How do you know what they know? How do you show what they know?

Frederick Burrack

How to cite this presentation

If you make reference to this version, use the following information:


Citation of Unpublished Symposium

Citation: Burrack, F. (2006, June). How do you know what they know? How do you show what they know? Paper presented at the 18th Kansas State University Music Symposium, Manhattan, KS.

This item was retrieved from the K-State Research Exchange (K-REx), the institutional repository of Kansas State University. K-REx is available at http://krex.ksu.edu
How do you know what they know?
How do you show what they know?

Dr. Frederick Burrack

It is my pleasure to share some music making with you. To tie into the topic of this session, consider that the performance you just heard was one of your high school students. Does this performance demonstrate musical knowledge, understanding, and aesthetic sensitivity? In my 25 years of music teaching, it has been my observation that America's music programs have demonstrate outstanding student development of performance skills through presenting a variety of performance experiences. This statement may or may not accurately reflect the general music component of a school music program, but if it sufficiently prepares students for continuing in music beyond the general classes, it certainly is a part of it.

Instruction in a typical music class often focuses the learning objectives on performance skill development and subjectively assessed by the instructor. Involvement in the making of music through some level of performance is, and must remain an important element in music education. But does performance quality reflect musical knowledge and understanding?
I want to share with you in this short time remaining a project that the music faculty, grades K-12 incorporated in the school where I taught high school band.

Let me give you a bit of background. Prompted by a school-wide curriculum project to develop assessments for every discipline, the faculty at our school wanted to develop a system of assessment that could be implemented across grade levels and would address more than playing proficiency and attendance.

What developed were music portfolios that included a variety of assessments. What is a music portfolio?

It is a collection of work, done by students, the exhibits evidence of efforts, progress, and achievements in the music program.

Portfolios are a way to asses student learning that is quite different from traditional methods. They provide you, and the students, the opportunity to observe learning in a broader context of musical analysis, problem solving, listening skills and aesthetic sensitivity.
Music Portfolios

- Technical proficiency (kinesthetic)
- Error detection skills (critical listening)
- Problem solving skills (analytical)
- Musical understanding (interpretive)
- Knowledge acquisition (cognitive)
- Musical sensitivity (aesthetic)

Included in music portfolios are assessments that address:

- Technical Proficiency,
- Error detection skills,
- Problem solving skills,
- Musical understanding,
- Knowledge acquisition, and
- Musical sensitivity.

These sound like a lot of big words but you can see that these cover most of the learning that we expect for any level of musicianship but often are assumed through quality performance and seldom documented.

Let's begin with specific examples from music portfolios from my school's and other programs around the Mid-west.
In elementary school we would maintain a folder with examples of student work that demonstrate aspects of their learning in areas of content knowledge, critical listening skills, and aesthetic responsiveness. In this example, students in third grade were asked to assess their performance. Of course the teacher had emphasized the importance of watching as exemplified in the first statement. The second supports the development of listening skills as well as analysis of ensemble cohesion during performance.
Following a lesson on Beethoven and watching the video of Beethoven lives Upstairs, students were asked to move beyond knowledge about Beethoven and his music to developing a relationship with the music and the man. The first response describes a student’s perception of the man, Beethoven. The remainder guides students to consider the meaning of music in their lives.
People always are skeptical about teaching and assessing aesthetic sensitivity. If that truly is our primary goal as a field of music education, then we must demonstrate this foundation through intentional instructional tasks and assessments. The easy question gets right to this purpose.

If you hadn’t asked the students to think about how the music makes them feel, they most likely may not recognize this response and the most profound learning opportunity is lost.
As discussed earlier, we can not allow another generation to move through music education in our schools without focusing their understanding on the importance of music in their lives. For those who have a natural propensity to music, which is the traditional focus of music education, may probably recognize the importance of music in their lives. But to tell the truth, we are not even sure of this unless it is brought to the students’ consideration through education.
How does music relate to your students?

1. WHAT DID YOU THINK OF "THE NUTCRACKER"?
   I thought it was very good, my heart was always pounding because of Tchaikovsky's brilliant play.

2. WHAT DID YOU LEARN ABOUT TCHAIKOVSKY?
   That he died suddenly.

Not only do the students often ignore the feelingful part of music but we can not know how and to what extent our students are being moved by the music that we teach in class. Of course that is unless we ask them. Through this type of questioning and portfolio documentation, we as music teachers can monitor progress of aesthetic sensitivity over the many years that we teach these students.
Even as far as understanding the content knowledge, we often assume just because they can answer a question on a test or can sing pitches accurately, that they understand what they are doing and why. Unless we find ways to expose what is in their minds, we will always be assuming. In reality, it doesn’t matter what we know, what we teach, or what they can do, if the students themselves don’t perceive these things.
Of course student projects such as this 4th grade composition are outstanding examples of understanding and application of music knowledge. (explain the composition project)
Proficiency Achievement

✧ Technical proficiency
✧ Ability to listen, analyze, and resolve music challenges.

The most obvious example is that of student achievement.
• One of the most important aspects in music programs is individual proficiency. But beyond technical skills, we have a desire to develop independent musicians.
• The ability to listen, analyze, and appropriately resolve musical challenges on their own. Portfolios can provide the means to document progress over time in the area of proficiency achievement.

• (Describe Voice Prints)
When I was teaching high school, I knew it was important to hear each individual and provide feedback, but it was even more important that they learn to hear, identify, and resolve musical and proficiency challenges. Otherwise they always look to me as the teacher to answer the questions. What developed was a process where the students assessed their own performance. It went as follows:

1. I would assign specific scales, etudes, and sections from their pieces.

2. The student would rehearse and record the required assignment. They were allowed to re-record the assignment as many times as they would like until they feel the recording is their best.

3. Once they have completed the highest quality recording possible, then they listen and assess their performance on a form similar to the one on the projection.
   a) Must address each element
   b) State specific problem (place and description), how to fix, and goals for improvement.

4. Then they hand in the recording (cassette tape or CD) and I would listen, provide feedback, and assign a grade.

Compare this type of playing assessment to having students play individually for you in your office. This will eliminate the fear of a one-time performance for grade, encourages practice that may not have occurred because of re-recording, develops listening skills and analytical skills often left to the teacher. You may also notice that the students are experiencing what a judge would do at a solo contest helping them understand this process.
To unify an expectation for students across grade levels to develop listening, analytical, and problems solving skills, we would begin this self-assessment students’ first year in band. The students’ first experiences with self-assessment were initiated as group processes and gradually moved into individual self-assessments. In 5th grade and in 6th grade, students would record and self-assess once during each year. In middle school this expectations would be expanded to twice a year and once each quarter in high school.

Students would start by responding, Good, or It sounded bad. Feedback would encourage them to listen for and identify specific improvements needs. I found that students became very detailed in the observations and very proficient in identifying problems.

Maintained on the cassette or CD, the students have a recording of their proficiency every year of their development. You can see the students’ development of listening and analytical skills. The intended audience for the portfolio is the student although the parent and teacher gain much knowledge of student achievement. I have used these assessments to show students and parents the progress that their students are (or are not) making.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Tools for Powerful Student Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Susan Farrell</td>
<td>Meredith Pub.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Individual Performance Self-Assessment: Instrumental

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance Element</th>
<th>Specifics</th>
<th>Connections</th>
<th>Practice Plans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pitch Production and Intonation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tempo/Rhythm (steadiness, flexibility, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articulation (control, special effects, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technique &amp; Posture (hand position, fingerings, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynamics (control, special effects, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Musicianship (expressive nuance in performance, sense of phrasing, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rubric for Student Observation

IDENTIFICATION OF SPECIFIC REFERENCES TO MUSICAL ELEMENTS WHILE MAKING CRITICAL COMMENTS AND/OR SUGGESTED REVISIONS THROUGHOUT THE CRITIQUE.

4. SPECIFIC AND ACCURATE REFERENCES TO MUSICAL ELEMENTS IN THE PERFORMANCE SPECIFICALLY LINKED WITH THE SCORE (e.g., “the slurs are missing in the second phrase”; “I forgot to give the half notes two beats in the first bar of the coda”)

3. REFERS TO SEVERAL MUSICAL ELEMENTS WITH INCREASED SPECIFICITY AND APPROPRIATENESS NOT LINKED WITH THE SCORE (e.g., “the accents were too long for the style”; “I’m not in the key of G”)

2. REFERS TO ISOLATED MUSICAL ELEMENTS AND/OR MAKES OVERLY BROAD, SOMETIMES INACCURATE OR INAPPROPRIATE REFERENCES TO THE PERFORMANCE (e.g., “there were wrong notes”; “rhythm was sloppy”)

1. DOES NOT REFER TO MUSICAL ELEMENTS IN PERFORMANCE (e.g., “bad”; “great”; “much better”)

NR - no response
Rubric for Revisions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ability to Suggest Revisions or Practice Plans for Improving Performances</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4- Highly articulated revisions are suggested and increasingly linked with specific critical comments (e.g., “I should practice the rhythm and articulation so that the counting is corrected in measure 3”; “I should bring the downbeats more so that it doesn’t rush at the end”)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3- Increasingly specific revisions are suggested but not necessarily coordinated with critical comments (“I should change my fingering”; “I should tap my feet while playing”; “Play the scale before I start”)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2- Offers broad, superficial, or unconstructive suggestions (e.g., “play more in tune”; “find the bad spots and practice them”; “don’t play sloppy”)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1- No attempt to suggest revisions or how to improve the performance (e.g., “practice”; “pay attention”)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NR - no response</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In addition to pitch & rhythm, it provides categories for articulation, dynamics, phrasing, and expression.
Rubric for Proficiency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>MELODY ACCURACY</th>
<th>PITCH</th>
<th>RHYTHMIC ACCURACY</th>
<th>TIMBRE QUALITY</th>
<th>ARTICULATION (Style/Delivery)</th>
<th>EXPRESSION (Musically)</th>
<th>OTHER (Physical, emotional, etc.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Notes accurately performed throughout.</td>
<td>Perfect pitch and intonation are accurate throughout.</td>
<td>Rhythmically accurate and secure.</td>
<td>Timbre, tone, and musical texture are consistent.</td>
<td>Intonation is accurate and consistent throughout.</td>
<td>All aspects of musical performance are accurately executed and appropriate for the genre being performed.</td>
<td>All aspects of musical performance are accurately executed and appropriate for the genre being performed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Two or more errors in rhythm and intonation.</td>
<td>Nearly accurate pitch and intonation.</td>
<td>Occasionally inaccurate rhythm and meter.</td>
<td>Occasionally inaccurate and inconsistent.</td>
<td>Focused tone production.</td>
<td>Most aspects of musical performance are accurately executed and appropriate for the genre being performed.</td>
<td>Most aspects of musical performance are accurately executed and appropriate for the genre being performed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Minor errors in rhythm and intonation.</td>
<td>Inconsistent rhythm and meter.</td>
<td>Occasionally inaccurate intonation.</td>
<td>Inconsistent rhythm and meter.</td>
<td>Adequate tone production.</td>
<td>Most aspects of musical performance are accurately executed and appropriate for the genre being performed.</td>
<td>Most aspects of musical performance are accurately executed and appropriate for the genre being performed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Significant errors in rhythm and intonation.</td>
<td>Infrequent pitch or intonation errors.</td>
<td>Occasionally inaccurate rhythm and meter.</td>
<td>Occasionally inaccurate intonation.</td>
<td>Adequate tone production.</td>
<td>Most aspects of musical performance are accurately executed and appropriate for the genre being performed.</td>
<td>Most aspects of musical performance are accurately executed and appropriate for the genre being performed.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

You could use this rubric from Baker University, which you wind on the Kansas Model Curriculum found on the Kansas Department of Education web-site.
Or you could make your own, as you will see in the example from Maine South High School in Illinois.
Another way you can document musical learning while improving student performance in your band is to take the self-assessment strategy and apply it to students’ assessing the entire ensemble’ progress.

Instead of having your students simply listen to the recording of a concert, using a typical large-group ballot, you could have each student assess the performance quality of the ensemble. This can help students develop evaluation skills learn to set progress goals beyond concert performance. After several experiences I came to realize that this process could be useful before the concert.

In my band I would record the concert two weeks ahead of time and have the students set goals. Then the final two weeks of rehearsal would be totally focused on the student goals.

The students eventually became so proficiency in listening that during rehearsals when I would stop, students’ hands would go up to share what they were hearing. Ownership of ensemble quality was a direct response of this assessment. Each large group assessment would be kept in a student’s portfolio.
The more experience the students had with self-assessment, the more they learned to focus beyond technical accuracy. If your goal is to develop musicians who perform beyond accuracy into the realm of music, then we must find ways to guide this type of thinking.
Another way you can document progress in student understanding, listening and analytical skills, and encourage advanced comprehension is with rehearsal comparison. You know those promo recordings and professional recordings of the pieces? A great use is to enhance students’ comprehension of proficiency needs.

I recall when the students were having difficulties improving particular transitions or challenging sequences in pieces. It seemed that no matter what I said or did, the students still had problems. Then I remembered this technique from the Arts PROPEL project out of the Pittsburgh Pennsylvania schools. I played the 8 measure segment from the promotional recording and asked the students to listen particularly to rhythm and balance. They noted on the comparison form their observations. Then played the same segment from a former rehearsal. They noted their observations from this segment as well as the comparisons.

To link this to rehearsal improvements, students volunteered to share their observations and we rehearsed their suggestions. After this one assessment strategy, the problem was remarkably corrected. The reason being that the students were now aware of the problem and the goal. Students can not make improvements until they recognize the problem. It doesn’t matter what we recognize if the students don’t.
Student Led Sectionals

Name of leader _______________ Date ______

Goals for sectional:

Overall accomplishments of this sectional:

Problems to be worked on in future sectionals:

Another way you can encourage ownership of the program and develop leadership skills is by placing student in charge of small group rehearsals. Providing students a format describing leadership expectation helps student learn leadership skills as well a document their leadership experiences. Using the above format, you could set the goals for the sectional. The leader would document the progress and the improvements not yet accomplished. I would usually select a different person each time (if they were ready for the leadership role) to help them develop leadership skills.
Goal Setting

Set three achievable goals that you would like to accomplish this year in band.

1.
2.
3.

To assist students in developing personal goals, have the students set three goals that they could set and work to achieve over the year.

Mid-year have the students monitor progress toward achievement and set strategies to reach the goals by the end of the year.

Then have students evaluate the level of achievement at the end of the year and set goals for the future.
A portfolio is a great place to document student achievement on periodic exams of musical terminology, rhythmic understanding, historical information, and other aspects that you are teaching in the band class. When students complete exams in your class, students should store their exam in the portfolio.

How can these things fit into a grading system?
How to include in grading

25% - Lesson Grade Graded on 7 lessons in a nine-week period.
10% - Ensemble Playing (graded during the band class period)
15% - Technical Proficiency of the selected sections.
10% - Self-assessment of the tape recorded excerpts.
10% - Performance Critique Graded on completeness, use of appropriate musical terminology, and observable analytical skills.
10% - Service - concerts / pep bands scheduled during the quarter.
20% - Projects - selected from solo, jazz band, perform in community, chamber ensemble, student conducting, research paper, write program notes, write letter to composer, peer teaching.

How do you maintain a portfolio?
How to maintain a portfolio?

- Students should maintain a portfolio - not the teacher
  - Select a filing cabinet
  - Place an enveloping folder for each student
  - Students add required components
  - Add concert programs
  - Add newspaper articles, pictures, misc.

Looking back on some of the assessment components that have been shared this morning, all of the work is the students’ (except for your assessment of individual performance on the recording & self-assessment - but this occurs only once a quarter which is very workable for any size band) I had students drop their cassette tape and self-assessment into a box when they complete it. I would provide my feedback, grade them and return my assessment back to the student. It was their responsibility to put it into the portfolio.

The same responsibility pertained to all other additions. When it came to adding concert programs to each portfolio, I had a student who came to the band room during a study hall drop one program in each folder. If there was a picture in the newspaper, I would make a copy for each student in the picture and have those dropped into the appropriate folder as well.
The Final Product

- Keep each year organized with title page per year
- Create a cover
- Add envelop for recordings
- Have all contents bound
- Give as gift upon graduation

(describe procedure and show final product)
What do portfolios accomplish?

- Students develop deeper musical understanding.
- Provide incentive to enhance listening skills.
- Contributes to informed musical decisions.

Through self-assessments and progress portfolios,
- students develop a deeper musical understanding than is often achieved without such a process.
- As a motivating tool, the act of self-assessment provides an incentive to enhance critical listening skills provided by the focus of the assessments.
- Categories in the assessments provide direction in student listening contributing to informed musical decisions by helping students focus on the concepts around which the music had been created and will be performed.

Portfolios have the potential to reveal the educational progress of individual learners. They can be a powerful tool for encouraging students to take charge of their own learning. Portfolios allow students to assume ownership in ways that few other instructional approaches allow.
Authentic Assessment

- Helps a child move closer to reaching their full potential
- Develops responsibility of ownership of their education
- Enables reflection of achievement
- Develops accountability to personal goals
- Documents developmental skills
Charles Fowler (1970)

Discovery is the act of obtaining knowledge for oneself by the use of one’s own mind. Our students will no longer just be listeners, confined to rote accumulation, memorization and regurgitation. Instead we will invite students to conquer their own ignorance and win their own possession of knowledge.