated the finding that the nature of artistic

performance can foster avoidant tendencies due to the regular chance of failure or success in public (Kenny, 2004; Salmon, 1990) and that performance-approach and performance-avoidance goals had a negative effect on persistence and well-being measures (Lacaille, Koestner, and Gaudreau, 2007, p. 254). By the middle of her senior year in high school, Bernadette was beginning to recognize that her intrinsic needs for music making were not being met. She actively avoided situations in which she would be criticized while making music (private lessons and out-of-school ensemble rehearsals). She also actively sought out the only place in which she felt safe to create music: her high school orchestra class.

Maria admitted that it would've been much easier to play in orchestra had she gone to the university Mr. Sanders had suggested. The other two private colleges she had considered required a music minor to play in the orchestra. Again, Maria came back to the notion that she just wanted to play in orchestra for the enjoyment of it. Maria, throughout the initial survey and interview, returned to this theme repeatedly. Coupled with her struggles to purchase a bass, Maria's actions drew a parallel to the finding that the nature of artistic performance can foster avoidant tendencies due to the regular chance of failure or success in public (Lacaille, Koestner, and Gaudreau, 2007).

Samuel was extremely quiet and it took time for him to articulate his feelings on motivation for music. There was no doubt that he enjoyed private lessons and the audition processes for district orchestra and solo contest. Those opportunities definitely intrinsically motivated him. I wondered if the frustration at not understanding the orchestra placements, and the resultant perceived embarrassment at receiving a lower chair than he felt he deserved may have had just as much of an influence on his decision to quit playing in orchestra (Lacaille, Koestner, and Gaudreau, 2007).

Samuel's high school orchestra focused on competition, in this case chairing for seating placement. It is interesting to note the discomfort with which Samuel discussed the seating process and his placements and his inability to confront Mr. Burton about his concerns. It was almost as though he was embarrassed by it. And, just as Asmus and Harrison (1986) found, if Samuel placed an emphasis, as he said he did in regard to his solo playing, on musical affect, then it should have influenced his decision to quit playing in orchestra on the collegiate level as well.

Perhaps the most disturbing finding in regard to her motivation for music, at least for music education researchers, was Bernadette's statement that she "never" wished to play her viola again. In her narrative, Bernadette described picking up her viola a few years after high school and bursting into tears upon trying to play it. After having already decided to not continue to play in the university orchestra, she is emotionally detached from the notion of playing her viola again. But when she opened the case and picked up the instrument, she burst into tears. Bernadette could not articulate why she started to cry; it was almost as if she was reliving a traumatic experience. When she recounted this experience to her counselor, and the counselor wanted to explore it more, Bernadette immediately dismissed the possibility. She insisted it was a singular incidence without a deeper meaning. But she acknowledged the anger that she felt toward the end of high school and how she could no longer listen to classical music because she was so burned out by it.

At least two times during the interview, Mr. Sanders intimated that Maria was only looking into playing in college to please him. And he wondered if that was just her personality trait of wanting to attempt new things and please those around her. He couldn't be sure that she really wanted to play in college or not. It is fascinating that Maria's effusive personality

perplexed Mr. Sanders. He wanted her to play, but he also didn't want to push her too hard in case she was doing it for the wrong reasons. Arguably, he worried that if he encouraged her too much it would actually have the opposite result that he wanted.

I found Maria's consistent labeling of not wanting music to be a *job* to be the more likely motivation for why she did not play in college. She worried that she would lose her love of music; her love of playing solo literature just for the very enjoyment of it. She convinced herself that she will always play piano and sing, and that no one can take away her emotional attachment to music. This corroborated Asmus and Harrison's (1990) finding that college non-music majors place importance on affect in music.

Contrastingly, Mr. Powers worried that Bernadette lacked an emotional connection to her music making while in the high school orchestra. It was one of the more passionate moments during the interview, when he explained this concern. Bernadette, he said, never really reacted passionately to the music they performed. He could never really tell if Bernadette was feeling that same rush of emotions that other students articulated. The duality of Bernadette's experiences comes to the forefront. That she was motivated by her high school orchestra experience, especially toward the end of her senior year, there can be no doubt. But her evaluation of that time comes from a purely social interactive stance, whereas Mr. Powers evaluated her experience from a purely emotional one.

All of the participants' motivation characteristics were similar to the findings of Asmus (1986) and Asmus and Harrison (1990) in that as music students get older a "shift in attributed causes from effort to ability" takes place. Interestingly, motivated students most often cite effort attributions while students with low motivation cite ability (Asmus, 1986). Maria and Samuel's

motivations for music were driven by the desire to improve through hard work and effort, whereas Bernadette placed an emphasis on ability, or lack thereof.

The findings of this study would suggest that teachers turn their focus from a performance-oriented to an affect-oriented philosophy over the course of a student's time in the school orchestra program. This is in line with Asmus and Harrison's (1990) finding that college non-music majors place importance on affect in music. This is a fundamental change in the way orchestra programs are currently assessed by the majority of activities associations in the United States. It would necessitate the focus of orchestra programs to be more student-centered and less performance-centered.

The limited results of this study supported the finding that the nature of artistic performance can foster avoidant tendencies due to the regular chance of failure or success in public (Kenny, 2004; Salmon, 1990) and that performance-approach and performance-avoidance goals have a negative effect on persistence and well-being measures (Lacaille, Koestner, and Gaudreau, 2007, p. 254). If intrinsic goals are associated with "higher life satisfaction and lower intention to quit the discipline" (p. 253), then music educators should heed the researchers suggestion "to encourage intrinsic goals among students" (p. 254). And since artists with intrinsic goals reported the opposite, it is incumbent on music educators to strike a balance in which the student's individual intrinsic needs are met as well as those of the performance ensemble and its role in the school community.

***The Influence of Parental Musicianship and Support on Participants' Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level***

Maria benefitted from the advice and encouragement of Mr. Sanders in pushing her to play in college. However, Bernadette's parents and Samuel's parents lacked the wherewithal to

navigate the college orchestra application and audition process, at least in a timely manner in the case of Samuel. If, as Dumais and Ward (2009) found, cultural capital is more important for initial access to university, “with both arts-based and strategy-based cultural capital affecting enrollment” (p. 262), then high school music directors should do more to help parents of students interested in participating in college orchestra navigate the processes of enrolling in and auditioning for those classes. If parents’ garnering resources and information for their children is linked to both access to higher education and graduation (p. 262), then it falls to the high school music director to explain how the audition and scholarship processes work and how best to navigate them.

The high school music director might consider encouraging parental involvement in their student’s orchestral training. Zdizinski (1996) found that parental involvement was related to overall performance, affective, and cognitive musical outcomes (p. 34) and his findings are corroborated by the participants’ experiences in this study. All parents in this study were involved, to a certain extent, in their child’s music studies. Samuel’s parents exemplified the greatest involvement in that they were involved in the high school orchestra boosters, transported him to and from lessons and outside music activities, and purchased an instrument and made arrangements to transport it to Samuel’s university. Maria had similar support except that an instrument was never purchased due to its uncommon size. Bernadette’s parental involvement was minimal at the high school, but her father was very involved with youth symphony. Each participant’s particular situation supports Zdizinski’s finding that for affective outcomes, the strength of the parental involvement relationship increased with student age.

Creech (2010) found positive outcomes through music study may be achieved when parents

(1) elicit their children's views regarding appropriate parental involvement, (2) negotiate with their children over practising [sic] issues, within parameters set by the teacher, (3) provide a structured home environment for practice, (4) take an interest in promoting good teacher-pupil rapport, (5) communicate with the teacher in relation to the child's progress and (6) remain as a supremely interested audience (p. 29).

It is my recommendation that music educators endeavor to promote these six positive practices to parents of instrumental music students. And because Dai and Schader (2002) examined "parents' expectancy beliefs and values regarding their child's music training, regular academic work, and athletic activities" (p. 135) and found that parents seek out musical training for their child for the general educational value derived from the pursuit and not for the development of musical talent, I recommend that music educators promote a philosophy of nurturing affective outcomes among parents of music students.

A child's musical development takes a high level of parental involvement over a long period of time. When Dai and Schader examined "parents' expectancy beliefs and values regarding their child's music training, regular academic work, and athletic activities" (p. 135) they found that parents seek out musical training for their child for the general educational value derived from the pursuit and not for the development of musical talent. But, as the child develops into a more advanced player, parents change their beliefs and values (p. 135).

Bernadette's parents seem to exemplify this finding in that they focused on the talent of their daughter to the extent that when her motivation began to wane (upon entering her *burned out* phase) they began to struggle with their own beliefs about their daughter's career aspirations. Bernadette's mother was quick to support her daughter's decision to quit once an engineering major became her focus. And yet her father held out hope that his daughter might one day play

her viola again. There was a touch of bitter sweetness when she talked about her father's belief that Bernadette will have a mid-life crisis that leads back to playing her viola.

There is no doubt that Maria's parents were very supportive of her, regardless of whatever career she chose to pursue. This was corroborated throughout the interviews with both Maria and Mr. Sanders. Maria understood that her choice of career, either music or journalism, would not result in great financial reward. She insisted that her parents did not care about money; rather they wanted their children to be happy. Her parents, like Mr. Sanders, were supportive and understanding and did not question her changes in pursuits.

Parental musicianship and support for musical study is an example of cultural capital. Maria's parents exemplified the idea of cultural capital, the non-financial assets that help people navigate social mobility (e.g., level of education, speech patterns, clothing style, and physical experience, to name a few) that was first studied by Pierre Bourdieu (Brown, 1974). Researchers have studied the effects of parental influence on college persistence, attrition, and matriculation. And although never explicitly stated during the interview, Maria's parents certainly gave her and her brother the cultural capital needed to successfully navigate out of high school and into college and beyond. Her brother earned a degree in musical theatre at a private university on the East Coast prior to entering a career as an arts manager. Maria was able to pick and choose which of three private universities she would attend.

Mr. Sanders remembered Maria's father's involvement in Maria's music studies. In fact, Mr. Sanders was very complimentary of both parents stating that he "couldn't ask for better orchestra parents." Maria's mom served on the orchestra booster board and dad brought Maria to rehearsals daily. Mr. Sanders remembered Maria's parents attending every concert and event held by the high school orchestra. They embodied what Zdzinksi (1996) found in when he



studied parental involvement and cognitive, affective, and performance outcomes of band students in grades 4-12 (see Chapter 2, p. 20). Maria benefitted from her parents' involvement from elementary school through high school, especially in the area "concerning concert attendance, providing materials, participating in parent groups, and tape-recording student performances" (Zdzinski, p. 34).

Upon closer examination, Maria's parent's involvement in her musical training also corroborated the findings of Dai and Schader (2002) who researched "parents' expectancy beliefs and values regarding their child's music training, regular academic work, and athletic activities" (p. 135). Dai and Schader found that parents seek out musical training for their child for the general educational value derived from the pursuit and not for the development of musical talent. Maria's parents, although not musical themselves, gave their children the benefit of a high quality music education, supporting their son through an undergraduate degree in musical theatre at a prestigious private college and providing for Maria's private lessons, youth symphony tuition, and other musical activities and instruction.

Dai and Schader point out that "achievement of eminence is not the major criterion for success in music" and that "the intrinsic and extrinsic aspects of motivation underlying parental support" is more important in a particular subset of parents (p. 143). Maria's parents would definitely fall into this category. It is interesting, though, that even though Maria says her parents supported her decision to longer play in orchestra, her parents missed hearing music in their home.

Samuel's parents encouraged all of their children to participate in school orchestra. But he's convinced that had he chosen not to participate in music, his parents would've supported that decision as well. His parents helped Samuel to navigate the options for playing in college

orchestra. When Samuel discovered that he wasn't proactive enough to get enrolled in orchestra before the deadline, his parents assisted him by driving his bass to him at university. Dumais and Ward (2009) would see this as an example of cultural capital, the non-financial assets that help people navigate social mobility. It is this kind of parental strategic interaction, the parents' garnering resources and information for their child, which is linked to both access to higher education and graduation (p. 262). Samuel's parents made sure that he studied privately and was involved in an active bass studio where he took individual and group lessons. Another example of Samuel's parents' cultural capital was their insistence that he continue playing the bass after they purchased a good instrument for him.

Zdzinski (1996) found that "for affective outcomes, the strength of parental involvement increased with age" (p. 34). Samuel's parents certainly helped their son, and their other children, to be successful musicians. They were active in the high school orchestra booster program, impressing Mr. Burton with their involvement. Samuel's parents helped him by providing a structured environment for practice, taking care to build teacher-parent rapport, and communicating with the teacher about Samuel's progress (Creech, 2010, p. 29). This is why Mr. Burton insisted that Samuel's parents wouldn't have influenced Samuel to quit.

Samuel's parents supported their children's musical development over several years. They exemplify Dai and Schader's (2002) finding that parents seek out musical training for their child for the general educational value derived from the pursuit and not for the development of musical talent (p. 135). Samuel's parents did not demonstrate what Dai and Schader found regarding "parents with high achievement values in music tend to have biased expectancy beliefs in favor of their children" (p. 142). In fact, according to Mr. Burton, they were very respectful to

his concerns and were never confrontational about the discipline issues that Samuel was demonstrating in rehearsals.

***The Influence of the High School Orchestra Director on Participants' Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level***

By examining the role that the teacher played in the high school orchestra experience, I was able to understand various social dynamics that led to student engagement or disenfranchisement. Participants' relationships with their high school orchestra directors played a role in their decision not to continue playing on the collegiate level. I recommend the continued promotion of effort-attribution by music educators, especially throughout all levels of instruction, and that music educators adopt a philosophy that includes activities that foster student autonomy while increasing the opportunities for students to see life-long music making as a viable option.

Kuntz (2011) examined the role of band directors in encouraging lifelong participation in music as part of a larger qualitative study. Kuntz found that "although they may not hear it from their directors, there was an awareness of opportunities that were available to them as they transition to adulthood" (p. 29). The students in the Kuntz study also found that by serving as mentors for younger musicians, they helped create the vision of music as a lifelong process. Maria and Samuel both continued to make music after high school, but not in college orchestra. It is interesting that they had been engaged in mentoring younger students while in high school. And, although correlation never equals causation, I wondered if those specific experiences helped frame their desire to continue making music.

Reeve (2009) suggested several ways in which teachers can support students' perceptions of success through the support of autonomy in the classroom. These steps include: provide

explanatory rationales; rely on informational, non-controlling language; display patience to allow time for self-paced learning to occur; and acknowledge and accept students' expressions of negative affect (p. 168). Because controlling motivating style is linked to poor study outcomes, Reeve believed it is in both the students' and teachers' best interest to develop an autonomy-supportive style. Interestingly, Samuel was given several opportunities to engage in leadership roles in the orchestra classroom. He refused most of them, but like Maria, he did teach younger students. He taught sectional rehearsals for younger orchestra members while Maria taught private lessons to younger bass students. Bernadette did not mention any constructivist activities within her high school orchestra experience. Mr. Burton and Mr. Sanders actively sought to engage their students in activities that led to more student autonomy; however, in the end it was not enough to encourage their students to enroll in university orchestra.

Fredricks (2011) found that teachers and support staff can increase engagement in several ways, at least three of which Mr. Burton employed with Samuel. Mr. Burton employed methods by which students could have input and autonomy in the classroom; he offered Samuel the opportunity to mentor younger players as well as conducting the orchestra, which he didn't accept. Samuel acknowledged that Mr. Burton asked him to work with other students and this framed Mr. Burton in a much more positive light. Mr. Burton was also "clear and consistent in regard to expectations, rules, and routine procedures" (p. 333).

A student's perception of their own personal and musical successes can be influenced by the amount of input they are given in the classroom. Scruggs (2009) notes "even if the director leads a perfect rehearsal, he or she has not necessarily engaged the students in a meaningful musical experience" (p. 54). Samuel's experience seemed to confirm this. Samuel was obviously frustrated by his high school orchestra experience, but it is difficult to discern if it is

because he didn't want to be in orchestra or if he wanted to be more challenged in orchestra. When given opportunities that would challenge him, Samuel passed on them. Mr. Sanders challenged Maria by asking her to teach private lessons to younger students. She served as a mentor to elementary and middle school orchestra students during her time in middle school and high school orchestra. However, the classroom environment left behind by Mr. Sanders' predecessor at the high school made it difficult for him to teach. Maria, having grown discouraged by the lack of commitment from other students, moved on to different activities to fulfill her strong desire to succeed.

I recommend the continued promotion of effort-attribution by music educators, especially throughout all levels of instruction, not just at the beginning. In addition to the promotion of effort-attribution, music educators must also work with students on *how* to practice. All music teachers are guilty of saying, "Now go practice," but few take the steps necessary to demonstrate the proper way in which to practice. Additionally, I recommend that music educators adopt a philosophy that includes activities that foster student autonomy while increasing the opportunities for students to see life-long music making as a viable option. No teacher can be all things to every student, but by adding these simple steps to lesson plans, students can see the benefits of participation in music while in our ensembles *and* after graduation.

***The Influence of Socioeconomic Status (SES) on Participants' Decision to Discontinue Participation in Orchestra on the Collegiate Level***

The limited number of participants and the fact that they were from large, suburban high schools makes their particular financial situations difficult to apply to larger populations. In all three instances, financial limitations were never discussed as a possible factor in their decision to discontinue in orchestra on the university level. Most discussions of financial concerns centered

on possible scholarship opportunities that may have swayed their decision (most notably in the case of Bernadette). Maria's lack of an instrument weighed heavily on her decision, and she leaned toward the one university that provided instruments until she visited the journalism department. All three participants mentioned the time factors that would be required by participating in college orchestra. And to each of them, time equaled money.

Bernadette mentioned the financial burden of taking piano *and* viola lessons at the very beginning of her interview. Soon after she began viola she had to quit piano lessons because paying for both was too expensive for her parents. And, although she didn't plainly say so, there is a notion that had she been offered scholarship money to play in college, she would have availed herself of that opportunity. As it were, she opted to not continue after hearing from friends that she would not qualify for scholarships because she wasn't majoring in music.

She wanted to sell her viola to help pay for college tuition and her parents grew very defensive. Bernadette wanted to sell the viola because she never saw herself playing it again. She also may have really needed the money to pay for tuition. Either way, her parents refused to consider that option. Mr. Powers did not know the family well enough to gauge if there were financial burdens at home. However, he railed against the university system for not providing scholarships to talented students like Bernadette.

Financial hardships were never discussed during Maria's interview or cited in the original survey. Maria's family placed value on a quality education and her family supported her brother's pursuit of a musical theatre degree at a private college on the East Coast. She took private lessons as well as group lessons, was enrolled in the local youth symphony program, and was given every advantage that her parents' could manage, "pouring money into it," to use Maria's own words.

Mr. Sanders wanted to help Maria obtain financial assistance at the Great Plains university. He offered to contact the bass instructor to see what they could offer Maria. Looking back, Mr. Sanders worried that he somehow offended the bass instructor with his questions and comments about the orchestra. But when he asked Maria if he needed to do anything to follow up with the university, she told him no. He and Maria never discussed it after that.

Maria lamented the fact that she still has to ask her parents for a bass. But this statement contrasted directly with those made earlier in which Maria spoke about her parents “pouring money” into her and her brother’s musical pursuits. Was there truly a financial reason behind her inability to buy a bass? Or had it become too easy to blame it on a lack of funds rather than delve into deeper meanings behind the lack of an instrument? It was unclear to me at the end of the interview, and possibly to Maria as well.

Samuel did not state any financial impediments as being the reason behind his decision to not participate in orchestra on the collegiate level. His financial concerns had more to do with how to receive the quality lessons he wanted without having to pay the high cost of tuition. He knew that paying for lessons privately would be much cheaper than enrolling in the university’s school of music and paying for lessons with the music faculty. However, he did cite the care and upkeep of his instrument in the dry upper Great Plains winters as being a possible financial burden. Samuel was not worried about the financial aspect, but more about the scheduling and logistics of participation in orchestra, and therefore the length of his academic enrollment at the university.

It is my recommendation that university departments and schools of music, who do not have one, explore the possibility of forming a non-music major orchestra within their curricular offerings that doesn’t create unnecessary financial and scheduling challenges for student

members. Logistics and staffing aside, from a strictly student-based view, the opportunity to continue playing in an orchestra that doesn't interfere with major classes and which does not add a financial burden could benefit a large number of students. If universities added the ensemble as a club instead of a class, interested faculty and graduate assistants could staff it. Such an orchestra would also allow the university music faculty the opportunity to discover potential talent for other ensembles and classes within the music curriculum.

### ***The Reality of Music Making After High School***

The participants in this study offered diverse reasons for why they chose not to continue participating in college on the university level. Their reasons fell within six categories of intrinsic and extrinsic factors: (a) persistence; (b) self-concept of musical ability; (c) motivation for music; (d) parental musicianship and support; (e) director influence; and (f) socioeconomic status. Each participant could not name a single, defining factor that led him or her to discontinue participation in orchestra as each of the identified factors weighed differently for each person. No other influential factors were discovered through NVivo analysis, but this could be due to the small sample size.

Bernadette was directly influenced by the *burn out* she experienced in her private viola studio and the demands of youth symphony. She was so completely disenchanted with music that she has put away her viola and has no intention to play it again. Maria and Samuel are both actively engaged in making music, although it is not in an orchestral setting. Maria was influenced by her inability to see herself competing on a professional level and by her lack of a fractional sized instrument on which she could perform. She currently sings and plays piano for her own enjoyment. Samuel was influenced by the academic advisor in engineering that warned him against pursuing a double major in chemical engineering and music. Of all the participants,



Samuel was the only one who was actively making music on his orchestral instrument. He was also the only one who considered enrolling in university orchestra class in the future.

### ***Recommendations for Further Research***

The purpose of this study was to discover the reasons that led high school orchestra musicians to discontinue formal participation in collegiate orchestra class. Due to the limited number of participants, there was no intent to generalize the findings of this study to a larger population. A qualitative study that incorporates a larger population sample could produce more generalizable results.

Since the present study focused on high-achieving high school orchestra musicians who were already enrolled in college but did not participate in the orchestra, future studies could focus on the relationship between persistence, self-concept of musical ability, motivation for music, parental musicianship and support, director influence, and socioeconomic status among participants who are currently enrolled in orchestra class on the university level. Quantitative research into these influences in a longitudinal setting may increase music educators' understanding of shaping motivation for music. By examining these factors from elementary school to middle school and middle school to high school, researchers may learn at what age these different influences affect motivation for music.

More research is also needed in the field of motivation for music and persistence with an eye toward how to recruit and retain more students in ensembles at the university level. It is suggested that university departments and schools of music increase communication to high school music teachers and perspective students in regard to openings in ensembles for those not majoring in music.

## Works Cited

- Adderly, C., Kennedy, M., & Berz, W. (2003). "A home away from home:" the world of the high school music classroom. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 51(3), 190-205.
- Agar, M., & Hobbs, J.R. (1982). Interpreting discourse: Coherence and the analysis of ethnographic interviews. *Discourse Processes*, 5, 1-32.
- Asmus, E. P. (1986). Student beliefs about the causes of success and failure in music: A study of achievement motivation. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 34(4), 262-278.
- Asmus, E. P., & Harrison, C. S. (1990). Characteristics of motivation for music and musical aptitude of undergraduate nonmusic majors. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 38(4), 258-268.
- Brown, R. (ed.) (1974). *Knowledge, Education, and Social Change*. London: Taylor & Francis, pp. 71-84.
- Bugeja, C. (2009). Parental involvement in the musical education of violin students: Suzuki and 'traditional' approaches compared. *Australian Journal of Music Education*, 1, 19-28.
- Clandinin, D. & Connelly, F. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Cox, G. & Pitts, S. (2003). Editorial. *British Journal of Music Education*, 20(3), 227.
- Creech, A. (2010). Learning a musical instrument: The case for parental support. *Music Education Research*, 12(1), 13-32.
- Creswell, J. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: choosing among five approaches* (3rd ed.). Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Dai, D. Y., & Schader, R. M. (2002). Decisions regarding music training: Parental beliefs and values. *Gifted Child Quarterly*, 46(2), 135-144.

- Dumais, S. A., & Ward, A. (2009). Cultural capital and first-generation college success. *Poetics*, 38, 245-265.
- Dweck, C. S. (2000). *Self-theories: their role in motivation, personality and development*. Philadelphia, PA: Psychology Press.
- Fredricks, J. A., Alfeld-Liro, C. J., Hruda, L. Z., Eccles, J. S., Patrick, H., & Ryan, A. M. (2002). A qualitative exploration of adolescents' commitments to athletics and the arts. *Journal of Adolescent Research*, 17(68), 68-97.
- Fredricks, J. (2011). Engagement in school and out-of-school contexts: A multidimensional view of engagement. *Theory Into Practice*, 50, 327-335.
- Freeman, J. P., Hall, E. H., & Bresciani, M. J. (2007). What leads students to have thoughts, talk to someone about, and take steps to leave their institution?. *College Student Journal*, 41(4), 755-770.
- Hartley, L. A., & Porter, A. M. (2009). The influence of beginning instructional grade on string student enrollment, retention, and music performance. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 56(4), 370-384.
- Jellison, J. (2000). How Can All People Continue to Be Involved in Meaningful Music Participation? In *Vision 2020 the Housewright symposium on the future of music education*. Reston: MENC.
- Jellison, J. A. (2004). It's about time. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 52(3), 191-205.
- Johnson, I. (2007). Enrollment, persistence and graduation of in-state students at a public research university: Does high school matter?. *Research in Higher Education*, 49, 776-793.

- Kahn, J. H., & Nauta, M. M. (2001). Social-cognitive predictors of first-year college persistence: The importance of proximal assessment. *Research in Higher Education, 42*(6), 633-652.
- Kelly, J. L., LaVergne, D. D., Boone, Jr., H. N., & Boone, D. A. (2012). Perceptions of college students on social factors that influence student matriculation. *College Student Journal, 46*(3), 653-664.
- Kenny, D.T. (2004). A systematic review of treatments for music performance anxiety. *Anxiety, Stress, and Coping, 18*, 183-208.
- Kinney, D. W. (2010). Selected nonmusic predictors of urban students' decisions to enroll and persist in middle school band programs. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 57*(4), 334-350.
- Kokotsaki, D., & Hallam, S. (2011). The perceived benefits of participative music making for non-music university students: A comparison with music students. *Music Education Research, 13*(2), 149-172.
- Kruse, N. B. (2012). Adult community musicians' self-esteem of music ability. *Research Studies in Music Education, 34*(1), 61-72.
- Kunter, M., Frenzel, A., Nagy, G., Baumert, J., & Pekrun, R. (2011). Teacher enthusiasm: Dimensionality and context specificity. *Contemporary Educational Psychology, 36*, 289-301.
- Kuntz, T. (2011). High School Students' Participation in Music Activities Beyond the School Day. *Applications of Research in Music Education, 30*, 23-31.

- Lacaille, N., Koestner, R., & Gaudreau, P. (2007). On the value of intrinsic rather than traditional achievement goals for performing artists: A short-term prospective study. *International Journal of Music Education, 25*(3), 245-257.
- Mangold, W. D., Bean, L., & Adams, D. (2003). The impact of intercollegiate athletics on graduation rates among major ncaa division i universities. *The Journal of Higher Education, 74*(5), 540-562.
- NAfME, (1999, September 26). "Vision 2020" housewright declaration. Retrieved from <http://www.nafme.org/resources/view/vision-2020-the-housewright-symposium-on-the-future-of-music-education>
- Palmer, R. T., Davis, R. J., & Maramba, D. C. (2011). The impact of family support on the success of black men at an historically black university: Affirming the revision of tinto's theory. *Journal of College Student Development, 52*(5), 577-597.
- Parker, J. D. A., Hogan, M. J., Eastabrook, J. M., Oke, A., & Wood, L. M. (2006). Emotional intelligence and student retention: Predicting the successful transition from high school to university. *Personality and Individual Differences, 41*, 1329-1336.
- Pascarella, E. T., Terenzini, P. T., & Wolfe, L. M. (1986). Orientation to college and freshman year persistence/withdrawal decisions. *The Journal of Higher Education, 57*(2), 155-175.
- Reeve, J. (2009). Why teachers adopt a controlling motivating style toward students and how they can become more autonomy supportive. *Educational Psychologist, 44*(3), 159-175.
- Reimer, B. (1993). *A philosophy of music education*. (2nd ed.). Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

- Riessman, C.K. (1993). *Narrative analysis (Qualitative Research Methods Vol. 30)*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Riessman, C.K. (2008). *Narrative methods for the human sciences*. Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Robichaux, C. (2003). *The practice of expert critical care nurses in situations of prognostic conflict at the end of life*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Texas, Austin.
- Rosevear, J. C. (2010). Attributions for success: Exploring the potential impact on music learning in high school. *Australian Journal of Music Education, 1*, 17-24.
- Schmidt, C. P. (2005). Relations among motivation, performance achievement, and music experience variables in secondary instrumental music students. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 53*(2), 134-147.
- Salmon, P.G. (1990). A psychological perspective on musical performance anxiety: A review of the literature. *Medical Problems of Performing Artists, 5*, 2-11
- Scruggs, B. (2009). Constructivist practices to increase student engagement in the orchestra classroom. *Music Educators Journal, 95*(4), 53-59.
- Sichivitsa, V. O. (2003). College choir members' motivation to persist in music: Application of the Tinto model. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 51*(4), 330-341.
- Skinner, E. A., & Belmont, M. J. (1993). Motivation in the classroom: Reciprocal effects of teacher behavior and student engagement across the school year. *Journal of Skinner Educational Psychology, 85*(4), 571-581.
- Spector-Mersel, G. (2010). Narrative research: time for a paradigm. *Narrative Inquiry 20*(1), 204-223.

- St. John, E. P., Paulsen, M. B., & Starkey, J. B. (1996). The nexus between college choice and persistence. *Research in Higher Education*, 37(2), 175-220.
- Thomas, S. L. (2000). Ties that bind: A social network approach to understanding student integration and persistence. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 71(5), 591-615.
- Tinto, V. (1988). Stages of student departure: Reflections on the longitudinal character of student leaving. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 59(4), 438-455.
- Weiner, B. (1986). *An attributional theory of motivation and emotion*. New York: Springer-Verlag.
- Welch, G. F., Himonides, E., Saunders, J., Papageorgi, I., & Sarazin, M. (2014). Singing and social inclusion. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 5, 1-12.
- Wis, R. (2002). The conductor as servant-leader. *Music Educators Journal*, 89(2), 17-23.

## **Appendix A – The Pilot Study Materials**

**A Qualitative Study of Orchestral Participation and Attrition from High School to College  
Pilot Study to Gauge Question Relevance and Effectiveness**

**Jeffrey S. Bishop  
Kansas State University  
College of Education  
Dr. Frederick Burrack, Advisor  
Spring Semester 2014**

**Interview Questions (Answers are NOT audio recorded – script will be taken by interviewer):**

### *Gauging the Factors that Led to Participation and Attrition*

Describe your involvement in orchestra in high school.

Describe your musical connections in high school orchestra. Were you invested emotionally in the program?

Describe your musical involvement in orchestra while in high school. Were you satisfied musically with your experience? If not, to what do you attribute that?

What led you to decide NOT to participate in orchestra in college?

Possible follow-up questions:

- Were there financial reasons behind your decision to not play in college?
- Were there time constraints that led to your decision to not play in college?
- Do you feel that your relationship with your high school director had an influence on your decision to not play in college?
- Did your high school experience influence your decision to not continue?

What music-making opportunities were available to you in college?



Did you have other opportunities outside of orchestra to make music in college?  
(Guitar/piano/sing/etc.)

Did you come back to music after college? *Or* Do you PLAN to come back to music after college (if still enrolled)?

***Extrinsic variables (parental musicianship and support in music, previous musical experience, socioeconomic status, academic integration, and social integration):***

Do you feel that there were financial reasons behind your decision to not continue in music?  
Did you ever feel pressure to quit music activities because of the financial burden it placed on your or your family?

Were your parents involved in music? If yes, how so? How much previous musical experience do they have (or continue to have)?

Did your parents support your orchestral activities in high school (and earlier)? In what ways did they support you? How many of your orchestral activities would you say they attended?

Did your parents want you to continue in music? How do you know this?

How many total hours per week were you involved in making music during high school? Did you have other music-making opportunities? (Band, Choir, Solo/Ensemble Contest, Chamber Music, Church Choir, Piano/Guitar Lessons, Private Lessons, Youth Symphony?)

What was your view of your orchestra teacher as a professional educator? In what ways did she affect you outside of the orchestra class? Did you find your orchestra teacher to be accessible? Did you feel that they cared about you as a person? Did your orchestra teacher support you in your decision to not continue in orchestra at the collegiate level?

How did you get along with other members of the high school orchestra? Did you enjoy the people in your high school orchestra classes? Did you socialize with members of the orchestra

outside of class? Are you still friends with any other members of your high school orchestra classes?

***Intrinsic variables (self-concept of musical ability and value of music):***

How would you describe your level of musicianship in high school? How do you feel others perceived your musical talents in high school? What do you feel was your greatest success as a high school musician?

How important was participating in orchestra while you were in high school?

How did the performance calendar of the orchestra affect your academic achievements in high school?

Did you enjoy the music you played in high school orchestra? Why? Why not?

Did you have opportunities for musical growth while in high school orchestra? What were they?

Do you see yourself performing in an orchestra in the future? Do you see yourself involved in any kind of music making in the future (formal or informal)? Why or why not?

**Exit Questions (answers will be audio recorded to improve effectiveness of Survey Questions):**

Are there any other factors that I haven't mentioned that you feel contributed to your decision to not continue playing in orchestra while in college?

Were there any questions about which you were confused or you feel require further clarification?

Are there any questions you feel should be added to the interview?

## **Appendix B – The NEKSMEA Email Inquiry**

NEKSMEA Orchestra Colleagues:

I would like to enlist your help with my dissertation requirement for the PhD in Curriculum & Instruction (Music Education Cognate) at Kansas State University. I am looking for interview subjects that were district/all-state players in high school and are undergraduate students but who are NOT currently playing in their collegiate orchestra. If you have a former student who fits this description, would you please send me their contact information at your earliest convenience?

A little more about my dissertation: I am researching the endogenous (musical self-perception, perceived talent level, motivation) and exogenous (socioeconomic standard, work constraints, previous rehearsal/audition experiences) reasons behind why students choose to not enroll in collegiate orchestra class. I am hoping to interview the research subjects over Thanksgiving/Winter Break and defend the dissertation in the spring of 2015. I would also like to interview you about the student. Your identity, comments, and observations will remain strictly confidential.

At the end of it all I would be happy to share my findings with any of you who would be interested to see what happens with our students after high school orchestra rehearsals end. Thank you so much for your help in finding the research subjects that fit the qualifications – it is greatly appreciated!

My contact information: Jeffrey Bishop, (913) 558-1142 text/cell, [nwbishop@smsd.org](mailto:nwbishop@smsd.org), email.

Best wishes,

Jeffrey S. Bishop

## Appendix C – Participant Introductory Email Survey

**A Qualitative Study of Orchestral Participation and Attrition from High School to College**  
**Jeffrey S. Bishop**  
**Kansas State University**  
**College of Education**  
**Dr. Frederick Burrack, Advisor**  
**Fall Semester 2015**

Introductory Email Survey

Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Year in College: \_\_\_\_\_

High School Attended: \_\_\_\_\_ Instrument: \_\_\_\_\_

Check all that apply:

- Took Private Lessons in High School
- Selected for District Orchestra
- Selected for State Orchestra
- Participated in Youth Symphony Program
- Participated in the highest level of orchestra class in high school

Please describe your high school orchestra experience (use as much space as needed):

Please explain your reasons for not continuing in orchestra class in college (again, use as much space as you need):

## Appendix D – Interview #1 Questions (Open-Ended Questions)

### *Gauging the Factors that Led to Participation and Attrition*

Describe in detail your involvement in orchestra in high school.

Describe how you felt about your involvement in orchestra. Do you have any emotive words or phrases that you would use to describe it?

Did you student have a musically satisfying experience in high school? Could you describe it? If you didn't have a satisfying experience, why not?

What led you to decide NOT to participate in orchestra in college?

Possible follow-up questions:

- Were there financial reasons behind your decision to not play in college?
- Were there time constraints that led to your decision to not play in college?
- Do you feel that your relationship with your high school director had an influence on your decision to not play in college?
- Did your high school experience influence your decision to not continue?

What music-making opportunities were available to you in college?

Did you have other opportunities outside of orchestra to make music in college?

Do you make music while in college? How? Why?

Do you PLAN to come back to music after college? How? Why?

*Extrinsic variables (parental musicianship and support in music, previous musical experience, socioeconomic status, academic integration, and social integration):*

Do you feel that there were financial reasons behind your decision to not continue in music?

Did you ever feel pressure to quit music activities because of the financial burden it placed on your or your family?

Describe your parents' involvement in your music making. What is their experience in music?

Did your parents support your orchestral activities in high school (and earlier)? In what ways did they support you? How many of your orchestral activities would you say they attended?

Did your parents want you to continue in music in college? How do you know this?

How many total hours per week were you involved in making music during high school?

Describe your other music-making opportunities? (Band, Choir, Solo/Ensemble Contest, Chamber Music, Church Choir, Piano/Guitar Lessons, Private Lessons, Youth Symphony?)

Describe your high school orchestra teacher and the relationship you had with each other.

Possible follow up questions (if needed):

What was your view of your orchestra teacher as a professional educator? In what ways did she affect you outside of the orchestra class? Did you find your orchestra teacher to be accessible?

Did you feel that they cared about you as a person? Did your orchestra teacher support you in your decision to not continue in orchestra at the collegiate level?

Describe your social interactions in high school orchestra.

Possible follow up questions (if needed):

How did you get along with other members of the high school orchestra? Did you enjoy the people in your high school orchestra classes? Did you socialize with members of the orchestra

outside of class? Are you still friends with any other members of your high school orchestra classes?

***Intrinsic variables (self-concept of musical ability and value of music):***

How would you describe your level of musicianship in high school?

How do you feel others perceived your musical talents in high school?

What do you feel was your greatest success as a high school musician?

How important was participating in orchestra while you were in high school?

How did the performance calendar of the orchestra affect your academic achievements in high school?

Did you enjoy the music you played in high school orchestra? Why? Why not?

Did you have opportunities for musical growth while in high school orchestra? What were they?

Do you see yourself performing in an orchestra in the future? Do you see yourself involved in any kind of music making in the future (formal or informal)? Why or why not?



## **Appendix E – Director Interview Questions**

*Narrative analysis of the director's responses will be used to triangulate results from the participant's narrative.*

### ***Gauging the Factors that Led to Participation and Attrition***

Describe in detail your student's involvement in orchestra while in high school.

Describe how you about their involvement in orchestra. Do you have any emotive words or phrases that you would use to describe it?

Did the student have a musically satisfying experience in high school? Could you describe it? Do you have a story that would illuminate it?

What reasons do you believe led the student to decide to NOT participate in orchestra in college?

Possible follow-up questions:

- Do you think there were financial reasons behind their decision to not play in college?
- Do you think time constraints led to their decision to not play in college?
- Do you feel that the relationship you had with the student had an influence on their decision to not play in college?

Are you still in contact with the student? Do you discuss musical experiences and/or their decision to quit orchestra? How do you discuss it?

***Extrinsic variables (parental musicianship and support in music, previous musical experience, socioeconomic status, academic integration, and social integration):***

Do you feel that there were financial reasons behind their decision to not continue in music?

Did you ever feel pressure to quit music activities because of the financial burden it placed on your or your family?

Describe their parents' involvement in the student's music making. What is the parents' experience in music?

Did the parents support the student's orchestral activities in high school (and earlier)? In what ways did they support the student? How many of the student's orchestral activities would you say they attended?

Did the student's parents want them to continue in music in college? How do you know this?

How many total hours per week was the student involved in making music during high school? Describe their other music-making opportunities? (Band, Choir, Solo/Ensemble Contest, Chamber Music, Church Choir, Piano/Guitar Lessons, Private Lessons, Youth Symphony?)

Describe the student's personality. What kind of relationship did you have with each other?

Possible follow up questions (if needed):

How do you think the student viewed you as a professional educator? In what ways did interact with the student outside of the orchestra class? Were you accessible to the student outside of class? Did you feel that the student cared about you as a person? Did you support the student's decision to not continue in orchestra at the collegiate level?

Describe the student's social interactions in high school orchestra.

Possible follow up questions (if needed):

How did they get along with other members of the high school orchestra? Did they enjoy the people in your high school orchestra classes? Did they socialize with members of the orchestra

outside of class? Are they still friends with any other members of your high school orchestra classes?

***Intrinsic variables (self-concept of musical ability and value of music):***

How would you describe the student's level of musicianship in high school?

How do you feel others perceived the student's musical talents in high school?

What do you feel was their greatest success as a high school musician?

Do you think it was important to the student that they were a part of the high school orchestra?

How did the performance calendar of the orchestra affect the student's academic achievements in high school?

What kind of opportunities for musical growth did the student have in high school orchestra?  
What were they?

Do you see the student performing in an orchestra in the future? Do you see the student involved in any kind of music making in the future (formal or informal)? Why or why not?

## Appendix F – Narrative Analyses

### *Narrative Analysis 4.1: Bernadette’s View of Persistence*

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>There was no incentive for me to continue music in college.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>My school doesn’t offer scholarships for musicians who are non-music majors....</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>..orchestra rehearsals required a huge time commitment...</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>..for only one credit hour.</i>
(CA)	<i>I was advised by many people not to participate...</i>
(EV)	<i>..because it was not worth it.</i>
(CA)	<i>I couldn’t practice in my dorm room....</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I didn’t feel like finding practice rooms on campus.</i>
Coda	<i>I became “burnt out.”</i>

(Taken from Bernadette’s Initial Survey)

***Narrative Analysis 4.2: Mr. Powers' View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Well, as soon as she made all-state, she stopped private lessons.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>So, we're talking the middle of the school year...</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>she kind of decided that she wasn't going to play any more...</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>The notion that you can be a musician for life is one thing...</i>
(CA)	<i>...but these schools don't have opportunities for these kids.</i>
(EV)	<i>I've tried to figure it out.</i>
(CA)	<i>I've talked to various [college orchestra] conductors...</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>they needed some kind of opportunities, you know, a campus orchestra [for non-majors].</i>
Coda	<i>I've thought these schools are making a mistake.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Powers' Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.3: Bernadette's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I did bring my viola with me...</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>.. my first semester of freshman year of college...</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>.. and it sat under my bed collecting dust.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>At that point I was really burned out with it.</i>
(CA)	<i>I talked to a couple people who were upperclassmen and they said, "Don't do orchestra because it's only one hour of credit but you have to practice multiple hours a week and it's not worth it.</i>
(EV)	<i>It drains so much of your time.</i>
(CA)	<i>And then I asked about scholarships and they were like, "well we really don't give any if you're not a music major."</i>
(EV)	<i>I had this preconceived notion going into college like, "Oh, I'm just good and if I audition for them they'll give me money even if I don't do anything with it."</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>That was wrong and that was something that I don't know how got into my head, but it did.</i>
Coda	<i>When I got to college and realized that wasn't true, it was like, "I don't really have a reason to do this anymore.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.4: Bernadette's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I was majoring in something else.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I was doing mechanical engineering....</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>..and engineering takes up a lot of your time.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I figured if I wasn't even going to minor in this, there wasn't any point in my even practicing at all if I didn't see a future in it.</i>
Coda	<i>I have to study, I can't practice. They're not giving me any money for it. I'm burnt out. All those things together just made me put it down.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.5: Bernadette's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>It's very difficult to describe [her self-concept of musical ability] objectively...</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>..because all throughout high school I described myself relative to other people.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I'm better than that person but I'm not as good as this person...</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>..and the music community understood. I'm not sure.</i>
(CA)	<i>I feel like I had a natural talent that I never tapped into, because from the fourth grade when I started viola, I had perfect pitch...</i>
(EV)	<i>..my instructors picked up on it and they would tell my parents, "Oh, she's got perfect pitch."</i>
(CA)	<i>And I increased in talent very quickly....</i>
(EV)	<i>..up until the point when I plateaued...</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>..because I didn't like practicing.</i>
Coda	<i>I couldn't tell you where I could have been today.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)



***Narrative Analysis 4.6: Bernadette's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>...it may have been because I switched teachers.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>He started pushing me to basically take up a lot of my free time.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I started noticing a change with the group that I was in.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I used to do music for fun...</i>
(CA)	<i>I started being thrown into situations where I was hanging out with all these people who were meant to be professional musicians.</i>
(EV)	<i>They were extremely talented and were pushed very hard.</i>
(CA)	<i>I started getting picked on more, which I didn't like...</i>
(EV)	<i>I started realizing that there's a huge music community out there and I'm probably not near the top.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I started getting really discouraged and it started not being fun for me anymore.</i>
Coda	<i>I think that's when I really started to realize that I can't make a career of out this and I started having a mid-high school crisis where I gotta actually think about college now.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.7: Bernadette's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I had a very good relationship with my peers, my teachers, up through middle school.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I chose to go to [her high school] for the IB program...</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>..but another factor I took into account when I went there was that this high school has a great orchestra program</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>When I got there, first couple years were pretty good. I respected Mr. Powers for the first couple of years.</i>
(CA)	<i>I had been in the youth symphony since sixth grade.</i>
(EV)	<i>I had a very good relationship with my peers in the youth symphony.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>And that was a wonderful experience for me up until a certain point in high school.</i>
Coda	<i>There was a tipping point, I think, my junior year in high school, where all of a sudden music wasn't too fun anymore because it got to be too much of a chore.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.8: Bernadette's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>That was the point that I started having mental breakdowns in front of [my private teacher] and I would cry in lessons...</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>...because I didn't want to practice anymore.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>He'd be like, "Why aren't you practicing anymore?"</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And I told him I can't do it.</i>
(CA)	<i>That was around the time I started showing up late to high school orchestra...</i>
(EV)	<i>...and Mr. Powers was starting to get really frustrated.</i>
Coda	<i>It devolved to the point where I just didn't do anything with it my second semester senior year in high school.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.9: Bernadette's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I was spending eight hours, maybe, practicing...</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>...toward the beginning of high school, and honestly most of that was the actual rehearsal. It wasn't outside practicing, because I never really practiced outside of class.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Towards the end [of high school] it got to be more than that.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>It was probably double that.</i>
(CA)	<i>I was satisfied with high school orchestra.</i>
(EV)	<i>Mr. Powers may not have been my favorite person in the world, but I was extremely happy with my experience there.</i>
Coda	<i>Everything really wasn't fun for me any more besides high school orchestra.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.10: Bernadette's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I had already emotionally decided that I didn't want to do it.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>The last time I tried to pick up my viola was a couple years ago...</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>.. and the minute I started playing, I just started crying. I put it back in my case.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I'm not sure I could tell you why [I cried].</i>
(CA)	<i>I went to a counselor a couple years before and she was very interested in this fact. She wanted to delve into it even more.</i>
(EV)	<i>I was like, "Hey, this was a one time thing." I think a lot of it was anger. I was very angry towards the end of my burnt-out period in high school.</i>
Coda	<i>I don't really even listen to classical music because I've had enough of it for many years.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.11: Mr. Powers' Observation of Bernadette's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>She didn't seem to have – she certainly enjoyed music, but I never got a sense that she REALLY felt passionate about it.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>Students love the romanticism of a piece like the finale to Sibelius Symphony No. 2. You know, the gushing romanticism of it.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I don't remember her feeling that "gush" particularly.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>So you know you're really hitting the mark with someone when they get the emotional thing for it.</i>
Coda	<i>And with Bernadette I was never really sure.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Powers' Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.12: Bernadette’s Parental Musicianship and Support in Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I was almost dragged every weekend to go [to youth symphony rehearsal].</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>My dad was a youth symphony librarian so it made it a lot worse.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>When I decided to quit,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>[my parents] were pretty upset.</i>
(CA)	<i>My mom, less so, because she, when somebody planted this seed in her mind that I could be an engineer,</i>
(EV)	<i>she got really happy and goes, “Oh, you should do that instead.”</i>
(CA)	<i>My dad was very upset...</i>
(EV)	<i>because they had invested many, many years into my music career and they had the idea in their head that that’s what I was going to be doing, because, I guess a consequence of me being really good at music was that I also neglected my other studies.</i>
Coda	<i>So when I finally started to break down with “I’m burned out,” they started freaking out a little bit, especially my dad. It hit him really hard, especially.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette’s Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.13: Bernadette’s Parental Musicianship and Support in Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I feel like on the surface [my parents] are dealing with [my quitting viola] fine.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>They’re happy with where I am now.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>At the same time, I suggest things like, “I need to pay for college. Can I sell my viola?”</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And they get very defensive.</i>
(CA)	<i>They say, “You cannot do that. You never do that because you never know if you’ll pick it up again.”</i>
(EV)	<i>My dad has some idea that I’ll have a mid-life crisis when I’m like forty or fifty and then I’ll pick it up and start playing again.</i>
Coda	<i>I feel like he’s a little bit in denial, but otherwise they’re taking it pretty well.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette’s Interview)



***Narrative Analysis 4.14: Bernadette's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Socially [high school orchestra] was very fun.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>And it was the one group I was in that remained that way for the entirety of high school.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>We had a lot of very talented musicians in our orchestra, but a lot of them didn't take themselves very seriously,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>which Mr. Powers wasn't very fond of, you know, sometimes.</i>
(CA)	<i>But I thought it was hilarious...</i>
(EV)	<i>because I was a bit of a nincompoop toward the end of high school.</i>
Coda	<i>To have a group of friends that was just like, "We don't care. We're gonna major in other things. We're just in it because this is a class we have to take and we really enjoy each other's company and this is a fun thing to do."</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.15: Mr. Powers' View on Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think she was very respected for her academics and her musicianship.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I can't imagine anybody disliking or not respecting her.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I think she respected me, and I think we had a good relationship.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I never felt as close to her as some, you know, because I didn't have her in middle school.</i>
(CA)	<i>She already came to me as a great, fine, advanced player.</i>
(EV)	<i>I didn't have as much impact on her as a strings teacher, more as a conductor.</i>
Coda	<i>Some students you are a significant part of their strings instruction, but she already knew these things. I was more of a coach/conductor for her.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Powers' Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.16: Bernadette's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think that's when I started to realize that I can't make a career out of [music].</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I started showing up late to high school orchestra.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Mr. Powers would pull me aside and say, "you're showing up late every day..."</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>...and I kept giving excuses like "Oh, my alarm didn't go off," but really I just didn't care because the orchestra was first hour.</i>
Coda	<i>So it left a very sour taste in my mouth and it devolved to the point where I just didn't do anything with it my second semester my senior year in high school.</i>

(Taken from Bernadette's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.17: Mr. Powers' View on SES (Scholarship Opportunities)***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I've thought these schools were making a mistake.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>When [the non-music majors] go to enroll, they don't have any kind of an opportunity.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Years ago there was a member of the symphony that taught at [that university] and offered a string orchestra.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And it was all comers. He would adjust to whatever he had and there would be professors in there and students and people in the community.</i>
Coda	<i>It's always kind of a strange thing that they don't do that.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Powers' Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.18: Maria's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I was afraid that if I made it into a career...it would become my job, not my pleasure.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>This may sound silly, but I'm 4' 11" and I'm not getting any taller...</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>with that said, I only have the ability to play a 5/8 size bass,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>which is hard to compete against individuals who play full size basses.</i>
(CA)	<i>After visiting the Chicago Symphony Orchestra, I looked at the bass section and saw six very old men.</i>
(EV)	<i>It is so competitive.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>And that's when I realized I didn't want to do this for a career.</i>
Coda	<i>Reiterating once again – so competitive.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Initial Survey)

***Narrative Analysis 4.19: Maria's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>If I had decided to go to [Great Plains university],</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>My choice to end playing bass may have been different.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>They allow students to be in their orchestra without a minor.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>In that case, I would've taken them up on their offer,</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I probably would have continued playing.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Initial Survey)

***Narrative Analysis 4.20: Maria's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>With those schools the music and their journalism schools were divided...</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>But with [the Great Plains University], Mr. Sanders was like, "You Should do it!" So I was pretty much set to go there.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>They have an informal orchestra where students can come in and just play, no matter what major they are.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>So that was my plan, I was going there.</i>
(CA)	<i>But the journalism program wasn't what I wanted.</i>
(EV)	<i>It was about print and magazines and I wanted to do broadcast.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>They had nothing for me.</i>
Coda	<i>And then I went to visit [the Jesuit university] and they had all the things that I wanted.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.21: Mr. Sanders’ Observation of Maria’s Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Some of them had very high-level orchestras, and she wasn’t sure she wanted to do that.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>So she ended up going to [Great Plains university].</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>And so I encouraged Maria to look into that. I emailed the bass instructor and she emailed him supposed four or five times.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And the person never got back to her. I didn’t really hear much about it after that.</i>
(CA)	<i>And I said, “Do you want help with something?”</i>
(EV)	<i>She would’ve been one of their better bass players.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I sent an email out and never got any response, and she sent four or five out, and there was just no response.</i>
Coda	<i>So I’m not sure where the lack of interest came from, I was expecting at first that she would still be playing.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Sanders’ Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.22: Maria's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>So, maybe I can do orchestra here [at the Jesuit university], too.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>But I have to choose one or the other,</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>because they're completely different campuses.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>One is downtown and the other is eight miles away.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>It would've been forty-five minutes of travel by train.</i>
Coda	<i>It was very much a divide.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.23: Maria's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>[Elementary strings teacher] encouraged me to switch to the bass.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>It made sense to her if I could pick up an instrument like the cello so quickly.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I struggled with the idea for a long time because I loved the cello,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>but at the same time, I felt like I was going to be the cool kid playing the one instrument that nobody else played.</i>
(CA)	<i>So I went for it,</i>
(EV)	<i>and I decided to completely switch over to it.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I stuck with it through elementary school and got to middle school...</i>
Coda	<i>I was finally able to have Mr. Sanders who really got us excited about orchestra!</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)



***Narrative Analysis 4.24: Maria's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think of it more as a personal financial decision.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I didn't own my own bass,</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>and financially, in the future,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I felt like I'd be restricted to teaching.</i>
(CA)	<i>But I wanted to play!</i>
(EV)	<i>I felt like I couldn't compete because of my size.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>So now I just play on my own time.</i>
Coda	<i>I play piano because I don't have a bass.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.25: Maria's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>So, I'm trying to think. I think it was when I went to Chicago with my brother because he was looking at a school there.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>We went to a Chicago Symphony Orchestra concert.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>And when I looked up at the bass section, it was just a row of eight men who were six feet tall and probably eighty years old.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And it hit me. 'That's not me up there.' I didn't see myself up there.</i>
(CA)	<i>I'm only 4' 11" and I play a fractional size bass.</i>
(EV)	<i>It's harder to compete with people who are larger and play a full-size bass and make a completely different sound than me.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I know I shouldn't have let it discourage me because at the end of the day, if I wanted to do it, I would do it.</i>
Coda	<i>But at that point I was like, it's hard enough to make a living. I don't want to teach. I want to play. I want to do symphony.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.26: Maria's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>That's the thing, it's not like I chose a profession where I was going to make more money.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>After college I knew I wanted to go into journalism.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>But I felt like journalism used all of my talents in one area.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And I could translate all of those skills into other things.</i>
(CA)	<i>I felt like if I only majored in music,</i>
(EV)	<i>then I would only do music.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>That was my basic decision when I finally decided.</i>
Coda	<i>That's when I fell in love with my university.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.27: Maria's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>But when I'm caught up and don't have time to think, I just want to make music.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>When I was at school this past semester, I went over to a friend's apartment.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>He had a piano and had gone out to run errands.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I sat down and started playing.</i>
(CA)	<i>I still had pieces memorized.</i>
(EV)	<i>I felt so much better,</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>just sitting and playing the songs I had memorized from all of those years of studying piano.</i>
Coda	<i>I don't know how, but my fingers do.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.28: Maria's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I had to be in freshman orchestra with that teacher.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>And those student who had her as a teacher frustrated me.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I loved music and they just didn't care any more.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And that was so frustrating, especially when you have a huge violin section that doesn't care.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>They were like, 'why try?'</i>
Coda	<i>And I was one of those people who loved music and it just came naturally, so that was really frustrating.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.29: Maria's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think it was just that I was passionate about it for so long.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I took an instrument that everyone I knew at my high school played a couple of bass lines,</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>and I actually turned it into serious music,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>because I was able to play solos and things like that.</i>
(CA)	<i>I was one of those kids who got nervous at every audition.</i>
(EV)	<i>But I overcame that in time.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>And even when it didn't go well, I never was disappointed,</i>
Coda	<i>I'd work so hard that if I mastered it, then I felt great.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.30: Maria's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>It was hard to get everyone passionate about orchestra again.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>But when Mr. Sanders came back, it definitely changed.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I was in the top youth symphony my freshman year.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I absolutely loved that.</i>
(CA)	<i>And I was taking lessons and group lessons.</i>
(EV)	<i>And that was so great.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>So with orchestra at school, and all of that, it was a huge part of my life.</i>
Coda	<i>I think my freshman year I was still really wanting to do it in college.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.31: Maria's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>That was one of my strengths in high school.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I liked doing something new every day and I also liked performing.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I got to perform on the bass, in musical theatre, and solos and such.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And I loved it that because you get a rush. You get that adrenaline.</i>
(CA)	<i>And I felt that's what journalism would do for me.</i>
(EV)	<i>Everyday you get to do all those amazing new things.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>Especially broadcast journalism, because you get the performance aspect that I love so much.</i>
Coda	<i>So after I got interested in journalism, I started doing all of that in high school and I based my college off of that.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)



***Narrative Analysis 4.32: Mr. Sanders' Observation of Maria's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I knew from conversations with her at the end of high school that music wasn't her focus.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I encouraged her to join the college orchestra, and she sounded like she was excited about it,</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>but I don't know how much of that was just her personality.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>She was ALWAYS excited about something.</i>
(CA)	<i>It's harder for me to decipher between how much she enjoys music and is she just doing this because I encouraged her?</i>
(EV)	<i>I thought she would be able to help that orchestra out and she might have friends there.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>So I don't know how much of that was me versus her, but I didn't push it.</i>
Coda	<i>And that's why it might have fizzled out very quickly.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Sanders' Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.33: Maria's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Their music program was really more lax [Great Plains university].</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>The other two colleges' I was interested in, were much more rigorous.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>It was just like, 'Do I wanna do this and through the whole process....</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>if I know that I love music, but I just want to do it for fun?</i>
(CA)	<i>I want to do it because I want to be part of an orchestra and part of a team, just to have that release.</i>
(EV)	<i>But it ended up sounding like to me, more stress.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>Because I didn't own a bass and I knew I didn't want to do it in college.</i>
Coda	<i>After college I wanted to go into journalism.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.34: Maria's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I talked to a friend's mom who was in the [city] symphony,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>and she talked about practicing for seven hours a day because that's her job.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I thought about how I love music so much I don't want it to be my job.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I just don't want it to be my job because I love just playing for myself and for my own enjoyment because I get so much out of it.</i>
(CA)	<i>I felt like if I turned it into a career I might lose that enjoyment.</i>
(EV)	<i>I felt like if I went a different route, I could always have my music.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>Because I'd always continue playing and I can't lose that.</i>
Coda	<i>No one can take it away from me.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.35: Maria's Parental Musicianship and Support***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>But at the same time, who makes money doing that?</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>So that was my dilemma coming out of high school.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>But my parents, at the same time, they don't care how much money we make.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>When my brother wanted to go into musical theatre, they pumped money into that.</i>
(CA)	<i>And when I wanted to do music, they pumped money into that because they thought,</i>
(EV)	<i>'Hey, this is important.'</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>But when I was a sophomore in high school I had a moment where I was watching the news,</i>
Coda	<i>and I was like, I want to do that.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.36: Maria's Parental Musicianship and Support***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>My parents would've been supportive if I wanted to continue in music.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>My parents love music but neither of them are musical themselves.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>It's so funny. My dad was a three-sport athlete and had a full ride scholarship to play tennis in college.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>He's the most athletic person you'd ever meet.</i>
(CA)	<i>And then my brother and I come along, and he does musical theatre and I'm doing choir and orchestra.</i>
(EV)	<i>And so my dad just turned into a stage dad and loved it all the way. Same with my mom.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>They're all about what makes us happy.</i>
Coda	<i>It was never really about money.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.37: Mr. Sanders' Observations of Maria's Parental Musicianship and Support***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Her parents were VERY supportive.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>Her dad was at every rehearsal we had for the elementary honors orchestra.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>He walked in with her, put her bass down, gave her a hug and said 'See you later.'</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>Mom and dad were at every single performance.</i>
(CA)	<i>Mom was on the orchestra boosters board at the high school.</i>
(EV)	<i>Her mother was so involved in so many aspects of the program.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I mean I couldn't ask for better orchestra parents is how I would put it.</i>
Coda	<i>I never really knew if they wanted her to continue or not.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Sanders' Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.38: Maria's Parental Musicianship and Support***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think my parents were okay with whatever I did as long as I was happy.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>They loved the different journalism stories I was doing and they realized that I was happy, so they were happy, too.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>But now that it's been three years that I've been gone, they don't hear all the music in the house</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>and they miss it.</i>
(CA)	<i>I think they miss the fact that I don't play bass anymore, because my dad loved it.</i>
(EV)	<i>He just loved it and all the solo pieces I would play.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>But when I come home, I always play piano and sing,</i>
Coda	<i>so I think that helps a little bit.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.39: Maria's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>When I got to middle school, I was finally able to have Mr. Sanders,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>and he really got us excited about orchestra.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>We had a great group.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>We loved each other so much and he made us a very tight-knit group. That's when I really got a passion for orchestra.</i>
(CA)	<i>That's when I developed the idea that I wanna do this after college.</i>
(EV)	<i>I wanna go to a music school and do this for the rest of my life.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>And then I went to high school.</i>
Coda	<i>And the teacher there really dropped the ball.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)



***Narrative Analysis 4.40: Maria's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>So nothing was getting done. It was completely just like a study hall.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>She didn't care about teaching us. [Orchestra] was just a blow off class.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>She didn't care and it affected not only me but the entire orchestra.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And I was really frustrated.</i>
(CA)	<i>I went back to the middle school and talked to Mr. Sanders and asked him to come teach us at the high school.</i>
(EV)	<i>And sure enough, the next year he came back to teach us.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>That was probably the best thing that could've happened,</i>
Coda	<i>but it was a struggle for him because all the older students fought him. But it definitely changed once he came back.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.41: Maria's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I wonder how it's going now because no one remembers that teacher.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>Mr. Sanders is an amazing teacher, and he was our first and only teacher,</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>but those students who had that other teacher,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>they just dragged the rest of us down.</i>
(CA)	<i>But he loves what he does, whether it was coaching or music, he was very passionate about it.</i>
(EV)	<i>But by the time I was in the top group my sophomore year, they just frustrated me because they kept dragging us down with their attitude.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I hope he doesn't have that disconnect now and it's more like when we were in middle school.</i>
Coda	<i>He was our only teacher and brought us all together.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.42: Maria's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I had narrowed it down to three schools.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>And when I mentioned [the Great Plains university], Mr. Sanders was like, "You should do that!"</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>He got me all ramped up to audition there</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>and I was pretty much set on going there because they had a very informal orchestra.</i>
(CA)	<i>Students could just come and play</i>
(EV)	<i>no matter their major, but if they have time, they can come in and play.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I was going to go there and major in journalism and play in their orchestra. It seemed like the best thing.</i>
Coda	<i>But when I visited, their journalism program just wasn't what I wanted.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.43: Mr. Sanders' Observation of Maria's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>She's just a wonderful, well-rounded person, but as she continued through high school, it was clear that this was not going to be her focus.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I learned to let go early because it was very clear to me that she loved playing bass.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>And I didn't want to pressure her and make her feel down.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I do feel like she and I had the kind of relationship that I didn't want her to think I was disappointed in her.</i>
(CA)	<i>I didn't want her to think I wasn't happy that she wasn't going to play bass.</i>
(EV)	<i>So I did not push in any way.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>So we'll have to wait and see.</i>
Coda	<i>But, again, she was just a fantastic, talented person that chose to go in another direction.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Sanders' Interview)

*Narrative Analysis 4.44: Maria's SES*

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>And it was hard for me because I played the bass.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I couldn't just carry it around with me.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Besides, I didn't have one.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I didn't know if I could afford one on top of college.</i>
(CA)	<i>I wanted to buy one. I wanted the best quality.</i>
(EV)	<i>But I couldn't find one that was the right size for me, because they were a little too big.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>And that made it so challenging for me.</i>
Coda	<i>But I never bought one.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

*Narrative Analysis 4.45: Maria's SES*

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think my personal finances were part of that decision.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>One, because I didn't own my own bass and</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>it was very much dependent on whether or not the university offered instruments.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>That was important.</i>
(CA)	<i>I felt like I'd be more financially restricted to teaching, whereas I wanted to play.</i>
(EV)	<i>I felt like I couldn't always compete because of my size and what I play.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>So now I just play on my own time.</i>
Coda	<i>But it's piano, because I can't play the bass since I don't have one.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.46: Mr. Sanders' Observation of Maria's SES***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I just thought it was very unprofessional, the way they treated her.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I had contacted the university and she had, too.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I sent an email to the bass instructor, and she had sent like four or five.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I told him "I've got this great bass player who'd really help your program."</i>
(CA)	<i>Maybe that hurt her opportunities.</i>
(EV)	<i>I tried not to be negative, but I had seen their orchestra in YouTube videos and it wasn't very good.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>But I hope I didn't come across as negative.</i>
Coda	<i>Maybe they just didn't care, for whatever reason. Maybe that's the situation.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Sanders' Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.47: Maria's SES***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Every now and then I ask my parents,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>"Can I have a bass? I really want a bass!"</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>And they're like, Maria, we can't buy you a bass.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I want one so badly, but that's the biggest thing, never having owned my own.</i>
(CA)	<i>Someday, I'd like to buy one, but it's a big investment.</i>
(EV)	<i>Maybe If I could find one for around \$5000.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I would totally do it if I could find the money.</i>
Coda	<i>It would be so worth it.</i>

(Taken from Maria's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.48: Samuel's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I was very torn on whether I would continue in college.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I enjoyed playing and I didn't want to stop, but</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I wasn't sure if I wanted to do orchestra</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>because I was doing chemical engineering.</i>
(CA)	<i>I was thinking about double-majoring, but</i>
(EV)	<i>I talked to the advisors and they said that would be really difficult.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I looked at what it would be to do a music minor, but</i>
Coda	<i>I didn't necessarily see what was benefitting me by doing that.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)



***Narrative Analysis 4.49: Samuel's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I still would've had an opportunity to join one of the orchestras there for non-music majors.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>But I wasn't proactive enough.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>There were too many unknowns, like where to keep my instrument and all that.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>Basically all of that, but it wasn't high on my list of priorities.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>As long as I kept playing I was perfectly happy.</i>
Coda	<i>So that's what I did.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.50: Samuel's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>So what I ended up doing was,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>my parents brought up my instrument.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>And I started taking lessons with a friend of my bass teacher from home.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>And that's been great.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>That's been this whole semester so far</i>
Coda	<i>and it's been great.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.51: Samuel's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>A lot of precedent had been set for us.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>My parents were supportive,</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>but my dad didn't really want me to be a music major</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>because of job prospects and stuff like that.</i>
(CA)	<i>I knew that if I was going to do music,</i>
(EV)	<i>I'd have to double it with something else.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>But they were supportive about my playing and</i>
Coda	<i>they did whatever it took so that I could play.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.52: Samuel's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>A lot of it was unknown for this first part of school.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I could've taken music classes through the school</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>but it would've been way more expensive</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>than just taking lessons on my own.</i>
(CA)	<i>I didn't know how much time I was going to have</i>
(EV)	<i>and I didn't have much time to go and practice.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I needed to know how much time I was going to have to study.</i>
Coda	<i>So a lot of it was just unknowns going in.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.53: Samuel's View of Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I'm taking lessons now</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>and I certainly plan on continuing to play.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Whether it's in an actual orchestra with performances, I don't know,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>but playing is certainly something I enjoy.</i>
(CA)	<i>When it's not enjoyable,</i>
(EV)	<i>then I'll stop playing.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>But I don't see that happening.</i>
Coda	<i>At least not now.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.54: Mr. Burton's View of Samuel's Persistence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think he's getting an engineering degree.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I really don't know. I'd like to think that I didn't have anything to do with</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>him not continuing.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>You know, with him not being challenged in orchestra.</i>
(CA)	<i>I've asked myself that question several times, and not just with Samuel.</i>
(EV)	<i>I've had other students who haven't continued on in college that were really sharp players.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>And you just go...</i>
Coda	<i>Why?</i>

(Taken from Mr. Burton's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.55: Mr. Burton's View of Samuel's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Samuel was really pretty self-sufficient.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>When it came time for festival I require all my students to play for me.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Samuel had a private lesson teacher,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>but I could never get him to play for me.</i>
(CA)	<i>He missed the recital we had, but I was pretty patient with him.</i>
(EV)	<i>And he says, "It'll be okay. I've got a lot of work to do, but it'll be okay."</i>
(CA)	<i>I knew he had a private teacher, so I just left him alone.</i>
(EV)	<i>And the first time I heard him, it was at contest, and he played it from memory and, oh my gosh, it was just incredible!</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>And it just confirmed what I thought about him, you know?</i>
Coda	<i>He's real self-sufficient and I can trust what he says for the most part.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Burton's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.56: Samuel's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>High school was a time of ups and downs.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I excelled in orchestra.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I could play the music set in front of me</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>because to be honest, it was really easy for me. It was almost monotonous.</i>
(CA)	<i>Often times my teacher and I didn't see eye to eye.</i>
(EV)	<i>So I focused more on myself as a player rather than the whole orchestra.</i>
(CA)	<i>I enjoyed success for the most part during these times.</i>
(EV)	<i>I made all-district orchestra three times and received superior ratings at state contest my last two years.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>High school orchestra became something I had to do</i>
Coda	<i>to enjoy these other experiences.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Initial Survey)

***Narrative Analysis 4.57: Samuel's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I always enjoyed playing solo more than I ever did orchestra because I got to express myself musically,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>whereas in the orchestra you're just kind of in the back, almost forgotten.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I was always pretty serious</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>and I always had confidence in my abilities.</i>
(CA)	<i>So beginning freshman year I did a solo in the spring,</i>
(EV)	<i>and I knew I wanted to keep doing that. And my results kept getting better over the four years as I played more difficult things.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I enjoyed district orchestra way more than high school orchestra because of the talent level of the people.</i>
Coda	<i>We could play more exciting, well-known pieces.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.58: Samuel's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>As far as my ability was concerned,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I felt I was pretty high compared to some of the other people in orchestra.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I knew as far as practicing stuff I could get better at that.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I never doubted my ability to play.</i>
(CA)	<i>I don't think the other students understood unless they were a bass player.</i>
(EV)	<i>The solo I was playing was way harder than what they had to play.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>You know, just the technique of the bass.</i>
Coda	<i>It was just different.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.59: Samuel's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>There were some songs in [high school] orchestra that I enjoyed,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>but for the majority, it wasn't very challenging for me at least.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>The music was pretty simple,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>so that's why I joined youth symphony.</i>
(CA)	<i>They would play things that were harder</i>
(EV)	<i>which was frustrating to for me.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>But it was also rewarding.</i>
Coda	<i>We got to play cool things.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.60: Mr. Burton's View of Samuel's Self-Concept of Musical Ability***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think the group that he was in was more of a developing group.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>And he was a strong player.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>And I don't think that the challenges I gave him in the classroom,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I don't think they were enough for him.</i>
(CA)	<i>I offered him other leadership responsibilities like directing.</i>
(EV)	<i>But he didn't want to do that.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>Samuel would never accept any of those roles.</i>
Coda	<i>He was real content to be pretty passive.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Burton's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.61: Samuel's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>My family's all orchestra,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>so that's why I chose bass, because nobody else played it.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>In high school, I did all the orchestra stuff,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>but that's not what I enjoyed most.</i>
(CA)	<i>I started taking lessons in the seventh grade</i>
(EV)	<i>and I always enjoyed playing solo more than I ever did orchestra.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I got to express myself musically,</i>
Coda	<i>whereas in the orchestra, you're just kind of in the back, almost forgotten.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)



***Narrative Analysis 4.62: Samuel's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>That was a big learning experience and I knew I wanted to do that.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I made all-district the following three years.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>That was a lot of time,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>but I enjoyed it way more than school orchestra.</i>
(CA)	<i>And I still had a passion for solo playing.</i>
(EV)	<i>I loved doing them, I loved preparing them.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>As far as my teacher goes, it was a very up-and-down relationship.</i>
Coda	<i>But as time went on it definitely got better.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.63: Samuel's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>For large chunks of time, we'd just be standing there.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>Since our parts were so much easier, he'd be working with the other sections.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>We can't leave, we just have to stand there and be attentive.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I mean, I enjoyed it as a whole. I would even say that I kind of miss the orchestra experience.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I'm looking at whether I'm going to do the non-audition orchestra next year.</i>
Coda	<i>Just trying to figure out how.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.64: Samuel's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>There were times that I was section leader, but then there were times I wasn't, and I don't exactly know why.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>He had an interesting procedure for how he seated us.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>We would record it and then submit it and he'd listen to it.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>But if I got the same score as the next guy, I'd be here and he'd be there, in front of me.</i>
(CA)	<i>I can't say for sure, but I wondered if it was because he taught one of the middle schools and he already knew those kids.</i>
(EV)	<i>It didn't much matter to me.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I just wanted to know the reason why we were seated where we were.</i>
Coda	<i>And I just never knew.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.65: Samuel's Motivation for Music***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Orchestra often messed with stuff that you'd want to do outside of school.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>Since you only had one concert per semester,</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>it was a given that I was going to miss the soccer game.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>The coach would always understand because orchestra's for a grade.</i>
(CA)	<i>I think my junior year some of the soccer boys got to miss a concert,</i>
(EV)	<i>but that was because it was senior night or something special.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>But it would have to be something special like that for me to miss.</i>
Coda	<i>My orchestra teacher wouldn't understand.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.66: Samuel's Parental Musicianship & Support***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>So I started playing bass.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>My family's all orchestra so that's why I chose the bass, because nobody else did it and I didn't want to do like viola, which was the other one.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Yeah, like my oldest sister played violin and my brother played cello. And my youngest sister ended up playing the viola,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>so we kinda have all instruments.</i>
(CA)	<i>A lot of it was the precedent set before us, but if we said we didn't want to play,</i>
(EV)	<i>our parents would've been perfectly fine with it.</i>
(CA)	<i>They didn't push it on us.</i>
(EV)	<i>It was all our decision.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>They were supportive of whatever we wanted to do.</i>
Coda	<i>Like in college, my dad didn't really want me to be a music major because of job prospects and stuff like that, so I knew if I was going to do it, I'd have to double it with something else.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.67: Samuel's Parental Musicianship & Support***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I wasn't proactive enough, there were too many unknowns, like where I was going to keep my instrument or anything like that.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>It wasn't high on my list because as long as I got to keep playing I was perfectly happy. So that's what I did.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>My parents brought up my instrument</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>and I started taking private lessons with someone that my private lesson teacher in KC knew here.</i>
(CA)	<i>My parents were definitely on board with the lessons.</i>
(EV)	<i>It was definitely harder to convince them to buy an instrument because they're so expensive.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I had to assure them I'd be playing for a while</i>
Coda	<i>and not just be done after high school.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.68: Mr. Burton's Observation of Samuel's Parental Musicianship & Support***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I had his older brother and sister and have his younger sister now.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>His parents are wonderful! Absolutely wonderful!</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Mom and dad were both really, really supportive of him.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>Providing him with lessons, transporting him, bought him a really nice bass.</i>
(CA)	<i>And they were supportive of me and my program as well.</i>
(EV)	<i>They were really engaged and helped, you know. I could call and they'd be there right away to help.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I've had some negative dealings with the younger sister and I've called the parents.</i>
Coda	<i>And the parents are always one hundred percent supportive. Really engaged with what they do.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Burton's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.69: Mr. Burton's Observation of Samuel's Parental Musicianship & Support***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I don't think the parents would've influenced Samuel one way or the other to quit.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>Dad is a funny guy, really supportive. Mom is a little quieter, not a lot of sense of humor, but very respectful.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I think one of her biggest heartbreaks was when I had to call home about one of her children, you know, about a conflict we had.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I would tell her what the conflict was, how I handled it, and how her children did.</i>
(CA)	<i>And she was always satisfied with the way I handled things.</i>
(EV)	<i>But you could tell there was some heartbreak there that she was even getting the phone call.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I never really heard back after those things.</i>
Coda	<i>She always just left it with please call us, keep us in the loop with how things are going.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Burton's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.70: Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>For me, high school was a time of ups and downs.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I would often excel at the music that was being set in front of me because, to be honest, it was really easy for me, so sometimes it would feel really monotonous.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>Often times as well, my high school director and I didn't see eye to eye.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>Because of this I focused more on myself as player than the whole orchestra.</i>
(CA)	<i>I enjoyed district orchestras,</i>
(EV)	<i>but the playing ability between them and my high school orchestra made high school orchestra more of just something I had to do to enjoy these other experiences.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I took solo assessments very seriously.</i>
Coda	<i>And I enjoyed success for the most part....</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Initial Survey)



***Narrative Analysis 4.71: Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>As far as my teacher goes, it was a very up-and-down relationship.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>It didn't start off too well because I voiced my opinion and that didn't go over too well.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>But as time went on,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>It was definitely better.</i>
(CA)	<i>He appreciated me,</i>
(EV)	<i>and I appreciated what he did.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I still wanted to do more as opposed to what we were doing in orchestra</i>
Coda	<i>But it got better.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.72: Mr. Burton's Observation of Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>There was one student, not from my feeder program, that made it really difficult for me.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>And that student was a very bad influence on Samuel.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I did this activity on the first day of school where we go around and you tell one lie and one truth about yourself and we had to figure out what the lie and the truth were.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>Samuel's lie was that he really wanted to be in orchestra.</i>
(CA)	<i>And he had followed the student who was such a bad influence</i>
(EV)	<i>and he had said something equally egregious.</i>
(CA)	<i>I just kinda let it slide.</i>
(EV)	<i>That's really the only time that he blatantly said anything like that.</i>
(CA)	<i>I think the challenges that I gave him in the classroom</i>
(EV)	<i>were not enough for him.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>You know, we all have those really strong players.</i>
Coda	<i>And how to keep them engaged and all that?</i>

(Taken from Mr. Burton's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.73: Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>There were times that I enjoyed it and there were times where I was like,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>"Why do I have to be here?"</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>The stuff we were required to do,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>we had to miss other stuff because it was for a grade.</i>
(CA)	<i>I played soccer</i>
(EV)	<i>but I always had to miss a game.</i>
(CA)	<i>And I wanted to be at the game,</i>
(EV)	<i>but I had to be at the concert because it's a grade.</i>
(CA)	<i>And then there was the disciplinary stuff.</i>
(EV)	<i>It was probably my fault that I got into trouble.</i>
(CA)	<i>I always played after he said to stop</i>
(EV)	<i>for like large chunks of time because oftentimes our part is the easier part.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>We'd just be standing there.</i>
Coda	<i>There's nothing to do.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.74: Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>As far as professionally,</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I feel that he didn't know, really understand the bass.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>He couldn't tell me what to do better.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>I feel like he didn't necessarily know what was coming from our section. There was a disconnect there.</i>
(CA)	<i>There were times I would certainly annoy him, and he would annoy me,</i>
(EV)	<i>so there was always friction between us.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>You could see that he was trying the best he could.</i>
Coda	<i>It was just difficult to endure.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.75: Mr. Burton's Observation of Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>There's probably a part in the back of my head that thinks that he didn't get the experience he thought he should've in my group.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>And there's part of me that just thinks he's a hard kid.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I've spoken with his dad about this and</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>he assures me that it had nothing to do with the orchestra at school or anything.</i>
(CA)	<i>I offered him opportunities to work sectionals with my younger kids.</i>
(EV)	<i>And he would do a good job with them.</i>
(CA)	<i>I offered him some opportunities to direct.</i>
(EV)	<i>But he didn't want anything to do with that.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>He wasn't comfortable being in front of the group, and that's okay.</i>
Coda	<i>Not everybody is.</i>

(Taken from Mr. Burton's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.76: Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>There were times that I was section leader, but then there were times I wasn't, and I don't exactly know why.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>He had an interesting procedure for how he seated us.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>We would record it and then submit it and he'd listen to it.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>But if I got the same score as the next guy, I'd be here and he'd be there, in front of me.</i>
(CA)	<i>I can't say for sure, but I wondered if it was because he taught one of the middle schools and he already knew those kids.</i>
(EV)	<i>It didn't much matter to me.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>I just wanted to know the reason why we were seated where we were.</i>
Coda	<i>And I just never knew.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.77: Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I think he cared.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I think he cared about me as a person.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>There were times that he'd trust me to go and help some of the younger students, or go do some errands.</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>You could definitely tell that he appreciated what I did for him.</i>
(CA)	<i>And when solo ratings came out and when results from districts came out,</i>
(EV)	<i>he'd always come to me afterwards to encourage and compliment me.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>So yeah,</i>
Coda	<i>I think he cared.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.78: Mr. Burton's Observation of Samuel's Director Influence***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>One of the things with Samuel was that I felt like no matter how hard you went out of your way to help him, there just wasn't a lot of gratitude shown.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>I'll give you an example. When we were at state contest, he essentially destroyed a girl's cello.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I actually saw it happen,</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>and there was fault on many levels.</i>
(CA)	<i>But I sure went to bat for Samuel. I got involved with the music store and the girl's director</i>
(EV)	<i>and it put me in a very uncomfortable position.</i>
(CA)	<i>I went to bat for him,</i>
(EV)	<i>and I just got the impression from him that he just didn't care.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>He might even, deep down inside, been extremely grateful.</i>
Coda	<i>He was not very emotional at all.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)



***Narrative Analysis 4.79: Samuel's SES***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>Financially, I'm not really sure if it was an issue.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>It was more of the unknowns.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>I could take stuff through the school</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>but it would be way more expensive that just taking lessons on my own.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>So I'm not really sure whether being in orchestra was a financial concern or</i>
Coda	<i>whether just the instrument and maintaining it was more of the cause.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)

***Narrative Analysis 4.80: Samuel's SES***

<i>Narrative Elements</i>	<i>Statements by Participant</i>
Abstract (AB)	<i>I don't think I can pinpoint a reason from my high school experience.</i>
Orientation (OR)	<i>My private teacher really pushed me to audition and to do music, but I wanted to do chemical engineering.</i>
Complicating action (CA)	<i>So a lot of it was based on if I could do music</i>
Evaluation (EV)	<i>and then if it would work out, then I probably would have.</i>
Resolution (RE)	<i>But it would have increased my length of school,</i>
Coda	<i>so it wasn't worth it to me for that reason.</i>

(Taken from Samuel's Interview)